

PAPER DETAILS

TITLE: Intellectual Figures in Post-Tanzimat Social Change: The Example of Ahmet Cevdet Pasha and His Granddaughter Sister Zubeyde Ismet

AUTHORS: B rhan Mustafa B y karslan

PAGES: 78-104

ORIGINAL PDF URL: <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article-file/4298534>

Eskişehir Osmangazi Üniversitesi Tarih Dergisi
Eskisehir Osmangazi University History Journal
e-ISSN: 2687-3842 <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/esogutd>, 7/2, Kasım 2024
DOI: 10.47437/esogutd.1569787

Araştırma Makalesi

Intellectual Figures in Post-Tanzimat Social Change: The Example of Ahmet Cevdet Pasha and His Granddaughter Sister Zubeyde İsmet

Bürhan Mustafa Büyükarlan*

Abstract

The Tanzimat Period refers to the era spanning from the proclamation of the Gülhane Hatt-ı Hümayun on November 3, 1839, to 1876. Initiated in 1839 under the leadership of Reshid Pasha, the Tanzimat Period concluded in 1876 with the transition to a constitutional regime led by Midhat Pasha. Etymologically, Tanzimat denotes a comprehensive restructuring and transformation of the Ottoman administrative, political, social, and economic life. Ahmed Cevdet Pasha, a prominent figure of the 19th-century Ottoman Empire, made substantial contributions to the realms of administration, politics, culture, and scholarship. This study aims to examine Ahmed Cevdet Pasha, his family life, and the transformation of his granddaughter, Sister Zubeyde İsmet, within the context of the modernization process influenced by the Tanzimat period. The research employs a qualitative research method, specifically document analysis. The Ottoman Empire, having fallen behind the West in numerous areas, particularly in the military, sought to emulate the West, perceived as more advanced. This emulation extended beyond the military realm. With the Tanzimat reforms, Ottoman elites, including statesmen and intellectuals, sent their children to Western missionary schools. These Ottoman offspring were culturally assimilated and indoctrinated to serve the interests of Western Christianization. Consequently, this process of emulation evolved into cultural imperialism. As a result of this cultural imperialism, the granddaughter of Ahmet Cevdet Pasha converted to Christianity and became a nun. Zubeyde İsmet's transformation highlights the significance of the education system; regardless of an individual's adherence to their own religion, culture, and family, the educational system of the state and society in which they live will determine the fate of their generation.

Keywords: *Tanzimat Reforms, Ahmet Cevdet Pasha, Fatma Aliye, Sister Zubeyde İsmet, Cultural Imperialism.*

* PhD Student, Istanbul Sabahattin Zaim University, Department of History and Civilisation Studies, buyukarslan.burhan@std.izu.edu.tr, ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3500-2594>

Tanzimat Sonrası Toplumsal Değişimde Aydın Figürleri: Ahmet Cevdet Paşa ve Torunu Rahibe Zübeyde İsmet Örneği

Öz

Tanzimat Dönemi; 3 Kasım 1839 senesinde Gülhane Hatt-ı Hümayunu'nun ilanından 1876 senesine kadar olan dönemin adıdır. 1839 senesinden Reşit Paşa'nın öncülüğünde başlayan Tanzimat Dönemi, 1876 senesinde Mithat Paşa'nın öncülüğünde gerçekleştirilen anayasal rejime geçişle sona ermiştir. Terim olarak Tanzimat, Türk idarî, siyasî, sosyal ve iktisadî hayatında bütüncül bir yeniden yapılanmayı ve değişmeyi ifade etmektedir. Ahmet Cevdet Paşa, XIX. asrın Osmanlı Devleti'nin idarî, siyasî, kültürel ve ilmî hayatında etkili olmuş bir devlet adamı olmakla birlikte ilmî veçhesiyle de ön planda olan bir şahsiyettir. Bu çalışmanın amacı Tanzimat'ın etkisi ile modern toplum oluşum sürecinde Ahmet Cevdet Paşa'yı, aile hayatını ve torunu Rahibe Zübeyde İsmet'in değişim ve dönüşüm sürecini incelemektir. Araştırma, nitel araştırma yöntemlerinden doküman inceleme şeklinde yapılmıştır. Osmanlı askerî saha başta olmak üzere Batı'ya göre birçok alanda gerilemiş, bu sebeple ilerleme kaydettiği düşünülen Batı'yı örnek almak istemiştir. Bu örnek alma durumu askerî sahada kalmamış, Tanzimat ile beraber açılan Batılı misyoner okullara, devlet ricâli başta olmak üzere entelektüeller evlatlarını göndermiştir. Bu okullara gönderilen Osmanlı'nın öz evlatları mankurtlaştırılmış, Batı'nın Hristiyanlaştırma ve uydusu olma görevinde çalıştırılmıştır. Böylece bu örnek alma durumu kültür emperyalizmine dönüşmüştür. Kültür emperyalizminin bir sonucu olarak Ahmet Cevdet Paşa'nın torunu din değiştirerek Rahibe olmuştur. Zübeyde İsmet'in bu değişimi, eğitim sisteminin önemini göstermektedir; kişi, her ne kadar kendi dinine, kültürüne ve ailesine sahip çıkarsa çıksın içinde bulunduğu devletin ve toplumun eğitim sistemi, neslinin kaderini belirleyecektir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: *Tanzimat, Ahmet Cevdet Paşa, Fatma Aliye, Rahibe Zübeyde İsmet, Kültür Emperyalizmi.*

Introduction

The Tanzimat Period refers to the era spanning from the proclamation of the Gülhane Hatt-ı Hümayun on November 3, 1839, to the year 1876.¹ Commencing in 1839 under the leadership of Mustafa Reshid Pasha, the Tanzimat Period concluded in 1876 with the transition to a constitutional regime spearheaded by Midhat Pasha. The term Tanzimat itself encapsulates a comprehensive process of reorganization and transformation across the Turkish administrative, political, social, and economic spheres. Etymologically, Tanzimat signifies 'regulation', 'arrangement', 'organization', and 'reorganization'.² The

¹ Some scholars argue that the origins of the Tanzimat period can be traced back to the reigns of Mahmud II and Selim III see Enver Ziya Karal. *Tanzimat'tan Evvel Garplılaşma Hareketleri, Tanzimat I.* (İstanbul: Maarif Matbaası, 1940), p.13-14. However, some scholars argue that the period should be limited to the Second Constitutional Era (1908) see Ziyaeddin Fahri Fındıkoğlu, *Tanzimat'ta İctimaî Hayat, Tanzimat I.*, (İstanbul: Maarif Matbaası, 1940), p.1.

² Bilal Eryılmaz, *Tanzimat ve Yönetimde Modernleşme*, (İstanbul: İşaret Yayınları, 1992), p.91-92.

Gülhane Hatt-ı Hümayun, promulgated by Sultan Abdulmecid I (1839-1861), marked a significant departure from previous imperial decrees, serving as a catalyst for transformative changes in the Ottoman Empire's governance and society. It laid the groundwork for subsequent reforms. While the Gülhane Edict, at first glance, appeared to align with the Ottoman Empire's established traditions - as every sultan for the past three centuries had pledged just governance to their subjects through edicts known as "adâletname" - the Tanzimat Decree introduced several novel principles that would fundamentally reshape the state's administration.³ The cultural transfer engendered by the Ottoman Tanzimat Movement is equally significant to its political transfer.⁴ The primary objective of this study is to examine the life of Ahmet Cevdet Pasha, his family, and the transformation of his granddaughter, Sister Zubeyde İsmet, within the context of the formation of a modern society under the influence of the Tanzimat reforms. This research employed document analysis, a qualitative research method. Demiryürek mentioned İsmet in his study on Cezmi. However, there is no detached study in the field that analyses Ahmet Cevdet Pasha, his family life, the transformative effect of the Tanzimat and the process of change of İsmet and the changing family structure after the Tanzimat. It is thought that this study will fill a gap in the academic field.

80

The Historical Context and Factors Contributing to the Issuance of the Tanzimat Edict

The discovery of the Cape of Good Hope and subsequent European colonial policies led to a concentration of capital in Europe. Anatolia, as a result, lost its function as a commercial bridge between the East and the West, transforming the Ottoman Empire into a cheap market and plunging it into economic crises.⁵ The decline of traditional trade routes in Anatolia led to a decrease in economic activity and an increase in unemployment rates in the region. The Industrial Revolution in Europe, which spurred a rapid increase in demand for raw materials, prompted European merchants to seek new markets. Ottoman territories became an attractive source of raw materials for European traders due to the high purchasing power of European currencies in the Ottoman Empire. This situation made the Ottoman economy heavily dependent on foreign markets, deepening the imbalance between the import of industrial goods and the export of raw materials. The Ottoman State faced economic difficulties and various crises, forcing it to adopt restrictive and centralized

³ Halil İnalcık, "Sened 1 İttifak ve Gülhane Hatt-ı Hümayunu" *Belleten*, Vol. 28, No. 112 (1964): p.611.

⁴ Muhammed Harb, *el-Musakkafün ve's-Sulta, Turkiya Nemûzecen*, (Kahire: Dâru'l-Beşir, 2017), p.35-36.

⁵ İsmail Cem, *Türkiye'de Geri Kalmışlığın Tarihi*, (İstanbul: Cem Yayınları, 1997), p.103-108.

economic policies.⁶ As the Ottoman Empire began to experience economic decline in the 19th century, it introduced various restrictions on foreign traders and strengthened its monopoly system in an attempt to protect domestic production. However, these protectionist policies, particularly at odds with the free trade principles of rising industrial powers like Britain, led to international tensions. Britain, taking advantage of the Ottoman Empire's weakness, exerted economic and political pressure, forcing it to sign trade agreements that served British interests. Trade agreements were signed with Britain and France in 1838, and with Spain and the Netherlands in 1840, further limiting the state's economic independence. Foreign traders gained privileges, increasing their influence over the Ottoman economy.⁷ As a result of these treaties with Britain, European powers began to interfere in Ottoman domestic affairs, politically, socially, and economically. Foreign influence in the state's governance increased, and the path was paved for the Ottoman Empire to borrow money from Europe. The Gülhane Hatt-ı Hümayun (1839), a direct consequence of the 1838 treaty, laid the groundwork for the 1856 Ottoman Reform Edict. These two edicts officially transformed the Ottoman identity. In other words, the Ottoman Empire became globalized, and the West exerted full pressure on the state. The Ottoman Tanzimat Reforms, with the issuance of these two edicts in 1839 and 1856, respectively, were officially based on guaranteeing the operation of European and British capital, the property of Europeans within the Ottoman state, and their security. This development paved the way for a dual culture, allowing Western culture to establish itself in the heart of Islamic culture in Istanbul.⁸ In the second quarter of the 19th century, the Ottoman Empire, faced with both internal and external challenges, felt the need to adopt European models in various fields as a means of overcoming its difficulties.⁹ Among the primary reasons for the issuance of the Tanzimat Edict were the increasing interventions of European powers, particularly due to the Egyptian crisis, and the pressures exerted by Russia on the Ottoman Empire under the pretext of protecting its Orthodox subjects. The desire of Western powers both to ensure the survival of the Ottoman Empire and to guarantee equality for Christian subjects compelled the Ottomans to undertake fundamental reforms, leading to the

⁶ Cem, *Türkiye'de Geri Kalmışlığın Tarihi*, p.161-164.

