TITLE: Evaluation of Writing Skills Learning Field according to Stake's Responsive Evaluation Model

in terms of Gifted and Talented Students

AUTHORS: Derya Acar Basegmez,Kemal Oguz Er,Ahmet Kurnaz

PAGES: 831-877

ORIGINAL PDF URL: https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article-file/3413279

Research Article

Evaluation of Writing Skills Learning Field according to Stake's Responsive Evaluation Model in terms of Gifted and Talented Students[*]

Derya ACAR BAŞEĞMEZ [1], Kemal Oğuz ER [2], Ahmet KURNAZ [3]

[1] Balıkesir University, Institute of Social Sciences, Curriculum and Instruction, Doctoral Student, Balıkesir/Turkey, deryaacar03@gmail.com, http://orcid.org/0000-0002-2271-8211

[2] Balıkesir University, Necatibey Faculty of Education, Department of Education Science, Balıkesir/Turkey, keoguzer@gmail.com, http://orcid.org/0000-0001-6098-2067

[3] Necmettin Erbakan University, Education Faculty of Ahmet Keleşoğlu, Department of Special Education, Konya/Turkey, akurnaz@erbakan.edu.tr, http://orcid.org/0000-0003-1134-8689

Abstract – This research aims to evaluate the 2019 Turkish curriculum writing skills learning field in terms of gifted and talented students. In the research, a holistic single case design, one of the case study designs, was used. The study group was determined by using "criterion sampling" and "convenience sampling" methods from the purposive sampling methods. The sample of the research consisted of gifted and talented students at the fourth grade level in the Sincan region of Ankara province. Within the scope of the research, 21 volunteer students were interviewed. A semi-structured interview form developed by the researcher was used as the data collection tool. The data were collected in April and May 2022. The content analysis method was used to analyze the data. The reliability of the study was determined to be 0.83. The results indicate that the students experience writing anxiety, the topics are relatively appropriate to the level of the students, the variety of methods and techniques and the time are insufficient, and both traditional and alternative assessment methods are used during the evaluation.

Key words: Turkish curriculum, writing skills, Stake's responsive evaluation model, gifted and talented student.

Corresponding author: Derya ACAR BAŞEĞMEZ, deryaacar03@gmail.com.

Introduction

Individuals have different developmental characteristics in terms of mental, physical, social, and affective aspects. While some individuals have developmental disorders in their mental, motor and affective skills compared to their peers, some individuals can show high level performances. To improve the behaviors and skills of these individuals and facilitate their adaptation to their environment, educational services need to be adapted. This need has led to the concept of "special education" (Subakan & Koç, 2019). Special education is a set of individually planned, implemented, and evaluated teaching services to increase the possibility of independent living for individuals with special needs. Individuals with special needs include mental deficiency, learning difficulties, emotional and behavioral disorders, severe and multiple disabilities, hearing deficiencies, communication disorders, visual deficiencies, physical and health related deficiencies, and gifted and talented students (Eripek, 2005).

Among the individuals with special needs, gifted and talented individuals are individuals who can exceed the IQ threshold score of 130 in intelligence tests according to the conservative approach. In liberal definitions, gifted and talented individuals show a high level of capacity or high potential in any field of performance (Sak, 2012). Gifted and talented individuals demonstrate different learning behaviors from their peers in terms of cognitive, affective, and communicative aspects. The curriculums prepared to reveal and develop the individual potential of gifted and talented students should be prepared by considering their needs, individual differences, interests, and learning profiles. For this reason, differentiation is made in existing curriculums (Öznacar & Bildiren, 2016; Tortop, 2015).

Differentiation is the design of learning activities by adapting the existing curriculum objectives to gifted and talented students. In the process of differentiation, some parts of the existing curriculum can be removed and education can be accelerated or new learning objectives can be added to the curriculum and education can be enriched (Sak, 2012). Differentiation is done in the content, process, product, and environment elements of the curriculum. The content element is the information to be taught. It is the facts, concepts, principles and skills in a lesson, learning experience or unit (Tomlinson, 2007). Content-based enrichment is the further expansion and deepening of content beyond the existing curriculum. Enrichment can be done in lessons such as mathematics, science, social studies, and grammar (Sak, 2012). The process element is the activities designed to teach knowledge and skills. In the process element, it is necessary to include activities that are appropriate to the student's level of readiness, meet a goal, attract attention, and associate new concepts and skills with

prior knowledge (Tomlinson, 2007). The process element includes appropriate strategies, methods, techniques, and research skills, allowing students to use their thoughts and knowledge (Şahin, 2018). Process-based enrichment develops students' creativity, critical thinking, and problem-solving skills (Sak, 2012). The product element is the means by which students exhibit what they have learned. Products should be diverse in terms of students' readiness, interests, and learning profiles, be appropriate to the content and process elements, help students express themselves, and allow them to reveal success in a qualified way (Tomlinson, 2007). The product element for gifted and talented students should be differentiated according to criteria such as innovation, depth, originality and relevance to life (Şahin, 2018). Product-based enrichment focuses on tangible products such as novels, poems, stories, reports, and projects as well as abstract products (Sak, 2012). In differentiation related to the environment element, different places such as museums, exhibitions, laboratories, and libraries should be differentiated in terms of time and materials in addition to classical classrooms (Şahin, 2018).

In 1982, the National/State Leadership Training Institute presented the following differentiation principles for gifted and talented curriculum (Kaplan, 1986).

- Content that covers a wide range of topics, themes and problems should be included.
- In-depth learning of the selected topic in the field of study should be provided.
- More than one discipline should be integrated into the field of study.
- Comprehensive, interrelated and mutually reinforcing experiences should be included in a field of study.
- Focus on developing basic skills, independent learning, abstract and higher order thinking skills, research skills and methods.
- Open-ended tasks should be included.
- Individuals' awareness should be developed, such as recognizing their abilities, self-management, distinguishing similarities and differences between themselves and others.
- Encourage the development of products that use techniques, materials and forms that allow changing existing ideas and generating innovative ideas.
- Student outcomes should be assessed through self-assessment, criterion-based and standardized tools using appropriate and specific criteria.

