

## PAPER DETAILS

TITLE: Ma(r)king the Difference: Multiculturalism and the Politics of Translation

AUTHORS: Özlem GÜLEN

PAGES: 197-199

ORIGINAL PDF URL: <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article-file/3365227>



**MANCHENO, TANIA. (2023). MA(R)KING THE DIFFERENCE:  
MULTICULTURALISM AND THE POLITICS OF TRANSLATION. SPRINGER  
FACHMEDIEN WIESBADEN, (pp. 240) ISBN978-3-658-40923-4.**

**Book review**

**DOI:** 10.59886/tsbder.1350598

Dr. Tania Mancheno is a lecturer at the University of Hamburg, where she earned her Ph.D. in 2019 with her dissertation on multiculturalism and translation. She has conducted important research in a number of disciplines, including politics, cultural studies, gender, and anthropology, in 2023, she published *Ma(r)king the Difference: Multiculturalism and the Politics of Translation* based on her dissertation, which will be discussed in this review. The book, one of the most current to emphasize the sociopolitical relationship between multiculturalism and translation, revives a long-standing academic research issue. Based on past research, the book has an elaborate theoretical framework that is supported by both the specific case studies carefully chosen from history and research inferences concerning contemporary realities.

The book focuses on translation practices that have been recognized as an effective tool in the construction of building nations, identities, and cultures. Language policy, and hence, translation methods have always had a significant influence as implied. As a result of ever-increasing globalization, migration flows, and the establishment of linguistic rights, these policy concerns remain high on the agendas of many governments today. In this regard, the book offers topical research that considers both the historical context and the current political and social atmosphere. Moreover, it is significant that the research topics were chosen from two European countries, Spain and Germany, each of which present distinctive historical instances to explore in terms of nationalism and translation politics. While focusing on European countries' historical experiences to challenge the spread and consequences of nationalist ideology on translation practices, the book also interprets modernist multicultural approaches to translation practices with some allusions to non-European geographies.

The author compares 'the politics of translation' for the representation and acknowledgement of indigenous people, ethnic groups, and minorities in former nation-states and modern multicultural governments, with a special focus on cultural distinctions. This approach, motivated by the theoretical literature on nationalism and transnationalism and benefits from an interdisciplinary perspective, illustrates the intricate relationship between translation processes and nationalism. Despite the richness of the information offered in each chapter, the book's intricate organization allows readers to not only follow this multidisciplinary theoretical framework but also comprehend the interpretation of the study's primary instances in relation to the given framework.

The book opens with an extended introduction that outlines the context for the research. This chapter gives readers an overview of the concept of multiculturalism, the nature of translation methods, and the politics surrounding them. This chapter briefly explains the theoretical techniques used in the study and includes references to each theorist in this regard to highlight their genuine ideas and notions. Since the study provides extensive treatment of the theoretical backdrop, the introduction clearly outlines the research to assist the reader to fully appreciate the connections between the chapters.

The second chapter, "Translation and Culture-in Five Currents of Thought," follows the

“Introduction,” and provides a comprehensive literature review on the intersectionality of translation studies and cultural studies. Without losing sight of its central focus on translation and culture, the chapter advances its arguments in accordance with the ideas of ‘postcolonial’ and ‘decolonial’ studies, by embracing a perspective of indigenous and/or minority groups, as well as nation-states, in approaching the fidelity question in translation studies. This perspective leads to the final notion presented in this chapter, which is ‘critical translation studies. While extensively referring to power relations in translation practices ranging from nationalism and multiculturalism to bio-politics and gender, it is remarkable that cultural differences are given a place in the theoretical framework at the outset, which both strengthens the translational approach to these differences from a historical perspective and allows the reader to interpret the cases from the history in the following chapters.