⁷ Cem, *Türkiye'de Geri Kalmışlığın Tarihi*, p.239-241.

⁸ Cem, *Türkiye'de Geri Kalmışlığın Tarihi*, p.257; For the full text of the Tanzimat Decree, see "Tanzimat Reforms", Turkish Grand National Assembly, Düstür, <https://acikerisim.tbmm.gov.tr/xmlui/handle/11543/67> [24.11.2022].

⁹ Eryılmaz, *Tanzimat ve Yönetimde Modernleşme*, p.93.

beginning of the Tanzimat Period in 1839.¹⁰ Mustafa Reshid Pasha, drawing on his experiences in Europe, believed that a reform program of the kind desired by Western powers was necessary for the Ottoman Empire. To this end, he sought and received foreign support, particularly from British Ambassador Lord Stratford Canning, during the drafting of the Tanzimat Edict.¹¹ Seeking to secure Western support amid the Egyptian crisis, the Ottoman Empire, under the leadership of Reshid Pasha, promulgated the Tanzimat Edict. The edict elicited diverse reactions from both Muslims and non-Muslims. While Muslims, particularly, were dissatisfied with the rights granted to non-Muslims, non-Muslims in the Balkans greeted the edict with great hope.¹² The Tanzimat Edict aimed to curtail the absolute power of the sultan and grant greater rights to the people. Rather than being a full-fledged constitution or law, it served as a promise to undertake reforms in this direction.¹³ The Tanzimat Edict is significant for its explicit pledge by the sultan to abide by its provisions and to take all necessary measures to address the state's fundamental problems. This edict marked a significant step towards restoring the state's order.¹⁴ With the Tanzimat Reforms, the Ottoman state underwent profound changes in its system of governance. The centralization of authority, which curtailed the privileges of local administrators, enabled the state to assert itself as the sole authority throughout its territories.¹⁵ The Tanzimat Edict aimed to guarantee the security of life, property, and honor for all subjects under the law. However, it provoked reactions among Muslims due to its provision of equality for non-Muslims. In reality, the edict served to consolidate the interests of the ruling class and facilitated the emergence of a new bureaucratic class. This new class, rather than serving the ruler, began to govern the state for its own benefit.¹⁶ The Tanzimat Edict aimed to reform various aspects of the state, including the tax system, with the objective of reorganizing the military following the abolishment of the Janissary Corps and putting an end to the arbitrary tax collection practices of the mültezims.¹⁷ The Tanzimat Edict left the

¹⁰ Muzaffer Sencer, "Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nda Tanzimat Sonrası Siyasal ve Yönetimsel Gelişmeler" *TODAİE Amme İdaresi Dergisi*, Vol. 17, No. 3 (1984): p.46-47.

¹¹ For more details, see Lord Statford Poole, *Lord Statford Canning'in Türkiye Anıları*, trans. Can Yücel, (Ankara: Yurt yayınları, 1988), p.89.

¹² Halil İnalçık, "Tanzimat'ın Uygulanması ve Sosyal Tepkiler", *Belleten*, Vol. 28, No. 12 (1964): p.623.

¹³ Niyazi Berkes, *Türkiye'de Çağdaşlaşma*, (İstanbul: Doğu Batı Yayınları, 1978), p.208.

¹⁴ Eryılmaz, *Tanzimat ve Yönetimde Modernleşme*, p.98; See also Hıfzı Veldet. *Kanunlaştırma Hareketleri ve Tanzimat*, *Tanzimat I*, (İstanbul: Maarif Matbaası, 1940), p.167, p.141.

¹⁵ Ersin Kalaycıoğlu and Ali Yaşar Sarıbay, "Tanzimat: Modernleşme Arayışı ve Siyasal Değişme", *Türk Siyasal Hayatının Gelişimi*, (İstanbul: Beta, 1986), p.15.

¹⁶ Şerif Mardin, *Türkiye'de Toplum ve Siyaset*, (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1990), p.238; See also Sencer, "Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nda Tanzimat Sonrası Siyasal ve Yönetimsel Gelişmeler", p.47.

¹⁷ Abdurrahman Şeref Efendi, *Tarih Musahabeleri*, (Ankara: Kültür ve Turizm Bakanlığı Yayınları, 1985), p.45-46.

Ottoman Empire more vulnerable to external threats, as Western powers exploited the resulting internal turmoil to increase their influence.¹⁸

The Impact of the Tanzimat Edict on Moral Reforms in the Ottoman Empire

Upon the accession of Abdulmecid, the son of Mahmud II, Westernization became the official state policy of the Ottoman Empire in social and cultural terms. In 1839, Abdülmecid issued a decree known as the Gülhane Hatt-i Hümayun, declaring that the Ottoman state would be reorganized according to its provisions. This decree laid the foundation for the Tanzimat reforms, which aimed to modernize the Ottoman state along European lines. The Tanzimat sparked intellectual debates among Ottoman elites, who disagreed over the extent to which European laws should be adopted. Some argued that Islamic law should remain supreme, while others contended that the European laws introduced by the Gülhane Hatt-i Hümayun had replaced the tenets of Islamic law.¹⁹ The Noble Edict of Gülhane was initially issued in Ottoman Turkish, but it was also accompanied by a French translation. French, having become the language of the Ottoman Empire's Westernization efforts, inevitably introduced French culture, ideas, and fashions to Ottoman intellectuals.²⁰ French served as a gradual instrument for the dissemination of Western sciences among Ottoman intellectuals. This development began with the sciences that were perceived to be of the most immediate practical benefit. The Ottomans sent students to French academies and institutes to acquire knowledge in these fields.²¹ This development encouraged Ottoman intellectuals to move away from traditional Islamic education and towards a European-style education and Western culture.²² While Arabic had previously served as the second language of the Ottoman elite, the adoption of French as the court language under the influence of the sultan and the Ottoman palace led to a shift in the intellectual orientation of the Ottoman elite from Persian to French literature.

¹⁸ Eryılmaz, *Tanzimat ve Yönetimde Modernleşme*, p.106.

¹⁹ Ziya Nur Aksun, *Osmanlı Tarihi*, (İstanbul: Ötüken Neşriyat, 1982), vol.3, p.247.

²⁰ The Edict of Gülhane can be seen as an imperfect and rudimentary attempt to replicate the 17-article Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen, which was declared in Paris in 1789, nearly half a century earlier. For a more detailed analysis, see Osman Nuri Ergin, *Türk Maarif Tarihi*, (İstanbul: Eser Matbaası, 1977), p.411.

²¹ The alliance forged between the Ottoman Empire, France, and Great Britain during the Crimean War (1854-1856) was instrumental in bringing about this circumstance. For a more in-depth analysis, refer to Aksun, *Osmanlı Tarihi*, vol.3, p.356-357.

²² The imperative for transformation was evident in the domains of literature, art, and intellectual discourse. Refer to Behçet Necatigil, *Edebiyatımızda İsimler Sözlüğü*, (İstanbul: Varlık Yayınları, 1978), p.21; Nihat Sami Banarlı, *Resimli Türk Edebiyatı Tarihi*, (İstanbul: Milli Eğitim Basımevi, 1971), vol.2, p.1069; Robert Manteran, *Târihu'd-Devleti'l-Osmaniyye*, trans. Beşir Sibâî. (Kahire: Dâru'l-Fikr, 1993), vol.2, p.465; Franz Babinger, *Osmanlı Tarihi Yazarları ve Eserleri*, trans. Coşkun Üçok. (Ankara: Kültür ve Turizm Bakanlığı, 1992), p.403-404.

Abdülmeccid's accession to the throne and the subsequent Tanzimat reforms solidified the Western orientation of the Ottoman upper class, including the intelligentsia. This Westernization was manifested in various aspects of life, from fashion and architecture to the adoption of Western concepts of property and liberty as exemplified by the Napoleonic Code. These developments fundamentally shaped the intellectual framework of the Ottoman elite, who subsequently sought to reform the Ottoman state along Western lines.²³ The first official newspaper in the Ottoman Empire, a landmark in the history of Ottoman thought, was published in 1831. William Churchill followed suit in 1840 with an unofficial publication. These early newspapers laid the foundation for the education of the Ottoman intelligentsia. Moreover, publications by Western-oriented exiles, whether exiled or self-exiled due to their opposition to state authority, were able to reach Istanbul and Anatolia.²⁴ Abdülaziz engaged in diplomatic activities in Europe, visiting France and meeting with Napoleon III. Unlike his predecessors who had traditionally remained within the Ottoman Empire, Abdülaziz's European tour marked a significant departure, signaling a strong orientation towards the West. These visits stimulated intellectual discourse and strengthened ties between Western intellectuals and their Ottoman counterparts who shared a common goal: the Westernization of the Ottoman Empire and the dominance of European thought over Ottoman destiny. Thus, Ottoman intellectuals secured European support for their reformist endeavors.²⁵ The Tanzimat reforms paved the way for the establishment of a new educational system that was fundamentally at odds with the traditional Ottoman madrasa system.²⁶ The inaugural high school education in the Ottoman Empire commenced in 1868 at Galatasaray, where instruction was exclusively in French. This institution swiftly evolved into an incubator for cultivating a new generation of intellectuals to serve the state. Subsequently, a proliferation of French-language schools and faculties, often managed by Catholic clergy, emerged. These institutions attracted students from both minority and Turkish communities. Fuad Pasha was the first Ottoman to send all eight of his children to Saint Joseph School in Kadıköy. This set a precedent, as other Ottoman families followed suit, enrolling their children in minority and foreign schools. At Saint Joseph, the percentage of Muslim students significantly increased from 15% in 1890 to 56% in 1911, 51% in 1926, 64% in 1931, and reached 76% in 1939, reflecting the growing popularity of

²³ Harb, *el-Musakkafün ve's-Sulta, Turkiya Nemûzecen*, p.32-33.

²⁴ Mehmet Emin Gerger, *Tanzimattan Avrupa Topluluğuna Türkiye*, (İstanbul: İnkılap Yayınları, 1989), p.138.

²⁵ Manteran, *Târihu'd-Devleti'l-Osmaniyye*, vol.2, p.466.