Curriculum differentiation for gifted and talented students requires more thought and work than simply combining a few activities. Curriculum differentiation should focus on thinking skills, abstract concepts, advanced content, interdisciplinary studies, and curriculum experiences that integrate content, process, and product (Renzulli, 1988). Therefore, integrating enrichment in content, process and product elements leads to more qualified results (Sak, 2012). It can be said that it is important to make differentiation and enrichment in the curriculum of gifted and talented students to increase the efficiency of their education. One of the lessons that require differentiation and enrichment is the Turkish curriculum.

The Turkish lesson basically includes four skills, namely listening and speaking skills acquired naturally and reading and writing skills acquired through instruction. Natural skills are acquired and developed more easily due to human nature. On the other hand, reading and writing skills based on writing are more difficult to acquire and take time to develop. Writing is a complex and difficult skill that requires effort. Writing skill, which is a learning field for Turkish lesson, is a skill that has a regulatory effect on mental processes as well as being a language skill (Çevik, 2021). Writing enables thoughts to be organized through mental processes, transferred into sentences and communicated. Through writing, thoughts are questioned, revised and reinterpreted. Writing skills develop students' mental, language and social skills. To develop writing skills, mental preparation is a prerequisite (Güneş, 2021).

Practices for developing writing skills are carried out within the framework of writing approaches. Two approaches, product-oriented and process-oriented, are generally prominent in writing education and practices (Kaldırım & Tavşanlı, 2021; Tabak & Göçer, 2013). The product-oriented writing approach focuses on the written expression product rather than the process in written expression studies (Kaldırım & Tavşanlı, 2021). This approach adopts a teacher-centered approach, ignores individual differences in the writing process, and attaches importance to formal elements in writing (Tabak & Göçer, 2013). On the other hand, the process-oriented writing approach requires students to have cognitive awareness in the writing process, to focus on the thinking process, and to organize each stage of the writing process. It provides students with independent thinking, problem solving, decision making and learning to learn skills (Karatay, 2013). In the process-oriented writing approach, the focus is on the process until the product emerges. In this approach, students are allowed to present and organize their thinking, decision-making, and feelings and thoughts about the stages of writing in fluently and logically (Karadağ-Yılmaz & Erdoğan, 2020). Therefore, the aim of the process-based writing approach is to eliminate writing barriers. The process-oriented

writing approach consists of preparation, drafting, revising, editing, and publishing/sharing stages (Tabak & Göçer, 2013). Teachers' adoption of a common writing approach at every stage of the writing process enables them to regularly monitor their written expression activities and make efficient evaluations. Through evaluations, students' deficiencies can be identified and correct guidance can be given to correct these deficiencies (Karatay, 2013).

With evaluation, it becomes possible to assess the aspects of the curriculum, collect information on issues related to the efficiency of the curriculum, draw conclusions from the data obtained, make decisions, and implement the decisions taken. Therefore, curriculum evaluation can be considered as the process of making decisions about the effectiveness, efficiency, consistency, adequacy, applicability, and executability of curriculum by using the stages of the scientific research process (Uşun, 2016). If there is a deficiency in the curriculum as a result of the implementation, evaluation is carried out to determine elements causing problems and to make corrections (Demirel, 2015). Curriculum evaluation can be designed and carried out according to which approach the curriculum to be evaluated is based on, what its main principles are, and what kind of individuals it wants to raise (Özdemir, 2009).

In the related literature, there are various classifications regarding curriculum evaluation models. For example, Fitzpatrick et al. (2019) categorize evaluation approaches into five groups: Objectives-oriented, management-oriented, expertise-oriented, consumer-oriented and participant-oriented. In addition to this classification, Aygören and Er (2018) also included an adversary-oriented approach and examined evaluation designs under six different models.

The "responsive evaluation" model, which is one of the participant-oriented evaluation models, was developed by Robert Stake in 1973. It can be said that this model is less formal, more pluralistic, and processes-focused than the models developed by Stake himself. This evaluation model differs from other models in that it has flexible, variable methods and approaches; it values pluralism; it is important to convey specific knowledge, theory, and details about the topic; case studies and qualitative methods used to understand the details of an event are important; the evaluation is comprehensive and reflects the whole complexity of the curriculum; evaluation reports are presented in a rich information network; the task of the evaluator is to mediate the person's ability to reach their own outcomes (Fitzpatrick et al., 2019). In Stake's responsive evaluation model, the effectiveness of the curriculum and the evaluation of the process are more important than the outputs. The evaluator should tell the

story of the curriculum, state what the characteristics of the curriculum are, describe who the participants are and what characteristics they have, highlight important issues and problems in the curriculum, and report achievements (Demirel, 2015; Sönmez & Alacapınar, 2015).

Stake's responsive evaluation model has 12 steps: "Talk with clients, program staff, and audiences; identify program scope; overview program activities; discover purposes and concerns; conceptualize issues and problems; identify data needs and issues; select observers, judges, and instruments, if any; observe designated antecedents, transactions and outcomes; thematize, prepare portrayals and case studies; validate, confirm, and attempt to disconfirm; winnow, format for audience use; assemble formal reports, if any" (Stake, 2011). These steps are described in the form of a clock, which indicates sensitivity and flexibility. Although the evaluator starts the evaluation at 12 and continues clockwise, Stake emphasized that any step can follow another step and the evaluator can move counterclockwise or diagonally at any point if the situation requires a change. In addition, many steps can be performed simultaneously and some of the steps can be performed more than once (Fitzpatrick et al., 2019). In the research, the reason why Stake's responsive evaluation model is preferred is that it considers the needs of the participants, it has a pluralistic and flexible perspective, case studies and qualitative methods are important, the evaluation is holistic, important issues and problems in the curriculum are highlighted, the effectiveness of the curriculum and the process are evaluated, and the evaluation report is comprehensive.