The third chapter, “Translation as Method,” expands on the theoretical framework presented in the previous chapter. In addition to the current debates concerning fidelity, this chapter focuses on un/translatability, particularly as it relates to minorities. The chapter revisits past ideas in translation studies while also addressing the migration issue that has dominated international politics in recent years, strengthening the links between the study and present politics. The chapter primarily focuses on the views of Reinhart Koselleck, Walter Benjamin, and Frantz Fanon to present ideas about how immigrant and minority communities are portrayed, as well as the role of translation processes in this context. This topic of conflict from the past to the present is clarified in depth by referring to significant concepts such as identity politics, nationalist policies, and linguistic racism.

The fourth chapter, “Translation and the Question of Minorities,” and the fifth chapter, “Translation: Moral Imperative or Colonial Question?” seek to depict power dynamics between distinct groups in two different contexts: nation-states and colonial settings. Because of their comprehensive covering national and colonial socio-politics in a general these two chapters serve as the basis for each instance addressed in the study. These chapters present the problem between nationalism and human ethics through linguistic and translational techniques, emphasizing the recognition battle faced by minorities in nation-states and indigenous people in colonial environments. Even though the cases to which these theoretical and conceptual frameworks will be applied are from the past experiences, the ideas and methods discussed in the study are still viable for understanding the current political environment because discussions of minority rights as a component of human rights are becoming more important by the day.

Ms. Mancheno, begins by putting forth a general theoretical framework before delving into the study's two key cases in depth. One of these examples is discussed in the sixth chapter, “Translation in the Valladolid Debate,” which provides a thorough overview of the Indians living under the Spanish colonial empire during the 16<sup>th</sup> century. The case, considered essential for the advancement of human rights, demonstrates the power discrepancies between Europeanness and indigenous people’s local identities, prompting the examination of two independent ideas from cultural studies: ‘toleration’ and ‘cannibalism’. Consequently, the Valladolid Debate represents a clash between nationalism and cultural differences, which is evaluated in light of translation processes within the context of the research. The author, in this manner, clearly demonstrates the conflict between cultural imperialism and the desire for recognition, in this case, through translation practices.

The seventh chapter, “Translation and the Jewish Question,” discusses the other case study. The author evaluates the historical situation of Jewish culture and religion in Germany in the 19<sup>th</sup> century, providing substantial clarity on the socio-political conditions towards Jewish people from a theoretical and historical standpoint. Given the references to anti-Semitism in Europe and translation procedures significantly affected by nationalist ideology, this chapter is of critical for demonstrating the close ties between ideologies and translation practices. The example effectively

shows the use of translation methods as a weapon for nation-building, which instantly opens the discussion on minorities' "citizenship." Aside from using a nation-state as a case study to compare national and colonial politics, the study broadens its scope and horizons to assess the influence of nationalism on a larger scale in terms of translation processes.

The two main case studies are followed in the eighth chapter "Translating Multiculturalism" by a modern and transnational perspective. The author defines multiculturalism using the ideas of prominent theorists and advocates for translation techniques in multicultural states. Canada is given as an example in the chapter due to its multiculturalist stance and translation policies. In this direction, the author suggests an alternative strategy that combines national politics with global approaches toward translation practices. As she draws attention to disputes among migrants, refugees, indigenous peoples, and minorities based on their national, linguistic, and/or religious identities, the author touches on critical issues in today's world by drawing on similar past experiences discussed in previous chapters. Ms. Mancheno, in this chapter assumes a multidimensional perspective, gathering both previous and current experiences.

Ms. Mancheno, with her book, contributes significantly to the literature on translation and its interconnections with multiculturalism and nationalism, by concluding the study with the historical background of multiculturalism and final remarks on the relationship between translation and multiculturalism. Despite the fact that multiculturalism is a popular concept deeply investigated by many translation scholars, there are still study gaps, particularly in the field of nationalist ideology and translation. In this perspective, this book can pave the way for future research in a variety of topics, most notably translation history, ideology, and politics. Although the book focuses mostly on European experiences pertaining to nationalism in translation, the case studies might be expanded by incorporating diverse national contexts.

Özlem Gülen

Ph.D. Candidate, Istanbul University, Department of Translation Studies /  
Research Assistant, Haliç University, Department of English Translation and Interpreting