²⁶ Ergin, *Türk Maarif Tarihi*, p.425; Yaşar Sarıkaya, *Medreseler ve Modernleşme*, (İstanbul: İz Yayıncılık, 1997), p.68.

these institutions among the Ottoman elite.²⁷ In 1897, it was estimated that there were between 6,000 and 7,000 schools at various levels of education under the administration of non-Muslim Ottoman subjects, with approximately half a million students enrolled.²⁸ Many students who were educated in these non-Muslim schools according to their curricula graduated with ideas incompatible with Islamic and national values.²⁹ Consequently, a dual education system emerged: a traditional Ottoman education for Muslims, and a Western-style education offered in schools. Ottoman intellectuals flocked to these schools to educate their children.³⁰ The United States, in competition with European powers, actively sought to promote Western culture and institutions, including Christianity. As part of this endeavor, Robert College was established in 1863 with funding from Christopher Rhineland, a member of the Rothschild family. Rhineland continued to support the college until his death, bequeathing a fifth of his estate to the institution. To facilitate this endeavor, a board of trustees was formed in New York in 1864. Under the auspices of Robert College, the World Student Christian Federation organized special congresses to study the status of Christian education in the Islamic world and the development of Islamic universities. The college's governing board was composed of American and British consuls in Istanbul and prominent members of the Christian minority communities within the Ottoman Empire. The first president of the college was the missionary Hamlin.³¹ In the early 18th century, the defeats of the Ottoman Empire against the Western states led to the emergence of a group of people who thought that the state was regressing.³² The military defeats of the Ottoman Empire against the West and its regression compared to the West led the Ottoman Empire, which attributed the superiority of the West to its strong armies, to the path of Westernisation and caused it to carry out its first reforms in the military field.³³ When the Ottoman Empire could not succeed only with reforms in the military sphere, it tried to emulate the West in other institutions and thought structure. However,

²⁷ Ergin, *Türk Maarif Tarihi*, p.777.

²⁸ Bilal Eryılmaz, *Osmanlı Devleti'nde Millet Sistemi*, (İstanbul: Alternatif Üniversite, 1992), p.81.

²⁹ Hasan Gümüşoğlu, *Modernizm'in İnanç Hayatına Etkileri ve Jön Türklük*, (İstanbul: Kayıhan Yayınları, 2012), p.60.

³⁰ Harb, *el-Musakkafun ve's-Sulta, Turkiya Nemûzecen*, p.35.

³¹ Hüda Derviş, "Alâkatu Türkiye Bi'l-Yehûdî ve İsrail ve Eseruhâ Alâ'l-Bilâdi'l-Arabiyye (1648-1999)" (Yayınlanmamış Doktora Tezi. Zegazik Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, 2000), p.433-434.

³² Niyazi Usta, "Osmanlıda Siyaset Sosyolojisi Tarihçesine Kısa Bir Bakış", *Atatürk Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, No. 15 (2001): p.61.

³³ Ercüment Kuran, *Türkiye'nin Batılılaşma ve Milli Meseleleri*, (Ankara: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı Yayınları, 1994), p.21; See also Şerif Mardin, *Yeni Osmanlı Düşüncesinin Doğuşu*, (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1996), p.153-154; Erol Güngör, *Dünden Bugünden Tarih-Kültür-Milliyetçilik*, (İstanbul: Ötüken Yayınları, 1990), p.101-102; Cemil Meriç, *Kırk Ambar*, (İstanbul: Ötüken Yayınları, 1980), p.277-278; Şerif Mardin, *Türk Modernleşmesi*, (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1994), p.10.

when these efforts were not sufficient, a comprehensive Westernisation process extending to social life began.³⁴ The French Revolution accelerated the Westernisation process of the Ottoman Empire and made a significant contribution to the state's imitation of Western civilisation.³⁵ One of the ultimate goals of the Tanzimat Decree was to establish an Ottoman nation where all subjects enjoyed equal civil rights and where citizenship was granted by naturalization rather than being based on religious affiliation. The Hatt-ı Hümayun of Gülhane pledged equal treatment for all subjects of the Ottoman Empire.³⁶ A striking feature of the Tanzimat period was the widespread imitation of the West. Many Ottoman intellectuals admired the West, comparing it favorably to their own society and considering Western institutions, organizations, and lifestyles superior.³⁷ With the Westernization process of the Ottoman Empire, not only the military and administrative structures but also every aspect of daily life was shaped by Western culture. From clothing and architecture to social interactions and currency, Westernization was observed in all areas.³⁸ The Tanzimat reforms were not sustainable as they were imposed from above without the broad participation of the society.³⁹ Westernisation movements in the Ottoman Empire were realised through the joint efforts of intellectuals and the sultan.⁴⁰ The Tanzimat period witnessed a deep divide within Ottoman society between a Western-oriented elite culture and a popular culture rooted in traditional Islamic values. The concentration of Western values in the palace and bureaucracy led to the emergence of an elite class that was alienated from the majority of society.⁴¹ With Westernization, the common ground based on religion in Ottoman society weakened, leading to a deep distrust between the intellectuals and the people. As Mardin argues, the intellectuals of this period became alienated from the people, while the people became suspicious of them.⁴² The intellectuals who emerged during and after the Tanzimat period remained in a limited circle of the palace and bureaucrats and could not establish effective communication with the masses of the people.⁴³ The Tanzimat intellectuals could not convey their ideas to the masses and

³⁴ Kuran, *Türkiye'nin Batılılaşma ve Milli Meseleleri*, p.21-22.

³⁵ Cemil Meriç, *Bu Ülke*, (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1995), p.133.

³⁶ Mardin, *Yeni Osmanlı Düşüncesinin Doğuşu*, p.9, p.26; Bernard Lewis, *Modern Türkiye'nin Doğuşu*, trans. Metin Kıratlı, (Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu Yayınları, 1996), p.107-108.

³⁷ Kuran, *Türkiye'nin Batılılaşma ve Milli Meseleleri*, p.23.

³⁸ Mardin, *Türk Modernleşmesi*, p.11, p.13.

³⁹ Emre Kongar, *Toplumsal Değişme Kurumları ve Türkiye Gerçeği*, (İstanbul: Remzi Kitabevi, 1985), p.357.

⁴⁰ Orhan Türkdogan, *Sosyal Şiddet ve Türkiye Gerçeği*, (Ankara: Mayaş Yayınları, 1985), p.51.

⁴¹ Kadir Canatan, *Bir Değişim Süreci Olarak Modernleşme*, (İstanbul: İnsan Yayınları, 1995), p.58.

⁴² Şerif Mardin, *Türkiye'de Din ve Siyaset*, (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1993), p.282.

⁴³ Türkdogan, *Sosyal Şiddet ve Türkiye Gerçeği*, p.49.

remained only in a narrow bureaucratic circle.⁴⁴ For this reason, the fate of the Turkish intellectual, who is detached from his own history and people, has not gone beyond ‘drawing embroidery on water’.⁴⁵ Post-Tanzimat intellectuals, having adopted Western values and severed their ties to religious beliefs, embraced an individualistic philosophy of life. This alienation from traditional values transformed them into a materialistic elite, completely detached from the masses.⁴⁶ Through the hands of Ottoman intellectuals, the West created a ‘Cultural Satellite’ in the Ottoman Empire.⁴⁷ Güngör described the Turkish intellectual as follows:

“The heir who renounced his inheritance and denied his paternal lineage, claiming to be too powerless to bear his father's debts, is akin to those who, in their desire to escape European scorn, have repudiated the superior aspects of their own heritage, namely, their nation's history. Articles published in the *İctihad* journal, for instance, resemble petitions written to garner European sympathy: 'Our father inflicted great suffering not only upon you but also upon us. But now, we have united to eliminate him and have adopted you as our own father. We are prepared to do whatever you ask, so long as you accept us as your children.’”⁴⁸

The core objective of modernization movements within the Ottoman Empire was to secularize state institutions and ensure the equal application of law to all, influenced by Western thinkers such as Comte.⁴⁹ The process of modernization within the Ottoman Empire brought about a discussion and transformation of the dominant religion within society.⁵⁰ Westernization efforts in the Ottoman Empire significantly diminished the influence of Islam on society, leading to profound societal changes. However, this transformation ultimately resulted in the Ottoman Empire becoming a semi-colony.⁵¹ Enforced by Western powers, the Tanzimat Reforms and the Gülhane Decree curtailed Ottoman sovereignty and granted significant privileges to minority groups.⁵² Harb argued that the Westernization of the Ottoman education system during the Tanzimat period alienated Ottoman youth from their own culture. He further claimed that the Servet-i Fünun literary group, through their journal, cultivated hostility towards the Ottoman Empire and

⁴⁴ Cemil Meriç, *Sosyoloji Notları ve Konferanslar*, (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1993), p.28.

⁴⁵ Meriç, *Bu Ülke*, p.163.

⁴⁶ Türkdoğan, *Sosyal Şiddet ve Türkiye Gerçeği*, p.56-57.

⁴⁷ Türkdoğan, *Sosyal Şiddet ve Türkiye Gerçeği*, p.69; Mardin, *Türk Modernleşmesi*, 266; İlber Ortaylı, *İmparatorluğun En Uzun Yılı*, (İstanbul: Hil Yayınları, 1995), p.204.

⁴⁸ Erol Güngör, *Türk Kültürü ve Milliyetçilik*, (İstanbul: Ötüken Yayınları, 1993), p.71.

⁴⁹ Türkdoğan, *Sosyal Şiddet ve Türkiye Gerçeği*, p.52.

⁵⁰ Ortaylı, *İmparatorluğun En Uzun Yılı*, p.9; See also Türkdoğan, *Sosyal Şiddet ve Türkiye Gerçeği*, p.178.

⁵¹ Canatan, *Bir Değişim Süreci Olarak Modernleşme*, p.63.

⁵² Güngör, *Dünden Bugünden Tarih-Kültür-Milliyetçilik*, p.91-92; See also Canatan, *Bir Değişim Süreci Olarak Modernleşme*, p.61-62.

propagated ideas influenced by Romanticism, including anti-religious sentiments.⁵³ Ahmet Cevdet Pasha observed that the politics of his time were characterized by individuals prioritizing their own factions and increasing the number of their supporters among the bureaucracy. Rather than focusing on guiding the state towards safety and prosperity, officials were preoccupied with their personal interests.⁵⁴ Western powers have engaged in political intrigues to install individuals who would serve their interests in the Ottoman Empire. For instance, when Reshid Pasha weakened, France attempted to bring to power other statesmen who were its supporters.⁵⁵ Discussing the aforementioned period, Ahmet Cevdet Pasha commented on the effects of the Tanzimat Reforms, which were imposed due to pressures from statesmen. He stated, 'Today, we have abandoned our sacred national laws, which were earned through the blood of our forefathers. While the Islamic nation was once the ruling nation, it has been deprived of such a sacred right. This is a day of mourning and weeping for the Muslims.' This was because Muslim and non-Muslim subjects were now considered equal. While non-Muslims expressed great jubilation, the patriarchs and senior clergy were displeased with the Tanzimat reforms. The Greeks voiced their discontent, asserting, 'The state has equated us with the Jews. We were content with the triumph of Islam.' However, Ahmet Cevdet Pasha, when commenting on the facial expressions of state officials, stated, 'The significant joy evident on the faces of certain crypto-Muslim nobles suggests that these officials are engaging in activities detrimental to the state and may be working against its interests. Despite facing domestic criticism, the statesmen managed to garner the approval of foreign powers. British, French, and Austrian ambassadors, in particular, commended the new administration for its superior performance compared to previous governments. By intentionally leaving certain provisions of the Tanzimat Decree ambiguous, the statesmen ensured that Westerners and Muslims would interpret them differently.'⁵⁶

Ahmed Cevdet Pasha: A Study of His Life, Thought and Family

Ahmed Cevdet Pasha was a prominent statesman who significantly influenced the administrative, political, cultural, and intellectual life of the Ottoman Empire in the 19th century. He was also a renowned jurist, historian, sociologist, and thinker, introducing a novel perspective to Ottoman historiography. With his philosophy and methodology of

⁵³ Harb, *el-Musakkaḥūn ve's-Sulta, Turkiya Nemūzecen*, p.35-37.