As can be understood from what has been written, the Turkish curriculum writing skills learning field is prepared for students studying in general education classes. However, there is a need for a differentiated Turkish curriculum writing skills for gifted and talented students. In the process of differentiating Turkish curriculum writing skills according to the learning characteristics and needs of gifted and talented students, it is not known how the curriculum elements will be differentiated. At this point, it is important to evaluate the Turkish curriculum writing skills learning field by taking the opinions of gifted and talented students. In this context, the aim of the research is to evaluate the 2019 Turkish curriculum writing skills learning field in terms of gifted and talented students. Within the scope of this purpose, an answer to the question "What are the opinions of gifted and talented students on the objectives, content, learning experiences, evaluation, positive and negative aspects and suggestions of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field?" is sought.

Method

Research Design

In this study, which evaluated the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field, a case study, one of the qualitative research methods, was used. Case studies are used to examine situations such as individual, group, organizational, social, and political issues that contribute to our knowledge. In other words, this method allows us to understand holistically the characteristics of real life events such as individual life cycles, small group behavior, neighborhood change, school performance, organizational and managerial processes, international relations, and the development of industries. The case study enables in-depth examination of a phenomenon or event based on how and why questions (Yin, 2009). In the research, "a holistic single case design", one of the case study designs, was used. In single case designs, there is an individual, an institution, a curriculum or a school (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2013). In this study, the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field was determined as a case and evaluated.

Participants

In studies based on qualitative research methods, purposive sampling methods that allow in-depth investigation of situations that are thought to have rich information are preferred. In this research, the study group was determined by using "criterion sampling" and "convenience sampling", among the purposive sampling methods. In convenience sampling, the researcher selects a situation that is close and easy to access. This method provides speed and practicality to the researcher. In criterion sampling, the group that meets the criteria determined by the researcher is studied (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2013). The sample of the research consisted of gifted and talented students fourth grade level in the Sincan region of Ankara province. The reason for this was that fourth grade students were thought to have a certain maturity in terms of writing skills at primary school level. Within the scope of the research, interviews were conducted with 21 volunteer students. While the number of female students participating in the research was 14, the number of male students was 7. All of the students were studying at a public school.

Data collection

A semi-structured interview form was developed by the researcher to be used in the evaluation phase of the 2019 Turkish curriculum writing skills learning field. To prepare the interview questions, the relevant literature was first reviewed. The prepared interview

questions were presented to three experts in the field of curriculum and instruction and one expert in the field of Turkish education. As a result of the evaluations of the experts, the final version of the interview forms was decided. The finalized interview questions were piloted with three students. It was determined that there were no questions that were not understood during the pilot application and the final version of the form was decided. The interview form included detailed questions about the evaluation of the curriculum's objectives, content, learning experiences and evaluation elements. The students were asked questions to determine the skills, feelings and thoughts gained by the students during the writing activities within the scope of the objective element; the topics learned, the level of attractiveness and difficulty of these topics, and their relationship with daily life within the scope of the content element; time allocated to writing activities, materials, methods and techniques used in the activities and communication process during activities within the scope of the learning experiences element; and the assessment methods and criteria of writing activities within the scope of the evaluation element. In addition, the students were asked questions to determine the aspects of the writing activities that were liked and found lacking and to determine the suggestions for the elements of the curriculum.

The data were obtained as a result of interviews with 21 volunteer students in April and May 2022. The interviews lasted approximately between 35 and 55 minutes and the data were collected by voice recording. The data within the scope of the research was collected and analyzed by applying the steps of Stake's responsive evaluation model. The procedures are presented below.

1) Talk with clients, program staff, and audiences: Interviews were conducted with the students to get information about the functioning of the curriculum. The general opinions of the students about the elements of the curriculum, the problems they experienced, their concerns and suggestions for the curriculum to be better were determined.

2) Identify program scope: When the related literature was examined, it was determined that no curriculum development study was conducted by evaluating the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field in terms of gifted and talented students and taking into account the results. Based on this deficiency, the scope of the curriculum evaluation study was determined.

3) Overview program activities: With the document analysis technique, the 2019 Turkish curriculum was examined in terms of objectives, content, learning experiences, and

measurement-assessment approach. An interview form was developed to determine the effectiveness of these elements.

4) Discover purposes and concerns: The opinions, concerns and problems related to the curriculum obtained as a result of the interviews with the students are given in the findings section of the research.

5) Conceptualize issues and problems: To conceptualize the issues and problems obtained regarding the curriculum, the data were analyzed by the content analysis method.

6) Identify data needs and issues: Within the scope of the evaluation model, the needs regarding the elements of the curriculum, the strengths and weaknesses of the curriculum and the suggestions for the curriculum were determined in detail.

7) Select observers, judges and instruments, if any: A semi-structured interview form was developed to collect data within the scope of the research. The form was finalized after the feedback of three experts in the field of curriculum and instruction and one expert in the field of Turkish education.

8) Observe designated antecedents, transactions and outcomes: The findings and results obtained were compared with the results of the research conducted in the past within the scope of the Turkish curriculum writing skills learning field. The data obtained in this research was supported by the results of previous research.

9) Thematize, prepare portrayals and case studies: The data obtained as a result of the interviews with the students were turned into codes, categories, and themes and presented in the findings section.

10) Validate, confirm, and attempt to disconfirm: To ensure the reliability of the data obtained, both the researcher and a different curriculum development expert coded the data. Reliability analysis was conducted to determine the consistency between the coders. In addition, the data were described in detail in order to transfer the research results to similar environments.