⁵⁴ Ahmet Cevdet Paşa, *Tezâkir*, (Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu Yayınları, 1991), vol.1, p.87; vol.2, p.15; vol.2, p.86; vol.2, p.19.

⁵⁵ Ahmet Cevdet Paşa, *Tezâkir*, vol.1, p.20-21.

⁵⁶ Ahmet Cevdet Paşa, *Tezâkir*, vol.2, p.68-74.

history, he pioneered a new trend distinct from classical historians, and his works have been highly regarded throughout the ages.⁵⁷ Renowned not only for his historical contributions but also for his legal expertise, he played a pivotal role in the compilation of the Mecelle, a legal code that synthesized Islamic law with Western formal principles while adhering to Sharia principles. As a leading figure of the Tanzimat Era, Pasha was a respected scholar and statesman in the Turco-Islamic world, assuming significant roles in the Ottoman administration and shaping its political course.⁵⁸ Born in the town of Lofça, Bulgaria, in 1823, his given name was Ahmed. He adopted the pseudonym "Cevdet" while studying in Istanbul under the tutelage of the poet Süleyman Fehmi Efendi. His father was İsmail Ağa and his mother was Ayşe Sümbül. After receiving his initial education in Lofça, he pursued Islamic studies and served as a copyist. In 1839, at the age of 17, he moved to Istanbul to continue his religious education, acquiring a broad knowledge in various disciplines. He studied Persian and the Masnavi, earning a license in the Masnavi.⁵⁹ In addition to his formal education, he took Sufi lessons from Kuşadalı İbrahim Efendi and began to write works on literature and Sufism. Having received a scholarly license at a young age, he taught at the Fatih and Dülgeroğlu mosques. In 1843, he passed the examination of the Hamidiye Madrasa and was granted a stipend. In 1844, he began his state service as a judge in Premedi. In 1845, he won the position of a lecturer in Istanbul and was consulted by Grand Vizier Reşid Pasha on Islamic law for the preparation of new laws. When the Religious Affairs Directorate assigned Ahmet Cevdet Efendi to a task, Grand Vizier Reşid Pasha got to know him better and was impressed. In 1848, he went to Bucharest to deliver a message to Keçecizade Fuat Pasha, and in 1849, he received the rank of Hareket-i Hariciye. In 1850, he was appointed as a member of the General Council of Education and as the director of the Teacher Training School. He prepared the 'Kavaid-i Osmaniye' (Ottoman Regulations) with Fuat Pasha at the Bursa hot springs and, in 1851, was elected to the Council of Scholars. Having revised this work, he presented it to Sultan Abdülmecid and was promoted to the rank of 'Hareket-i altmışlı'. In 1853, he was tasked with writing a history of the Ottoman Empire from 1774 to 1826. Completing three volumes of this history

⁵⁷ Berkes, *Türkiye'de Çağdaşlaşma*, p.215-218; Osman Keskiöğlu, "Ahmet Cevdet Paşa Hayatı ve Eserleri". *Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, Vol. 14 (1966): p.221-222; Kemal Sözen, "Ahmet Cevdet Paşa'nın Tarihçiliğimize Getirdiği Yeniliklerin Felsefi Tahlili". *Süleyman Demirel Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, Vol. 9, No. 6 (2002): p.11-12.

⁵⁸ Keskiöğlu, "Ahmet Cevdet Paşa Hayatı ve Eserleri", p.221-222; Yusuf Halaçoğlu and Mehmet Akif Aydın, "Cevdet Paşa", *DİA*, (İstanbul: TDV Yayınları, 1993), vol.7, p.443-450; Şefaettin Şevercan, "Ahmet Cevdet Paşa'nın Tarihçiliği", *Erciyes Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, Vol. 8, No. 7 (1990): p.227.

⁵⁹ Keskiöğlu, "Ahmet Cevdet Paşa Hayatı ve Eserleri", p.221-222; Halaçoğlu and Aydın, "Cevdet Paşa", vol.7, p.443.

within a year, he presented them to the Sultan and was promoted to the rank of 'Müsille-i Süleymaniye'. In 1852, he traveled to Egypt with Fuat Pasha and in 1855, he was appointed as a chronicler, a position he held until 1865. He also wrote a work titled 'Tezakir-i Cevdet' which narrates political events. As he ascended the ranks of the state, he also rose in academic circles. In 1856, he was appointed as a judge in Galata, in 1857 in Mecca, and in 1861 in Istanbul. In 1857, he inspected Rumelia with Grand Vizier Kıbrıslı Mehmet Pasha, and in 1861, he was assigned with "extraordinary duties" to suppress the rebellion in Shkodra. In 1863, he was appointed as the Chief Justice of Anatolia and tasked with overseeing the Bosnia Eyalet, where he implemented reforms. For his successes in Bosnia, he was awarded the Order of Osmanieh, second class. In 1864, he spent six months carrying out reforms in Kozan.⁶⁰ In 1862, he was nominated to become the Sheikh al-Islam but could not assume this position due to the intrigues he faced. He was transferred from the ulema class to the administrative class and in 1866, with the transformation of the office of the Kazasker into a ministry, he was granted the title of 'pasha'. Subsequently, he was appointed as the governor of Aleppo. In 1867, he became the Minister of Justice and worked to establish a modern judicial system. He presided over the 'Mecelle-i Ahkâm-ı Âliye Cemiyeti', a society established to prepare a new law code based on Hanafi jurisprudence. After completing the first four volumes of the Mecelle, Pasha was dismissed from his position and appointed as the governor of Bursa. After a while, he was removed from this position, and Gerdan kiran Ömer Efendi was appointed as the head of the Mecelle commission. However, when the sixth volume received significant criticism, he was reinstated as the head of the commission. After being dismissed and reinstated several times during the Mecelle studies, he was appointed as a member of the Council of State and Minister of Evkaf and Education in 1873. During his tenure as Minister of Education, he implemented reforms in the education system, opened a modern primary school, and reorganized the Teacher Training School.⁶¹ During his tenure as Minister of Education, he placed great importance on the education system. Together with a commission of teachers, he had comprehensive curricula and textbooks prepared for all levels of education, from primary school to university. He himself wrote a part of his book "Kısas-ı Enbiya" during this period, as well as other textbooks such as "Kavaid-i Türkiye", "Miyar-ı Sedâd", and "Âdab-ı Sedâd". Later, he held important positions such as Deputy President of the Council

⁶⁰ Mehmet Şakir Ülkütaşır, *Cevdet Paşa, Hayatı, Şahsiyeti, Eserleri*, (Ankara: Doğu Yayınları, 1945), p.18-25; Halaçoğlu and Aydın, "Cevdet Paşa", vol.7, p.444-445.

⁶¹ Keskiöğlu, "Ahmet Cevdet Paşa Hayatı ve Eserleri", p.223; Halaçoğlu and Aydın, "Cevdet Paşa", vol.7, p.443-444.

of State, Governor of Yanina, and again as Minister of Education and Justice. During his tenure as Minister of Justice, he attached the commercial courts to the Ministry of Justice. However, in 1876, he was removed from his post to inspect Rumelia. Although he was appointed as the Governor of Syria, he was assigned as Minister of Education before taking up this post and completed the Mecelle studies. He also served in various ministries such as the Ministry of the Interior, the Ministry of Commerce and Agriculture, and even served as Grand Vizier for a period. He was appointed Minister of Justice several times, but was removed due to political intrigues. In his later years, he devoted himself to scholarly pursuits and wrote a significant historical work, "Tarih-i Cevdet". He passed away on May 26, 1895, at his mansion in Bebek, Istanbul, and was buried in the tomb of Sultan Mehmed the Conqueror.⁶² He was recognized not only as a statesman but also as a multi-faceted scholar and writer. He authored numerous works including "Tarih-i Cevdet", "Tezâkir", "Ma'ruzât", "Kırım ve Kafkas Tarihi", "Belağat-ı Osmaniye", "Kavâid-i Osmaniye", "Divançe-i Cevdet", "Mecelle-i Ahkâmı Adliye", "Kısas-ı Enbiya", and "Tevarih-i Hulefâ". In these works, he addressed topics such as Ottoman history, Islamic history, literature, grammar, and politics. In particular, "Mecelle-i Ahkâmı Adliye" is of great significance for modernizing Islamic law. A large portion of his works was used in the education system of the time.⁶³ He was a significant statesman and thinker who sought to balance the traditional values of the Ottoman Empire with the Western concept of modernization. Opposing the blind imitation of the West, he advocated for modernizing Ottoman institutions while preserving their Islamic roots. To this end, he produced numerous works in fields such as law, education, and history, and particularly pioneered the modernization of Islamic law with his work "Mecelle-i Ahkâmı Adliye". Thanks to his mastery of both Islamic civilization and Western scientific and technological advancements, he endeavored to implement significant reforms to prevent the decline of the Ottoman Empire.⁶⁴ He combined both the traditional Islamic approach to historiography and the Western scientific approach to history. He argued that history is not merely a chronology of events, but also involves understanding the causes and consequences of these events. According to Pasha, the historian's role is not only to record events but also to draw lessons from them and illuminate the future. Emphasizing the importance of history for the survival of states,

⁶² Keskiöglü, "Ahmet Cevdet Paşa Hayatı ve Eserleri", p.221-225; Şevercan, "Ahmet Cevdet Paşa'nın Tarihçiliği", 227-228; Halaçoğlu and Aydın, "Cevdet Paşa", vol.7, p.443-449.

⁶³ Veli Ertan, *Ahmet Cevdet Paşa Hayatı ve Eserleri*, (Ankara: Hilal Yayınları, 1962), p.22-24; Keskiöglü, "Ahmet Cevdet Paşa Hayatı ve Eserleri", p.227; Halaçoğlu and Aydın, "Cevdet Paşa", vol.7, p.448-449.

⁶⁴ Şevercan, "Ahmet Cevdet Paşa'nın Tarihçiliği", p.227-228; Ebül'ula Mardin, *Medeni Hukuk Cephesinden Ahmet Cevdet Paşa*, (İstanbul: İÜ Hukuk Fakültesi, 1946), p.213-226.

Pasha developed a philosophy of history by analyzing not only political events but also economic and social factors in his works.⁶⁵ Influenced by Ibn Khaldun in his historical approach, he examined Ottoman history within the framework of both Islamic historiography and Western scientific historiography. He explained the rise and fall of the Ottoman Empire using Ibn Khaldun's "five stages" theory, attributing the state's problems primarily to its expanding borders and weaknesses in governance. While emphasizing the importance of Western historiography, he argued that a good understanding of Western history is necessary to comprehend Ottoman history. However, he also noted that Western chronological frameworks are not suitable for Islamic history, stating that Islamic history has shaped itself according to its own conditions.⁶⁶ He viewed the family as the cornerstone of society and believed that Islam protected women and the family. While advocating for a traditional family structure, he also stated that he was not opposed to modernization. According to Pasha, the family plays a crucial role in both the religious and social life of the individual.⁶⁷ Pasha was a father of three. One of his daughters, Fatma Aliye, is recognized as one of the first female writers of the Ottoman Empire, while his other daughter, Emine Semiyye, was a teacher who made significant contributions to women's issues and education.⁶⁸ Emine Semiyye, like her elder sister, received a private education at her father's home and subsequently pursued studies in psychology and sociology in Europe. Upon her return to Turkey, she assumed various roles including teaching, inspecting, and nursing.⁶⁹ Throughout his long career in bureaucracy and scholarship, the Pasha resided in rented mansions and yalis. During the reign of Abdulhamid II, he ascended to the position of a minister, leading to an increase in his wealth and status. With this rise, the number of his employees also increased, transforming his mansion into a mid-sized government office.⁷⁰ The letters written by the Pasha to his wife, Adviye Râbia, reveal his nature as a father. Ortaylı characterizes these letters as solemn yet affectionate.⁷¹ Although Ahmet Cevdet Pasha did not explicitly express his affections for his wife in his letters, he alluded to his longing by claiming to have smelled Adviye's letters.⁷² Despite his

⁶⁵ Mükrimin Halil Yinanç, *Tanzimattan Meşrutiyete Kadar Bizde Tarihçilik*, (İstanbul: MFV Kitapları, 1940), p.576; Veli Ertan, *Değerli Türk Âlimi Büyük Hukukçu Tarihçi Ahmet Cevdet Paşa*, (Ankara: Türk Yurdu Yayınları, 1966), p.23.

⁶⁶ Şevercan, "Ahmet Cevdet Paşa'nın Tarihçiliği", p.228-229; Sözen, "Ahmet Cevdet Paşa'nın Tarihçiliğimize Getirdiği Yeniliklerin Felsefi Tahlili", p.14-15.

⁶⁷ Mustafa Gündüz, *Eğitimci Yönüyle Ahmed Cevdet Paşa*, (Ankara: Doğ Batı Yayınları, 2015), p.170-172.

⁶⁸ Ahmet Cihan, *Ahmet Cevdet Paşa'nın Aile Mektupları*, (İstanbul: Gökkuşbu Yayınları, 2007), p.45.

⁶⁹ Kadriye Kaymaz, *Gölgedeki Kalem: Emine Semiye*, (İstanbul: Küre Yayınları, 2009), p.28, p.62.

⁷⁰ Cihan, *Ahmet Cevdet Paşa'nın Aile Mektupları*, p.45-46.

⁷¹ Gündüz, *Eğitimci Yönüyle Ahmed Cevdet Paşa*, p.172.

⁷² Cihan, *Ahmet Cevdet Paşa'nın Aile Mektupları*, p.46.

demanding duties, the Pasha did not neglect his family. When he did not hear from home for two weeks, he sent a telegram and upon receiving a reply, he expressed his immense joy, stating, 'I felt as if I had been born again. In order to avoid such distress in the future, you must send at least a short note every week, my dear.' His letters reveal that his wife, Advıye, learned to write later in life. Despite his busy schedule, he never hesitated to attend to his family. When his wife, Advıye, informed him in a note that she was pregnant with Emine Sümeyye and that she was feeling fatigued, the Pasha responded, 'I am deeply saddened by your discomfort. Truly, my heart aches at even the slightest ailment of yours. Advıye was known to have a jealous disposition. Rumors circulated during the Pasha's prolonged Bosnian assignment. Advıye insisted that the Pasha should bring his assignment to a close and return to the capital, but he responded, "This is a place where even men of delicate nature, let alone women, find it difficult to survive." Advıye's letters have only survived partially, and these inferences have been drawn from the Pasha's correspondence.⁷³ When he was stationed outside of Istanbul, he entrusted the management of the household and family to his wife, Advıye. Despite being far away, he continually offered advice, though he ultimately left the final decision to her.⁷⁴ They spent their summers in their mansions on the Bosphorus and their winters in their mansions in Istanbul.⁷⁵ Ahmed Cevdet Pasha lived not only with his immediate family but also with his close relatives and a staff of fifteen servants.⁷⁶ According to Kütükoğlu, the household staff exceeded thirty individuals, excluding family members.⁷⁷ According to Ahmet Mithat Efendi's work, there were dedicated teachers for children and servants. One of these teachers was Lofçalı Hacı İbrahim Şevki. Moreover, Ahmet Cevdet Pasha also hosted students in his mansion.⁷⁸ He is a hospitable person who enjoys protecting his relatives.⁷⁹ As Ahmet Mithat Efendi pointed out, the life in the mansion reflected the cultural environment of the post-Tanzimat period, offering an atmosphere that emphasized reading, writing, and acquiring knowledge. Fatma Aliye was drawn to literature under the influence of this environment.⁸⁰ Prior to the Tanzimat reforms, child-rearing in the Ottoman Empire

⁷³ Mübahat Kütükoğlu, "Cevdet Paşa ve Aile İçi Münasebetleri", *Ahmet Cevdet Paşa Semineri Bildirileri*, 27-28 May 1985, (İstanbul: İstanbul Üniversitesi Edebiyat Fakültesi, 1986): p.199-210.

⁷⁴ Ahmet Şimşirgil and Ekrem Buğra Ekinci, *Ahmed Cevdet Paşa ve Mecelle*, (İstanbul: IQ Kültür Sanat Yayıncılık, 2016), p.46.

⁷⁵ Kütükoğlu, "Cevdet Paşa ve Aile İçi Münasebetleri", p.216.

⁷⁶ Cihan, *Ahmet Cevdet Paşa'nın Aile Mektupları*, p.47.

⁷⁷ Kütükoğlu, "Cevdet Paşa ve Aile İçi Münasebetleri", p.214.

⁷⁸ Ahmet Mithat Efendi, *Fatma Aliye Bir Kadın Yazarın Doğuşu*, (İstanbul: Sel Yayıncılık, 2011), p.39-61.

⁷⁹ Kütükoğlu, "Cevdet Paşa ve Aile İçi Münasebetleri", p.204.

⁸⁰ Ahmet Mithat Efendi, *Fatma Aliye Bir Kadın Yazarın Doğuşu*, p.19.

was primarily a maternal responsibility. However, the adoption of Western educational models during this period resulted in a shift towards paternal involvement in children's education, particularly among the elite such as pashas.⁸¹ The education of all inhabitants of the mansion was highly prioritized, and private tutors were engaged to facilitate their intellectual growth.⁸² The father was particularly invested in ensuring his daughters acquired foreign language skills, notably French, and developed a passion for literature. Fatma Aliye acknowledged her father's significant role in fostering her literary interests.⁸³ The father was equally committed to his son Ali Sedat's education. Upon Ali Sedat's successful completion of Quranic memorization at the tender age of six, he proposed that his wife acquire a dedicated Quran for their son or bestow her personal Quran as a gift.⁸⁴ Ahmet Cevdet Pasha demonstrated a profound commitment to his son's holistic development by closely monitoring his educational progress and physical well-being. He employed their correspondence as a means of evaluating the son's writing abilities.⁸⁵ Ahmet Cevdet Pasha demonstrated a keen interest in his son's education by urging his wife, Advie, to facilitate his studies. Additionally, he engaged in discussions with Advie regarding the optimal preservation of their personal library.⁸⁶ The level of education that Pasha afforded his daughter, Fatma Aliye, was exceptional for a girl of her era, and it would have been highly unlikely for another girl to receive such a comprehensive education during that time.⁸⁷ Ahmet Cevdet Pasha maintained a lifelong commitment to the education and upbringing of his children, adhering to a pedagogical framework rooted in religious and traditional values.⁸⁸ Ahmet Cevdet Pasha's family enjoyed a distinguished status within the Ottoman court. His daughter, Fatma Aliye, who benefited from an exceptional education, achieved prominence both within the Ottoman Empire and abroad. She was entrusted by Abdulhamid II with the role of facilitating diplomatic relations at the palace.⁸⁹ Ali Sedat is renowned for his groundbreaking work in logic, notably his treatise "Mizanul-Ukul," which served as a pioneering introduction of Western logical systems into the Turkish intellectual sphere. This work was conceived as a response to a treatise on logic

⁸¹ Gündüz, *Eğitimci Yönüyle Ahmed Cevdet Paşa*, p.174.

⁸² Kütükoğlu, "Cevdet Paşa ve Aile İçi Münasebetleri", p.203.

⁸³ Gündüz, *Eğitimci Yönüyle Ahmed Cevdet Paşa*, p.180.

⁸⁴ Kütükoğlu, "Cevdet Paşa ve Aile İçi Münasebetleri", p.203.

⁸⁵ Cihan, *Ahmet Cevdet Paşa'nın Aile Mektupları*, p.46.

⁸⁶ Gündüz, *Eğitimci Yönüyle Ahmed Cevdet Paşa*, p.183.

⁸⁷ Kütükoğlu, "Cevdet Paşa ve Aile İçi Münasebetleri", p.204.

⁸⁸ Gündüz, *Eğitimci Yönüyle Ahmed Cevdet Paşa*, p.180-183.