11) Winnow, format for audience use: The findings and results obtained as a result of the research were delivered to the students participating in the study and the data were confirmed.

12) Assemble formal reports, if any: The evaluation study was turned into a report to be presented to the readers and the related literature.

Data Analysis

In this study, content analysis was used to analyze the data. Content analysis aims to identify concepts and relationships that can explain the collected data. For this purpose, concepts are first obtained from the collected data, then the concepts obtained are organized, and themes explaining the data are obtained (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2013). The students' views on the 2019 Turkish curriculum writing skills were analyzed from a holistic perspective in terms of the elements of the curriculum, namely the objective, content, learning experiences and evaluation, the positive aspects, negative aspects and suggestions regarding the curriculum. As a result of the analyzes, codes, categories, and themes were obtained.

Validity and reliability

To increase the internal validity of the study, the researcher summarized the data collected immediately at the end of the data collection and asked the participants for their opinions on their accuracy. The data obtained from the interviews were described objectively by including direct quotations. The data were transferred by remaining faithful to their nature. To ensure external validity in the research, the process of developing the data collection tool, data collection, sampling group, data analysis, and interpretation process were explained from an objective point of view. The research report was presented in detail in order to transfer the research findings to other environments.

To ensure the internal reliability of the research, the interview questions were asked to all participants in the same way. The data were coded separately by both the researcher and a different curriculum development expert. An evaluation was made to see whether the findings, conclusions, and suggestions could be confirmed when the raw data were returned. To determine the consistency of opinion between the coders, the reliability formula suggested by Miles and Huberman (1994) as "Percentage of Agreement = Agreement / (Agreement + Disagreement) X 100" was used. As a result of the calculation, it was determined that the reliability of the study was 0.83. To ensure external reliability in the study, the researcher clearly stated her role. The students who participated in the study were coded between S1 and S21 so that their identities would not be revealed. The sampling method used to identify the students was explained in detail. To prevent the loss of the data obtained from the interviews with the students, the data were recorded on a voice recorder. Explanations on how the interviews were conducted were presented in detail. During the data analysis, data diversity was ensured by including the opposing opinions obtained from the students.

Role of the Researcher

The corresponding author of the research is a teacher at a science and art center in the Sincan region of Ankara province for four years. She taught the students constituting the study group of the research for two years. This situation allowed the study group to show more natural behaviors during the data collection process and to give more objective answers to the interview questions. In addition, the corresponding author of the research has been continuing her doctoral education in the field of curriculum and instruction. She has knowledge in the field of curriculum development and evaluation. The second and third authors of the research have been conducting studies both in the field of curriculum development and evaluation and in the field of gifted and talented.

Findings and Discussions

To evaluate the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field, interviews were conducted with students. Student opinions were analyzed under the headings of "objectives", "content", "learning experiences", "evaluation", "positive and negative aspects" and "suggestions". The findings obtained within the scope of the research are presented below.

Students' Opinions Related to the Objective Element of the Curriculum

In the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field, the "objectives" achieved by students are examined in three themes: "Cognitive aims", "affective aims" and "psychomotor aims". In the "cognitive aims" theme, the categories of "mental skills", "text analysis", "vocabulary" and "spelling rules" are obtained. In the "affective aims" theme, "positive attitude", "negative attitude" and "anxiety" categories are obtained. The categories of "writing skills" and "pencil holding skills" are obtained in the theme of "psychomotor aims". Codes and categories related to the themes are presented in Table 1.

Table 1 Codes, categories and themes related to the objective element of the curriculum

Theme	Category	Code	f
Cognitive aims	Mental skills	Development of imagination	7
		Increased knowledge related to the topics in Turkish lesson	6
		Development of thinking skills	2
		Enduring learning	1
		Research skills	1
	Text analysis	To be able to write text types according to their features	7
		To be able to understand text types	2
		To determine the topic and main idea of the text	2

	Vocabulary	To learn new vocabulary	5
		To be able to make a sentence	4
		To be able to speak fluently	1
	Spelling rules	Using punctuation marks correctly	2
		Using conjunctions correctly	2
Affective aims	Positive attitude	Being happy while writing	12
		Enjoy writing	8
		Feeling good about yourself	4
		Getting excited	3
	Negative attitude	Getting bored while writing	2
		Unwilling to write	2
	Anxiety	Worrying about not being able to understand the writing topic	7
		Fear of not being able to write	3
		Feeling of being disliked	3
		Difficulty in expressing feelings	1
Psychomotor aims	Writing skills	To be able to write beautifully	10
		Development of writing skill	9
		To be able to write fluently	1
	Pencil holding skills	To be able to hold the pen correctly	2
		Developing the skills of drawing a picture	1

Codes are obtained under the category of "mental skills" related to the "cognitive aims" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, students have stated that while doing writing activities, their imagination develop, their thinking skills improve, their knowledge of the topics in the Turkish lesson increase, permanent learning occur, and their research skills improve. Some of the student views are given below.

S9: "When I study or memorize something, I want to write it first. When I write it, it stays in my mind. When I read something and I write by looking at something, I am dreaming. Let's say I am writing a book, I write short something, it immediately comes to life in my mind."

S14: "It improves my imagination. I can make sense of sentences. It improves me to write adventurous stories. It improves my research more."

S16: "I will develop more if I become a writer or write a book. It improves my thinking. It helps me learn new things. It adds good things."

S18: "I learn new vocabulary and new mani. When I research their meaning, I learn their definition. I improve myself while writing a story."

Codes are obtained under the category of "text analysis" related to the "cognitive aims" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, students have stated that they can write text types, understand text types, and determine the topic and main idea of the text thanks to writing activities. Some of the student views are given below.