⁸⁹ Kütükoğlu, "Cevdet Paşa ve Aile İçi Münasebetleri", p.219-220.

that his father had previously authored and dedicated to him.⁹⁰ Although he had three children, little is known about his son, Muhittin Bey.⁹¹ The Pasha's paternal affection was not confined to his immediate offspring but was also extended to his grandson, Muhittin.⁹² Mehmet Muhittin Bey, born in Damascus in 1879 to Pervin, was one of the offspring of the marriage between Ali Sedat Bey and Pervin. This union also produced two daughters: Azime and Zeynep Sünbül.⁹³ In addition to prioritizing his children's education, the Pasha demonstrated a deep commitment to their well-being, sending gifts to his family from his various postings as a token of his affection.⁹⁴ The Pasha's benevolence extended beyond his immediate family, as he generously distributed gifts and monetary support to a wider circle of relatives.⁹⁵ The correspondence between the Pasha and his family members serves as compelling evidence of his dedication to his familial responsibilities. His letters, characterized by deep respect for his wife and tender affection for his children, exemplify a family life guided by Islamic principles.⁹⁶

The Impact of Westernization on Family and Identity: The Case of Fatma Aliye and Her Daughter, Nun Zubeyde İsmet

Born in Istanbul on October 22, 1862, Fatma Aliye was the offspring of Ahmet Cevdet Pasha, a prominent figure in Ottoman politics. Her family's commitment to education enabled her to acquire a comprehensive education and engage with diverse cultures. Her father's connections facilitated her entry into the Ottoman court, where she eventually wed Faik Pasha, a confidant of Sultan Abdulhamid II.⁹⁷ The translation of the French novel 'Volonté' in 1890 served as a catalyst for Fatma Aliye's literary career, solidifying her reputation as a prominent intellectual.⁹⁸ Fatma Aliye's translation of Georges Ohnet's French novel "Merâm" into Turkish marked a significant milestone in her literary career. Using the pseudonym "Bir Kadın," she signed her work and became widely recognized as "Mütercime-i Merâm." The decision to conceal her identity led to her being characterized as the "invisible translator."⁹⁹ Fatma Aliye's literary career commenced with

⁹⁰ Necati Öner, "Ali Sedat", *DİA*, (İstanbul: TDV Yayınları, 1989), vol.2, p.442.

⁹¹ Kütükoğlu, "Cevdet Paşa ve Aile İçi Münasebetleri", p.220.

⁹² Ahmet Semih Mümtaz, *Eski İstanbul Konakları*, (İstanbul: Kurtuba Kitap, 2011), p.145-146.

⁹³ Şevki Nezihi Aykut, *Ahmet Cevdet Paşa Hayatı, Eserleri, Tarihçiliği Hakkında Yapılan Araştırma ve İncelemeler*, (Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu Yayınları, 2018), p.189-190.

⁹⁴ Gündüz, *Eğitimci Yönüyle Ahmed Cevdet Paşa*, p.176.

⁹⁵ Kütükoğlu, "Cevdet Paşa ve Aile İçi Münasebetleri", p.207-208.

⁹⁶ Gündüz, *Eğitimci Yönüyle Ahmed Cevdet Paşa*, p.48, p.184.

⁹⁷ Emel Aşa, "Fatma Aliye Hanım", *DİA*, (İstanbul: TDV Yayınları, 1995), vol.12, p.261-262; See also Güven Taneri Uluköse, *Fatma Aliye*, (İstanbul: Cinius, 2013), p.14-42.

⁹⁸ Uluköse, *Fatma Aliye*, p.43-44.

⁹⁹ Ayşe Karadağ, "Çeviri Tarihimizde "Gözle Görülür" Bir Mütercime: Fatma Aliye Hanım". *CÜ Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, Vol. 37, No. 2 (2013): p.12-13.

the collaborative novel "Hayal ve Hakikat," which she co-wrote with Ahmet Mithat Efendi in 1891. By publishing "Muhadarat" in 1892, she achieved the distinction of becoming the first female novelist in Turkey to have her work printed.¹⁰⁰ Fatma Aliye served as a regular contributor to the Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete, a prominent women's magazine published between 1895 and 1908.¹⁰¹ As a prolific writer, she contributed numerous articles to various periodicals of her time, including 21 in Hanımlara Mahsus, 11 in Tercüman-ı Hakikat, and 5 in each of Servet-i Fünun Mecmuası, Mahasin, İnkılab, and Ümmet.¹⁰² In 1893, Fatma Aliye's works were recognized by the Woman's Library of the World's Columbian Exposition in the United States, and she was requested to provide biographical information. Her works were translated into various languages and garnered significant attention in the West.¹⁰³ She made significant intellectual contributions to historiography, with her first historical work being "A Crucial Period of Ottoman History: The Victory of Kosovo and the Defeat of Ankara." Like her father, she was influenced by Ibn Khaldun's approach to history writing.¹⁰⁴ Following her father's death, Fatma Aliye authored the first volume of "Ahmet Cevdet Paşa ve Zamanı" (Ahmet Cevdet Pasha and His Time) in 1913. Her interests extended beyond literature to philosophy and Islamic history. With works like "Terâcim-i Ahvâl-i Felâsife" (Biographies of Philosophers), she pioneered the field of philosophy, and with "Namdarân-ı Zenân- İslâmiyân" (Famous Women in Islam), she made significant contributions to the study of Islamic women. This multifaceted approach established her reputation as both the first female philosopher and a deeply religious writer. Fatma Aliye was also actively involved in humanitarian organizations such as the "Hilâl-i Ahmer" (Red Crescent) and contributed to public life through her speeches.¹⁰⁵ Having authored Fatma Aliye's biography, Ahmet Mithat Efendi has been one of the foundational elements of Fatma Aliye's intellectual identity.¹⁰⁶ In 1894, she authored 'Nisvan-ı Islam,' a work that discussed the issues of Islam and women's rights through a series of dialogues. In this book, she presented an Ottoman woman figure who draws foreign women's attention

¹⁰⁰ Uluköse, *Fatma Aliye*, p.62.

¹⁰¹ Suraiya Faroqhi, ed. Suad Joseph. "Women In The Ottoman World: Mid-18th to 20th Century". *Encyclopaedia of Women and Islamic Cultures*. Boston: Brill, Vol. 1 (2003): p.160.

¹⁰² Uluköse, *Fatma Aliye*, p.111.

¹⁰³ Selma Atabek, "İlk Roman Yazan, İlk Çeviri Yapan, İlk Felsefe Kitabını Yazan Kadın Yazarımız Fatma Aliye Hanım". *Bütün Dünya Dergisi*, No. 7 (2002): p.134.

¹⁰⁴ Aliye Mataracı, "Fatma Aliye Hanım's Contributions to History Writing". *International Relations and Diplomacy* Vol. 4, No. 8 (2016): p.505-506.

¹⁰⁵ Uluköse, *Fatma Aliye*, p.109, p.105-110, p.55-57.

¹⁰⁶ Nevzat Özkan, "İlk Kadın Romancımız Fatma Aliye'nin Yetiştirdiği Sosyal ve Kültürel Ortam". *Söylem Filoloji Dergisi*, Vol. 2, No. 4 (2017): p.191.

to Islamic values and principles.¹⁰⁷ Julyar's work, 'Women of the East and West,' contained derogatory remarks about Islam, which prompted Fatma Aliye to issue a vehement rebuttal in a letter to French publications.¹⁰⁸ Fatma Aliye, whose perspective on women's education was rooted in Islamic and traditional values, proposed that a woman's education should be geared towards fulfilling her roles as a wife and mother. She contended that a well-educated woman would be better equipped to raise educated children.¹⁰⁹ Her prolific writing career continued until 1915, when she ceased to publish. Scholars have offered various explanations for this hiatus, with Asha attributing it to the progression of a chronic illness she developed in 1885 and the profound emotional distress caused by her daughter İsmet's conversion and emigration.¹¹⁰ According to Kızıltan, the author's profound grief in her final years was triggered by the mysterious disappearance of her youngest daughter, Zubeyde İsmet, a graduate of Notre Dame de Sion, in 1927.¹¹¹

As Asha further states,

“The profound impact of her daughter Zubeyde İsmet's conversion to Catholicism and subsequent entry into a convent, following her graduation from Notre Dame de Sion, as well as the ensuing media attention, is clearly reflected in Fatma Aliye's correspondence. She succumbed to her grief in Istanbul and was interred at Feriköy Cemetery.”¹¹²

Having been privately tutored, Zubeyde İsmet,¹¹³ the daughter of Fatma Aliye, enrolled at Notre Dame de Sion. Her developing interest in Christianity during her time at the school generated considerable speculation among her contemporaries. Having finished her studies, İsmet, motivated by a desire for financial autonomy, clandestinely provided French tuition at Dame de Sion. When rumors of her conversion to Christianity circulated, her family prohibited her from continuing her employment there. Consequently, İsmet relocated to İzmir, citing health reasons as a pretext for her departure. She initially resided at Dame de Sion in İzmir and secured employment at the Bank of Salonica. Having resided

¹⁰⁷ Atabek, “İlk Roman Yazan, İlk Çeviri Yapan, İlk Felsefe Kitabını Yazan Kadın Yazarımız Fatma Aliye Hanım”, p.133.

¹⁰⁸ Gizem Parsova and İbrahim Biri, “Tanzimat Dönemi Aydınlarından Fatma Aliye”, *Akademik Bakış Uluslararası Hakemli Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, No. 68 (2018): p.135.

¹⁰⁹ Şahika Karaca, “Fatma Aliye Hanım’ın Türk Kadın Haklarının Düşünsel Temellerine Katkıları”. *Karadeniz Araştırmaları Dergisi*, Vol. 31, No. 31 (2011): p.97-100.

¹¹⁰ Emel Aşa, “Fatma Aliye Hanım: Hayatı-Eserleri-Fikirleri” (Yayınlanmamış Doktora Tezi. İstanbul Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, 1993), p.38.

¹¹¹ Fatma Aliye Hanım, *Fatma Aliye Hanım, Yaşamı-Sanatı-Yapıtları ve Nisvân-ı İslâm*, haz. Mübcecel Kızıltan, (İstanbul: Mutlu Yayınları, 1993), p.29.

¹¹² Aşa, “Fatma Aliye Hanım”, vol.12, p.261-262.

¹¹³ Fatma Aliye's marriage to Fâik Bey, a military aide to Sultan Abdulhamid II, took place in 1879. Their union produced four daughters: Hatice, Ayşe, Nimet, and Zubeyde İsmet. Refer to Aşa, “Fatma Aliye Hanım”, vol.12, p.261.

at Dame de Sion for a period, İsmet subsequently rented a private residence. To conceal her identity, she informed her landlord that she was saving money to marry a Bulgarian man against her family's wishes and that she planned to emigrate to Marseille once she had accumulated sufficient funds. While engaged in a correspondence with an individual in Marseille, a check for five thousand francs was remitted to the French Consulate on İsmet's behalf. Having made the necessary arrangements for her departure to Marseille, İsmet's friends at the İzmir and Surrounding Areas Railway Company erroneously assumed that she had purchased a ticket to Bandırma, intending to travel to Istanbul. Upon ascertaining that İsmet had relocated to Marseille, Fatma Aliye engaged the services of the Marseille police to facilitate her daughter's return. Subsequent to İsmet's departure from İzmir, two letters were delivered to her former residence; however, as the landlord, Mehmet Ali Bey, was unaware of her new address, he was unable to forward the correspondence and subsequently discarded it. One of these letters, from İsmet's sister Nimet, contained a proposal for a joint escape abroad. Consequently, the landlord recommended that Fatma Aliye seek information from Nimet, who was privy to İsmet's plans to leave the country. Consequent to İsmet's disappearance, the İzmir Police launched an investigation. However, with the assistance of various individuals and organizations, İsmet successfully relocated to England and France, subsequently severing all familial ties. Nonetheless, after a period, İsmet communicated with Fatma Aliye, asserting that she had been summoned to attend to her ailing father. Fatma Aliye categorically denied this allegation, stating that she had sent İsmet to Ada to provide care for their father and had dispatched her sister Nimet to Moda for a period of two and a half months. Following an investigation into the rumors surrounding her daughter's alleged conversion to Christianity and entrance into a religious order, Fatma Aliye continued to correspond with Marie Constantine, the Headmistress of the Istanbul Notre Dame de Sion School. While Constantine persistently maintained that İsmet had not renounced her Islamic faith and had merely pursued opportunities for employment and a higher standard of living abroad, subsequent photographic evidence depicting İsmet in a nun's habit substantiated the claims of her conversion. A correspondence between mother and daughter ensued, wherein Fatma Aliye repeatedly implored İsmet to return home, assuring her of a more fulfilling and comfortable existence. Nonetheless, this communication proved to be both brief and superficial.¹¹⁴ In their

¹¹⁴ For the complete correspondence, refer to Mübeccel Kızıltan and Tülay Gençtürk, *Atatürk Kitaplığı Fatma Aliye Hanım evrakı Kataloğu I*, İstanbul: İstanbul Büyükşehir Belediye Başkanlığı Kültürel ve Sosyal İşler Daire Başkanlığı Kütüphane ve Müzeler Müdürlüğü, 1993, 21-28; Mübeccel Kızıltan, "Gizemli Bir Öykünün Peşinde", *Toplumsal Tarih*, Vol. 3, No. 16 (1995): p.13-20.

correspondence, İsmet attributed her departure from İzmir to the adverse climatic conditions and indicated her intention to relocate to Spanish Morocco. Nevertheless, Fatma Aliye expressed skepticism in her letters, suggesting that the arid climate of North Africa would not be conducive to her daughter's well-being and implying that İsmet had ulterior motives. At Fatma Aliye's request, Constantine initiated an inquiry into İsmet's whereabouts and, through a mutual acquaintance, ascertained that İsmet was residing in Paris as a nanny in the household of Madame La Baronne de Boys. In subsequent correspondence with her sister Nimet, İsmet revealed that she had since left the employ of Madame La Baronne de Boys and had relocated to Rouen, but she declined to provide her new address. Renewed rumors circulated in Istanbul regarding İsmet's alleged religious conversion, prompting Fatma Aliye to pressurize Constantine to intervene. In response, İsmet penned a courteous letter, expressing her intention to relocate to France. Fatma Aliye's subsequent investigations yielded a letter from a French acquaintance of Monsieur Guilbert, confirming that İsmet was employed as a domestic servant in his household. Despite Constantine's encouragement for renewed correspondence between mother and daughter, and İsmet's initial positive response regarding her plans to travel to France, she subsequently severed all contact with her family. Ultimately, Fatma Aliye and Faik Bey passed away without being reunited with their daughter. Upon retiring from the Catholic religious order in Tunisia in 1976, İsmet returned to her birthplace, Istanbul. She divided her time between Notre Dame de Sion during the winter months and Büyükkada, where she resided with her niece in the summer. In the twilight of her life, she inherited her mother's intellectual curiosity and embarked upon the study of Hebrew, engaging in a profound exploration of the Quran and Hadith. She passed away as a citizen of the Republic of Turkey on July 27, 1992.¹¹⁵ While Kızıltan maintained that İsmet had relocated to Marseille in 1984 and remained there until her demise,¹¹⁶ Meriç presented a contrasting account, asserting that she had encountered İsmet at a conference convened at the St. Antoine Church in Istanbul during the years 1987-1988:

“Unlike his sister Nimet, İsmet had a fondness for the staff of Dame de Sion, and reciprocally, they were fond of him. A certain Father Luce expressed interest in getting to know me better and inquired about the educational journey that shaped my Islamic identity. He subsequently invited me to deliver a lecture at St. Antoine Church, located in the well-known Galatasaray district of Beyoğlu. In the presence of numerous nuns, I

¹¹⁵ Kızıltan, “Gizemli Bir Öykünün Peşinde”, p.13-21.

¹¹⁶ Kızıltan, “Gizemli Bir Öykünün Peşinde”, p.20.

provided a comprehensive account of my personal spiritual journey. Upon the conclusion of my speech, a woman of approximately 65 years, of medium height and fair complexion, approached me. Dressed in the contemporary habit of a nun, she addressed me in fluent Turkish, stating with surprise, 'I am İsmet, the granddaughter of Ahmet Cevdet Pasha. I was astounded upon hearing this and expressed my sincere pleasure. She responded that she was likewise delighted to make my acquaintance and extended an invitation for me to visit Dame de Sion, where she was currently residing. I readily accepted. However, she immediately added a request: 'Please do not ask me why I became a Christian. I simply wish to get to know you.' I replied, 'Very well, of course. I visited Dame de Sion on the day I was invited and we engaged in conversation. I was warmly welcomed and given a tour of the premises. Subsequently, İsmet presented me with a Turkish postage stamp featuring a portrait of Cevdet Pasha. I never saw İsmet again. However, I learned a piece of news about her from a Jewish lady. Apparently, while departing from Büyükkada, İsmet fell into the sea while boarding a motorboat and was rescued with great difficulty. That is all I know about İsmet. I am aware, however, that she attended Dame de Sion and after graduating, she went to Algeria where she entered a convent and completed her religious vows before returning. This is the extent of my knowledge about her.'¹¹⁷

100

In her letters to her daughter, Fatma Aliye emphasized that a Turkish girl engaging in an unprecedented act would constitute a grave betrayal to both her family and her nation.¹¹⁸ She implied that this situation would not only damage her daughter's personal reputation but also the reputation of foreign educational institutions in Istanbul, such as Dame de Sion. Similarly, in her letter to Constantine dated February 12, 1928, she elaborated on how her daughter's disappearance could negatively impact the public perception of such schools, and requested his intervention to bring her daughter back:

“Following the allegations that four Muslim girls at the American Girls' School in Bursa were converted to Protestantism, the school was shut down after extensive newspaper coverage and a fact-finding mission was sent to Bursa. Lawsuits were filed against the headmistress and teachers, and the American Preparatory School in Bursa was also closed. Although freedom of religion is guaranteed, it is universally recognized that inciting or persuading individuals of one religion to convert to another is prohibited. Now, newspapers are reporting that three Muslim girls at the Dame de Sion School in Izmir are being encouraged

¹¹⁷ “Sister İsmet, daughter of Fatma Aliye”, GZT Nihayet, <https://www.gzt.com/nihayet/fatma-aliyenin-kizi-rahibe-ismet-3578894> [12.08.2024].

¹¹⁸ Kızıltan, “Gizemli Bir Öykünün Peşinde”, p.16.

to convert to Catholicism, and investigations into this school are said to have begun.”¹¹⁹

This letter from Fatma Aliye to Constantine reveals that foreign educational institutions in the Ottoman Empire were not only providing education but were also being used for missionary activities. This case of İsmet demonstrates that this was not an isolated incident, but rather a common occurrence in foreign educational institutions of the time.¹²⁰

Conclusion

Having experienced a decline in various domestic matters, particularly in the military sphere, compared to the West, the Ottoman Empire sought to emulate the West, which was perceived as being more advanced. However, this emulation extended beyond the military, as Ottoman bureaucrats and Westernizing intellectuals, deemed incompetent and imitative, sent their children to Western missionary schools opened after the Tanzimat reforms. These Ottoman children, indoctrinated in these schools, were instrumentalized in the West's efforts to Christianize and subjugate. This process of emulation evolved into cultural imperialism, as exemplified by the conversion of Ahmet Cevdet Pasha's granddaughter to Catholicism. The transformation of İsmet, the granddaughter of a Pasha, underscores the pivotal role of the education system. Just as in the case of the Pasha, an individual's religion, culture, and family, while influential, cannot override the impact of the state and society's educational system on the destinies of their offspring. Beyond the education system, another crucial factor is affection; İsmet's love for her teachers at Dame de Sion, and their love for her, made her vulnerable to Western cultural imperialism.

References

- “Sister İsmet, daughter of Fatma Aliye”, GZT Nihayet, <https://www.gzt.com/nihayet/fatma-aliyenin-kizi-rahibe-ismet-3578894> [12.08.2024].
- “Tanzimat Reforms”, Turkish Grand National Assembly, Düstür, <https://acikerisim.tbmm.gov.tr/xmlui/handle/11543/67> [24.11.2022].
- Abdurrahman Şeref Efendi. *Tarih Musahabeleri*, Ankara: Kültür ve Turizm Bakanlığı Yayınları, 1985.
- Ahmet Cevdet Paşa. *Tezâkir*, Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu Yayınları, 1991.
- Ahmet Mithat Efendi. *Fatma Aliye Bir Kadın Yazarın Doğuşu*, İstanbul: Sel Yayıncılık, 2011.
- Aksun, Ziya Nur. *Osmanlı Tarihi*, İstanbul: Ötüken Neşriyat, 1982.
- Aşa, Emel. “Fatma Aliye Hanım: Hayatı-Eserleri-Fikirleri”, Yayınlanmamış Doktora Tezi. İstanbul Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, 1993.
- Aşa, Emel. “Fatma Aliye Hanım”, *DİA*, (İstanbul: TDV Yayınları, 1995), 12/261-262.
- Atabek, Selma. “İlk Roman Yazan, İlk Çeviri Yapan, İlk Felsefe Kitabını Yazan Kadın Yazarımız Fatma Aliye Hanım”. *Bütün Dünya Dergisi*, No. 7 (2002): 131-134.

¹¹⁹ Kızıltan, “Gizemli Bir Öykünün Peşinde”, p.18.

¹²⁰ Meral Demiryürek, “İmparatorluğun Kayıp Nesli: Cezmi Vakası”, *Atatürk Üniversitesi Türkiyat Araştırmaları Enstitüsü Dergisi*, No. 70 (2021): p.301-302.