S2: "As I write, I can understand the feelings of the poet in the text or poem. As I write, my skill of finding the main idea has improved."

> *S7: "I learn how to develop the beginning and the end of stories. I learn how to connect parts of stories."*
> *S11: "How to write a story, how to write a fairy tale? It helps me to learn them."*
> *S13: "It improves me in terms of thinking and imagination. It improves me in writing essay."*
> *S19: "I improve in terms of writing beautifully. Reading, comprehension, finding main ideas and topics are improved."*

Codes are obtained under the category of "vocabulary" related to the "cognitive aims" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, students have stated that they learn new vocabulary, are able to make sentences, and speak fluently thanks to writing activities. Some of the student opinions are given below.

> *S7: "I learn new vocabulary. I can use vocabulary correctly when I need to write a text."*
> *S8: "I think that I have improved myself in the activities of writing poems, texts, and fables in terms of making sentence, using words correctly, and developing vocabulary. I think that my self-confidence improves when I read the texts I have written such as poems and stories."*
> *S15: "It improves my writing skills, helps me to make sentences and speak quickly."*

Codes are obtained under the category of "spelling rules" related to the "cognitive aims" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, students have stated that they are able to use punctuation marks and conjunctions correctly thanks to writing activities. The opinions of the students are given below.

> *S14: "I was forgetting punctuation marks and -too suffixes in my writing, it helped me to correct them."*
> *S20: "It helps me to write more correctly in spelling."*

Codes are obtained under the category of "positive attitude" related to the "affective aims" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, students have stated that they are happy, feel good, get excited, and enjoy writing while doing writing activities. Some of the student views are given below.

> *S11: "I enjoy writing articles, stories, poems, and anecdotes. I feel peaceful and happy."*
> *S13: "I am very happy, I like it. For example, if I read or write a story, I am looking forward to the end. It develops my sense of curiosity. I think about how to connect the events."*
> *S20: "When I write stories and poems, I think more about my memories. I like telling my memories very much. I like reading and writing activities very much."*

> *S21: "I feel as if I am writing my own life. I feel good while I write a diary. I feel happy because I express myself through writing. I also feel joy and happiness while I write fables and fairy tales."*

Codes are obtained under the category of "negative attitude" related to the "affective aims" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, students have stated that they do not want to write on topics that do not interest them and they are bored while doing writing activities. Some of the student views are given below.

> *S6: "I get bored when there are too many writing activities. It is good if it is enough not to force me."*
> *S18: "I don't like to write if I don't like the story at all."*
> *S19: "I sometimes experience feelings of boredom. I get bored when I write about topics that do not interest me."*

Codes are obtained under the category of "anxiety" related to the "affective aims" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, students have expressed that they are worried that they could not understand the writing topic, they are afraid that they could not write the given topic, they think that their writing will not be liked and they have difficulty expressing their feelings.

> *S2: "I worry that I will write incorrectly while writing."*
> *S7: "When a new topic comes, I sometimes get anxious because I don't know how to connect it."*
> *S8: "When I have no knowledge or idea about what I am going to write about, I get anxious that I will not be able to write."*
> *S12: "There are times when I get anxious. I worry about what I should add to the writing and what kind of narrative style I should apply. Actually, I worry if it will not be liked."*
> *S15: "I have difficulty in getting inspiration, I worry a lot."*
> *S20: "I sometimes get anxious. For example, when I write a memory, it might be difficult for me to express my feelings to the other person."*

Codes are obtained under the category of "writing skills" related to the "psychomotor aims" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, students have stated that their writing skills improve thanks to writing activities and that they could write beautifully and fluently. Some of the student views are given below.

> *S3: "Writing activities improve my imagination. It improves our hand to get used to writing more. Because the more our hand writes, the more we want to write."*
> *S6: "My writing improves, then I can write fast and I have learned."*
> *S11: "It improves my ability to write and express myself. I can feel like a writer when there are writing activities."*

S21: "Writing has improved me in every aspect. My patience in writing something has improved. It has improved my writing habit. It has improved my ability to write well and not to get bored while writing."

Codes are obtained under the category of "pencil holding skills" related to the "psychomotor aims" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, students have stated that they are able to hold the pencil correctly and their ability to draw picture has improved thanks to writing activities. Some of the student views are given below.

S1: "I improve my writing skills every day and write more beautifully. I can hold the pencil properly."
S5: "It contributes to improving my writing skills. In another way, it can improve my drawing skills. I can draw better because of my pencil hold."

Students' Opinions Related to the Content Element of the Curriculum

The "content" element of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field is analyzed in three themes: "Usefulness", "relevance to interests and needs" and "learnability". In the "usefulness" theme, three categories are obtained "writing text types", "using in out of school environments" and "using in evaluation activities". In the "relevance to interests and needs" theme, three categories are obtained "level of attractiveness", "interesting text types" and "interesting topics". In the "learnability" theme, two categories are obtained "current difficulty level" and "suggested difficulty level". Codes and categories related to the themes are given in Table 2.