- Ayktut, Şevki Nezihi. *Ahmet Cevdet Paşa Hayatı, Eserleri, Tarihçiliği Hakkında Yapılan Araştırma ve İncelemeler*, Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu Yayınları, 2018.
- Babinger, Franz. *Osmanlı Tarihi Yazarları ve Eserleri*, trans. Coşkun Üçok. Ankara: Kültür ve Turizm Bakanlığı, 1992.
- Banarlı, Nihat Sami. *Resimli Türk Edebiyatı Tarihi*, İstanbul: Milli Eğitim Basımevi, 1971.
- Berkes, Niyazi. *Türkiye’de Çağdaşlaşma*, İstanbul: Doğu Batı Yayınları, 1978.
- Canatan, Kadir. *Bir Değişim Süreci Olarak Modernleşme*, İstanbul: İnsan Yayınları, 1995.
- Cem, İsmail. *Türkiye’de Geri Kalmışlığın Tarihi*, İstanbul: Cem Yayınları, 1997.
- Cihan, Ahmet. *Ahmet Cevdet Paşa’nın Aile Mektupları*. İstanbul: Gökkubbe Yayınları, 2007.
- Demiryürek, Meral. “İmparatorluğun Kayıp Nesli: Cezmi Vakası”, *Atatürk Üniversitesi Türkiyat Araştırmaları Enstitüsü Dergisi*, No. 70 (2021): 295-315.
- Derviş, Hüda. “Alâkatı Türkiye Bi’l-Yehûdî ve İsrail ve Eseruhâ Alâ’l-Bilâdi’l-Arabiyye (1648-1999)” Yayınlanmamış Doktora Tezi. Zegazık Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, 2000.
- Ergin, Osman Nuri. *Türk Maarif Tarihi*, İstanbul: Eser Matbaası, 1977.
- Ertan, Veli. *Ahmet Cevdet Paşa Hayatı ve Eserleri, Hayatı ve Eserleri*. Ankara: Hilal Yayınları, 1962.
- Ertan, Veli. *Değerli Türk Âlimi Büyük Hukukçu Tarihçi Ahmet Cevdet Paşa*. Ankara: Türk Yurdu Yayınları, 1966.
- Eryılmaz, Bilal. *Osmanlı Devleti’nde Millet Sistemi*, İstanbul: Alternatif Üniversite, 1992.
- Eryılmaz, Bilal. *Tanzimat ve Yönetimde Modernleşme*, İstanbul: İşaret Yayınları, 1992.
- Faroqhi, Suraiya, ed. Suad Joseph. “Women In The Ottoman World: Mid-18th to 20th Century”. *Encyclopaedia of Women and Islamic Cultures*. Vol. 1 (2003): 153-163. Boston: Brill.
- Fatma Aliye Hanım, *Fatma Aliye Hanım, Yaşamı-Sanatı-Yapıtları ve Nisvân-ı İslâm*, haz. Mübeccel Kızıltan, İstanbul: Mutlu Yayınları, 1993.
- Fındıkoğlu, Ziyaeddin Fahri. *Tanzimat’ta İctimaî Hayat, Tanzimat I.*, İstanbul: Maarif Matbaası, 1940.
- Gerger, Mehmet Emin. *Tanzimattan Avrupa Topluluğuna Türkiye*, İstanbul: İnkılap Yayınları, 1989.
- Gümüšoğlu, Hasan. *Modernizm’in İnanç Hayatına Etkileri ve Jön Türklük*, İstanbul: Kayihan Yayınları, 2012.
- Gündüz, Mustafa. “Ahmed Cevdet Pasha”, <https://turkmaarifansiklopedisi.org.tr/ahmed-cevdet-pasa#yazar-1> [26.08.2024].
- Gündüz, Mustafa. *Eğitimci Yönüyle Ahmed Cevdet Paşa*, Ankara: Doğ Batı Yayınları, 2015.
- Güngör, Erol. *Dünden Bugünden Tarih-Kültür-Milliyetçilik*, İstanbul: Ötüken Yayınları, 1990.
- Güngör, Erol. *Türk Kültürü ve Milliyetçilik*, İstanbul: Ötüken Yayınları, 1993.
- Halaçoğlu, Yusuf and Aydın, Mehmet Akif. “Cevdet Paşa”, *DİA*, (İstanbul: TDV Yayınları, 1993), 7/443-450.
- Harb, Muhammed. *el-Musakkafûn ve’s-Sulta, Turkiya Nemûzecen*. Kahire: Dâru’l-Beşir, 2017.
- İnalcık, Halil. “Sened 1 İttifak ve Gülhane Hatt-ı Hümayunu” *Belleten*, Vol. 28, No. 112 (1964): 603-622.
- İnalcık, Halil. “Tanzimat’ın Uygulaması ve Sosyal Tepkiler”, *Belleten*, Vol. 28, No. 12 (1964): 623-690.
- Kalaycıoğlu, Ersin and Sarıbay, Ali Yaşar. “Tanzimat: Modernleşme Arayışı ve Siyasal Değişme”, *Türk Siyasal Hayatının Gelişimi*, İstanbul: Beta, 1986.
- Karaca, Şahika. “Fatma Aliye Hanım’ın Türk Kadın Haklarının Düşünsel Temellerine Katkıları”. *Karadeniz Araştırmaları Dergisi*, Vol. 31, No. 31 (2011): 93-110.
- Karadağ, Ayşe. “Çeviri Tarihimizde “Gözle Görülür” Bir Mütercüme: Fatma Aliye Hanım”. *CÜ Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, Vol. 37, No. 2 (2013): 1-16.
- Karal, Enver Ziya. *Tanzimat’tan Evvel Garplılaştırma Hareketleri, Tanzimat I*. İstanbul: Maarif Matbaası, 1940.
- Kaymaz, Kadriye. *Gölgedeki Kalem: Emine Semiye*, İstanbul: Küre Yayınları, 2009.

- Keskioğlu, Osman. "Ahmet Cevdet Paşa Hayatı ve Eserleri". *Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, Vol. 14 (1966): 221-234
- Kızıltan, Mübeccel and Gençtürk, Tülay. *Atatürk Kitaplığı Fatma Aliye Hanım evrakı Kataloğu I*, İstanbul: İstanbul Büyükşehir Belediye Başkanlığı Kültürel ve Sosyal İşler Daire Başkanlığı Kütüphane ve Müzeler Müdürlüğü, 1993.
- Kızıltan, Mübeccel. "Gizemli Bir Öykünün Peşinde", *Toplumsal Tarih*, Vol. 3, No. 16 (1995): 13-21.
- Kongar, Emre. *Toplumsal Değişme Kurumları ve Türkiye Gerçeği*, İstanbul: Remzi Kitabevi, 1985.
- Kuran,ERCÜMENT. *Türkiye'nin Batılılaşma ve Milli Meseleleri*, Ankara: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı Yayınları, 1994.
- Kütükoğlu, Mübahat. "Cevdet Paşa ve Aile İçi Münasebetleri", *Ahmet Cevdet Paşa Semineri Bildirileri*, 27-28 May 1985, İstanbul: İstanbul Üniversitesi Edebiyat Fakültesi, 1986, 99-222.
- Lewis, Bernard. *Modern Türkiye'nin Doğuşu*, trans. Metin Kırıatlı, Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu Yayınları, 1996.
- Manteran, Robert. *Târihu'd-Devleti'l-Osmaniyye*, trans. Beşir Sibâî. Kahire: Dâru'l-Fikr, 1993.
- Mardin, Ebül'ula. *Medeni Hukuk Cephesinden Ahmet Cevdet Paşa*. İstanbul: İÜ Hukuk Fakültesi, 1946.
- Mardin, Şerif. *Türk Modernleşmesi*, İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1994.
- Mardin, Şerif. *Türkiye'de Din ve Siyaset*, İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1993.
- Mardin, Şerif. *Türkiye'de Toplum ve Siyaset*, İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1990.
- Mardin, Şerif. *Yeni Osmanlı Düşüncesinin Doğuşu*, İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1996.
- Mataracı, Aliye. "Fatma Aliye Hanım's Contributions to History Writing". *International Relations and Diplomacy*, Vol. 4, No. 8 (2016): 502-507.
- Meriç, Cemil. *Bu Ülke*, İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1995.
- Meriç, Cemil. *Kırk Ambar*, İstanbul: Ötüken Yayınları, 1980.
- Meriç, Cemil. *Sosyoloji Notları ve Konferanslar*, İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1993.
- Mümtaz, Ahmet Semih. *Eski İstanbul Konakları*, İstanbul: Kurtuba Kitap, 2011.
- Necatigil, Behçet. *Edebiyatımızda İsimler Sözlüğü*, İstanbul: Varlık Yayınları, 1978.
- Ortaylı, İlber. *İmparatorluğun En Uzun Yılı*, İstanbul: Hil Yayınları, 1995.
- Öner, Necati. "Ali Sedat", *DİA*, (İstanbul: TDV Yayınları, 1989), 2/442.
- Özkan, Nevzat. "İlk Kadın Romancımız Fatma Aliye'nin Yetiştirdiği Sosyal ve Kültürel Ortam". *Söylem Filoloji Dergisi*, Vol. 2, No. 4 (2017): 16-28.
- Parsova, Gizem and Biri, İbrahim. "Tanzimat Dönemi Aydınlarından Fatma Aliye", *Akademik Bakış Uluslararası Hakemli Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, No. 68 (2018): 124-139.
- Poole, Lord Statford. *Lord Statford Canning'in Türkiye Anıları*, trans. Can Yücel, Ankara: Yurt yayınları, 1988.
- Sarıkaya, Yaşar. *Medreseler ve Modernleşme*, İstanbul: İz Yayıncılık, 1997.
- Sencer, Muzaffer. "Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nda Tanzimat Sonrası Siyasal ve Yönetişim Gelişmeler" *TODAİE Amme İdaresi Dergisi*, Vol. 17, No. 3 (1984): 46-71.
- Sözen, Kemal. "Ahmet Cevdet Paşa'nın Tarihçiliğimize Getirdiği Yeniliklerin Felsefi Tahlili". *Süleyman Demirel Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, Vol. 9, No. 6 (2002): 11-20.
- Şevercan, Şefaettin. "Ahmet Cevdet Paşa'nın Tarihçiliği". *Erciyes Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, Vol. 8, No. 7 (1990): 227-234.
- Şimşirgil, Ahmet and Ekinci, Ekrem Buğra. *Ahmed Cevdet Paşa ve Mecelle*, İstanbul: IQ Kültür Sanat Yayıncılık, 2016.
- Türkdoğan, Orhan. *Sosyal Şiddet ve Türkiye Gerçeği*, Ankara: Mayaş Yayınları, 1985.
- Uluğköse, Güven Taneri. *Fatma Aliye*. İstanbul: Cinius, 2013.
- Usta, Niyazi. "Osmanlıda Siyaset Sosyolojisi Tarihçesine Kısa Bir Bakış", *Atatürk Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, No. 15 (2001): 61-74.
- Ülkütaşır, Mehmet Şakir. *Cevdet Paşa, Hayatı, Şahsiyeti, Eserleri*. Ankara: Doğuş Yayınları, 1945.

Veldet, Hıfzı. *Kanunlaştırma Hareketleri ve Tanzimat, Tanzimat I*, İstanbul: Maarif Matbaası, 1940.

Yinanç, Mükrimin Halil. *Tanzimattan Meşrutiyete Kadar Bizde Tarihçilik*. İstanbul: MFV Kitapları, 1940.

Appendices



Figure 1. Ahmed Cevdet Pasha

Reference: Mustafa Gündüz, “Ahmed Cevdet Pasha”, <https://turkmaarifansiklopedisi.org.tr/ahmed-cevdet-pasa#yazar-1> [26.08.2024].



Figure 2. The Later Years of Sister Zubeyde İsmet, Granddaughter of Ahmet Cevdet Pasha

Reference: Mübeccel Kızıltan, “Gizemli Bir Öykünün Peşinde”, *Toplumsal Tarih*, Vol. 3, No. 16 (1995): p.20.