Table 2 Codes, categories and themes related to the content element of the curriculum

Theme	Category	Code	f
Usefulness	Writing text types	Writing a letter	3
		Writing a poem	2
		Writing a diary	2
		Writing a petition	1
	Using in out of school environments	Sharing knowledge with family members	6
		Using learned vocabulary	5
		Helping your friends	3
		Use in games	3
		Using proverbs	2
		Transferring the main idea of the texts to their daily lives	1
	Using in evaluation activities	Answering questions	4
		Use when doing homework	3
		Use in exams	3
		Use in other lessons	1
		Use in competitions	1

Relevance to interests and needs	Level of attractiveness	The topics are mostly interesting	14
		The topics are partly interesting	4
		Topics are not of interest	3
	Interesting text types	Poem	10
		Story	9
		The fairy tale	7
		Fable	5
		Essay	5
		Anecdote	4
		Nursery rhyme	2
	Interesting topics	Topics related to living creatures	10
		National culture	10
		Topics related to values education	9
		Topics related to the environment	8
		Topics related to technology	6
		Biography from people's lives	5
		Topics to develop thinking skills	5
		Topics in history	5
		Topics in science	5
		Topics related to our world	4
		Topics related to space	4
		Diseases	2
		Topics related to daily life	2
Learnability	Current difficulty level	The level of topics is medium difficulty	11
		The level of topics is easy	8
		The level of the topics is difficult	2
	Suggested difficulty level	The level of the topics should be of medium difficulty	11
		The level of the topics should be difficult	7
		The level of topics should be easy	2

Codes are obtained under the category of "writing text types" related to the "usefulness" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, students have stated that they use what they have learned while writing letters, poems, diaries, and petitions in their daily lives. Some of the student views are given below.

> *S3: "For example, I need to write a letter to a person far away. I get information from what we do in lessons and I write accordingly. I write poems. I understand how the tones will be in poems and how the verses can fit together. Since we do it ourselves, the texts stay in my mind more."*
> *S5: "It is useful in writing activities such as writing poems and letters."*
> *S17: "I sometimes feel like writing something and I use it there. I use it for writing letters. I have a foreign friend abroad. I wrote a few letters to him. I sometimes keep a diary. I learned how to write a petition."*

Codes are obtained under the category of "using in out of school environments" related to the "usefulness" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, students have stated that they use what they have learned in writing activities while helping their friends, sharing their knowledge with family

members, using words and proverbs in accordance with their meanings, playing games and transferring the admonitions they have learned from the texts to their lives. Some of the student opinions are given below.

> *S10: "I mostly use the admonitions I have learned in stories and fairy tales. They correct people a little more. I use what I have learned more on the street. When I play with my friends, I respect them."*
> *S13: "When an event happens, I can use my imagination about how it happened, how it developed, and what it resulted in. I can transfer these to my friends. My stories are usually good. My brother consults me when he writes theatre texts and plays scripts. I use it in this way in daily life."*
> *S18: "Proverbs appear in the texts. I can use them in daily life such as "drop by drop becomes a lake", "strength comes from unity", "hide the straw and the time will come", and "the tree bends while it is young". I use the proverb "one hand has nothing and two hands have sound" a lot when I play games. I sometimes learn words I do not know, I use them. I have learned the meaning of manis I do not know."*
> *S20: "If a friend has written wrongly or if there are mistakes in my own writing, I correct them. What I have learned is useful, when I write to my mother, father, or brother."*

Codes are obtained under the category of "using in evaluation activities" related to the "usefulness" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, students have stated that they use what they have learned in writing activities while answering questions, doing homework, exams, other lessons, and competitions. Some of the student views are given below.

> *S9: "When I have difficulty with English words, I write four or five times. My writing becomes very good afterward. I can write the word."*
> *S11: "For example, I use what I have learned in the informative text when the teacher asks a question or to tell someone something. I share it with my siblings and my family. I transfer information to them. When they tell others, the information spreads."*
> *S14: "We organize story writing competitions as a class. I use it in competitions. I use it in my story writing homework. I can answer the questions asked by my teacher better."*
> *S19: "I use what I have learned, when I study for exams or when we have a written test on a story."*

Codes are obtained under the category of "level of attractiveness" related to "relevance to interests and needs" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, writing topics are interesting to most of the students, partially interesting to some of the students, and not interesting to some of the students. Some of the student opinions are given below.

> *S6: "We are given a text and asked what the topic of the text is. We try to find it. These do not interest me much."*
> *S15: "Sometimes I am interested, sometimes I am not. I am interested, when it is about microscopic creatures. Stories do not interest me."*

> *S17: "I am not interested. We love technology. I would like to have information about technology and games in the curriculum. I would like to write the rules of the game we design ourselves."*
> *S20: "I can say that the topics interest me. I like to write adventure stories and fables. I like to determine the topics and main ideas of the stories in the Turkish textbook or to write the stories in our notebooks. I learn more while writing."*

Codes are obtained under the category of "interesting text types" related to the "relevance to interests and needs" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, students have stated that writing activities in the types of anecdote, story, fairy tale, fable, nursery rhyme, poem, and essay attract their attention. Some of the student opinions are given below.

> *S2: "We wrote a science and technology poem, there was a nursery rhyme. I was very interested in them. There was a fable, the admonition we learned in the fable was very good. There was a fable about a hare and a tortoise. I was very interested in that."*
> *S4: "Story elements are given. We create new stories. I like that very much. I like acrostic poems, fairy tales, and fables very much."*
> *S11: "I am more interested in anecdotes and fairy tales in writing activities. For example, Nasreddin Hodja's anecdotes make us think, teach us an admonition and make us laugh. That is why I like anecdotes very much. Since fairy tales are more imaginative, my imagination develops and it is nice to read and listen to them."*
> *S21: "We wrote an essay about the Ramadan feast. I was very interested in it and I wrote it very lovingly. I am interested in poetry, fables, stories, and fairy tales."*

Codes are obtained under the category of "interesting topics" related to the "relevance to interests and needs" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, students have stated that topics related to environment, living creatures, values education, biography from people's lives, thinking skills, science, technology, diseases, history, national culture, world, space, and daily life are interesting. Some of the student opinions are given below.

> *S3: "There was one poem. It was about the pollution of the world. I wrote it in my notebook and on the computer. I am very interested in environmental problems and issues related to love in the world. The topics related to values and our national culture should be added to the curriculum. Atatürk's life, traditional features, traditional food, and traditional clothes should be added. In relation to values, topics about how people can be happy and how they can behave more properly should be added."*
> *S7: "I like to write about events that happen in myself and in the environment. I write about discrimination among people, and diseases. I write about the events of a girl's school life."*
> *S8: "I like topics related to nature, peace, friendship, and love. Topics such as technology addiction, art, nature, love of books, and love of homeland should be added."*
> *S10: "Essay and fairy tales are more interesting for children. I am more interested in the life of animals, the survival of animals, the life of scientists, extinct animals, and Ottoman history."*

S19: "I like more scientific things. For example, I like to write about space. I am also interested in art. I like to write about Leonardo da Vinci. Nature and universe topics interest me. I am also interested in national culture."

Codes are obtained under the category of "current difficulty level" related to the "learnability" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, half of the students have stated that the difficulty level of writing topics is at the medium level, almost half of the students have stated that it is at the easy level, and some of the students have stated that it is at the difficult level. Some of the student views are given below.

S3: "Writing activities are not difficult for me because I like writing. Writing activities can make us think more. When we immediately think of it, it is simple. When it is directed towards thinking, we both use our imagination more and we write longer and more beautiful information."
S5: "Writing activities are not difficult. In terms of difficulty level, it should be from easy to difficult and according to students' skills. It would be better to determine the level of students from easy to difficult. You should give homework according to them."
S7: "When I write, I have difficulty in detailed topics. For example, when I write something about a disease, I have difficulty because I have to write every detail of it."
S12: "I do not have difficulty in writing, I think it is easy. They do not give difficult topics in class."
S17: "In my opinion, the difficulty of writing activities is at medium level. If you prepare something above easy, students will like it. Make it a little below the middle."

Codes are obtained under the category of "suggested difficulty level" related to the "learnability" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, half of the students have stated that the difficulty level of the writing topics in the curriculum should be prepared at the medium level, almost half of the students have stated that it should be at the difficult level, and some of the students have stated that it should be at the easy level. Some of the students' opinions are given below.

S2: "In my opinion, writing topics should be more difficult. Because we are fourth grade students, we can understand some things better. Therefore, it should be at our level."
S8: "It might be better if you prepare the activities at a difficult level, we think more when we have difficulty."
S9: "Sometimes there are times when I write slowly. My hand hurts a lot. I want to leave it for two seconds and then I am late. It is a bit difficult for me. I think some people do not like to write a lot. For example, there are those who get tired like me when I write a little. Therefore, medium level is suitable for everyone."
S19: "Sometimes I have difficulty, sometimes I don't. I have difficulty in long topics. I do not have difficulty in short topics. I want it to be easy."

Students' Opinions Related to the Learning Experiences Element of the Curriculum

The "learning experiences" element of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field is analyzed in four themes: "Time", "tools and equipment", "methods and techniques" and "classroom environment". In the "time" theme, two categories are obtained "available time" and "suggested time". In the "tools and equipment" theme, two categories are obtained "available material" and "suggested material". In the "methods and techniques" theme, three categories are determined "individual teaching", "group teaching" and "writing techniques". In the "classroom environment" theme, two categories are obtained "communication with the teacher" and "communication with peers". Codes and categories related to the themes are given in Table 3.

Table 3 Codes, categories and themes related to the learning experiences element of the curriculum

Theme	Category	Code	f
Time	Available time	Less than 30 minutes is given	10
		More than 30 minutes are given	8
		Writing activities are given as homework	5
	Suggested time	More than 30 minutes should be given	15
		Less than 30 minutes should be given	5
Tools and equipment	Available material	Stationery materials	19
		Visual and audio material	7
		Written material	6
	Suggested material	Stationery materials	17
		Visual material	8
		Three-dimensional material	5
		Visual and audio material	2
		Written material	2
Methods and techniques	Individual teaching	Individual study	15
		Homework	5
	Group teaching	Dictation practice	7
		Drama	6
		Question and answer	5
		Narration	4
		Discussion	1
		Brainstorming	1
		Station	1
	Writing techniques	Group writing	5
		Creative writing	3
		Creating a story	3
		Free writing	2
		Text completion	1
Classroom environment	Communication with the teacher	Asking questions to the teacher about the written topic	17
		Teacher giving feedback	9
		Teacher giving reinforcement	5
	Communication with peers	Exchange ideas with friends	14
		Lack of effective communication process with friends	6

Codes are obtained under the category of "available time" related to the "time" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, half of the students have stated that writing activities are allocated less than 30 minutes, some of the students have stated that writing activities are allocated more than 30 minutes, and some of the students have stated that writing activities are given as homework. Some of the student opinions are given below.

> *S8: "We are given one lesson hour, that is 40 minutes. It is enough, but we sometimes may not think of something, it is better to think a lot. When nothing comes to mind, this time should be extended a little more."*
> *S16: "The teacher gives between 20 and 25 minutes. Those who finish early in this period explain with pictures. This time is enough for me."*
> *S19: "Actually, there is no specific time. The teacher usually gives homework. Actually, the time varies depending on the length of the type of writing. If the writing is long, the time should be long. If it is short, the time should be short. The time should be determined according to the type of writing."*

Codes are obtained under the category of "suggested time" related to the "time" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, while the majority of the students have stated that more than 30 minutes should be given to writing activities, some of the students have stated that less than 30 minutes should be given. Some of the student views are given below.

> *S3: "Since writing activities are usually left to the end, we write at home. When we do it at school, we are given between 5 and 10 minutes. I want to write more, but I cannot think of much in this time. Therefore, I can write a poem of one or two stanzas, or a text of one or two chapters. In fact, since writing activities are important, they should be given half a lesson hour. The time should be between 20 and 25 minutes."*
> *S15: "Give time according to students' personality and speed. I think at least 30 minutes should be given. Sometimes in between 20 and 25 minutes, you cannot fully express the emotion, the text is incomplete."*
> *S18: "If we give little time, the students may not write in a hurry. If we give too much time, they will say that we have too much time and we will write later. I think it is right at medium, that is, a maximum of 40 minutes should be given, at least 20 minutes can be given."*

Codes are obtained under the category of "available material" related to the "tools and equipment" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, students have stated that they use different types of pencils, paper, notebooks, erasers, dictionaries, books, computers, rulers, boards, and sharpeners in writing activities. Some of the student views are given below.

S9: "I look up words I do not know from the dictionary. I do not want to write the same words all the time. I want to write a different meaning of the word. When I use unlined paper, I need a ruler to avoid writing crookedly. If I want to draw something next to it, I use colored pencils."
S11: "We use a dictionary to look up the meaning of a word. We use tools such as tablets, computers and phones to do research at home. The teacher sometimes hangs it on the board, then we use A4 paper. If we write in our notebooks, we use lined paper."
S16: "We use textbooks, poem books, story books and smart boards."
S19: "I use pencil, notebook and eraser. If I want to draw a picture in the writing activity, I use crayons. I use a sharpener."

Codes are obtained under the category of "suggested material" related to the "tools and equipment" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, students have stated that different types of pencils, different types of papers, visuals on the topic, puppets, sample books, decoration materials, notebooks, rulers, erasers, glues, boards, cardboards, videos on the topic, computers, models, sharpeners, and scissors are necessary for writing activities. Some of the student opinions are given below.

S5: "With rulers, fancy objects, colored pencils and highlighters, we can keep what we write in our minds and our notebook also looks beautiful. You should keep crayons. You should have them write a text and then draw a picture related to that text. Both their drawing skills and their writing skills will improve."
S7: "There should be a visual, the students should write a story about that visual. There should be a device for research. There should be a special notebook for children, they should write in it. For example, there should be a silent film, they should write about it."
S11: "For example, there should be a model about a topic. For example, if we write something about birds, there should be models about birds or there should be visuals with the information written underneath. For example, the students should make things related to Turkish topics from papers and cartons, and hang them on the boards."
S15: "It should be colored pencils, books with pictures or just pictures. You should give examples of how to do it with pictures. There should be puppets, the lesson will be more fun and memorable."
S19: "There should be basic things in your classroom so that children can write. The type of writing should be fun. You should write topics that students will like. The writing should not be too long. There should be pencil, paper, notebook if the paper is not used, eraser, red pencil, sharpener, and other pencils."

Codes are obtained under the category of "individual teaching" related to the "methods and techniques" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, while the majority of the students have stated that they have carried out writing activities individually in the classroom, some of the students have stated that they do it as homework. Some of the student views are given below.

S8: "Our teacher tells us the topic and we write. We write alone for one lesson period. In the next lesson, we read what we have written. We tell what we have written and we sometimes act out what we have written."

S17: "Our teacher gives homework. We read the activities we do according to the seating order. If we design something, we show it and introduce it to our friends. We sometimes act out. Most of the time we do it individually."

S19: "When the teacher wants to explain a topic, he writes an informative text on the board. Then we write that topic in the notebook. We also do the beautiful writing activities in the book. Actually, we do not do it in groups in class, we usually do it individually. We usually do writing activities with homework."

Codes are obtained under the category of "group teaching" related to the "methods and techniques" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, students have stated that they use drama, narration, question and answer, dictation, discussion, brainstorming, and station techniques while doing writing activities. Some of the student views are given below.

S2: "Our teacher tells us the topic, event, character, place, and time. We write the stories in our notebooks or on paper according to them. She sometimes writes them on the blackboard and she sometimes reads them. We write them in our notebooks. We practice dictation."

S5: "For example, if the teacher asks us to make a theatre about animals, we act it out and then write it down. The teacher does question and answer, where we do not understand, he selects a few people and does modelling."

S10: "We share ideas because our class is talkative. For example, I say that I make the story like this, do you have an idea or should we add it? We write articles in our own way. We write our own ideas. The teacher gives us a topic. We write according to our imagination."

S16: "At first, the teacher tells us the topic and then tells us how to do it. He gives us a certain topic from the book and we write articles. We use stations in groups. He changes stations every five minutes. If I am in the poster station first, then I move to the poetry station. For example, on human rights, one group writes a poem, another group makes a poster and the other one group draws a picture."

Codes are obtained under the category of "writing techniques" related to the "methods and techniques" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, it is determined that students use group writing, creative writing, free writing, and text completion techniques while doing writing activities. Some of the student opinions are given below.

S3: "The teacher gave a topic about the forest week, we wrote a poem of two or three stanzas with it. He made us write a text about being disabled, which he left to our own imagination. I wrote something of one or two pages."

S9: "The teacher writes half of the text on the blackboard and tells us to complete the rest. He sometimes gives a topic and tells us to write about it. We also do writing activities in groups. For example, when the teacher wants us to write a difficult topic, we do it in

groups of two, three, or four students. He wants us to think on our own when we write acrostic poems."

S14: "We usually write in groups. Our groups are five or six people. The teacher sometimes gives the topic to the group, she sometimes asks us to determine the topic as a group. We write according to our imagination."

Codes are obtained under the category of "communication with the teacher" related to the "classroom environment" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, students have stated that they ask questions to their teachers during writing activities and the teachers give reinforcement and feedback. Some of the student views are given below.

S9: "Let's say the writings are a little illogical, the teacher does not want to offend us too much. He says that you can think a little more. We have a sticker chart. He gives stickers for the good behaviors we do. If we pass the 30th grade, he gives us a gift. If we do well, he congratulates us and gives us stickers."

S13: "When our stories are finished, our teacher tells us to take them to her and read them. She sometimes comes and reads our stories before they are finished and gives her opinions. She says things like it is good or you can remove this or add this. I ask them if we have any questions. For example, after writing the introduction of our story, I ask how I can write the development or conclusion section."

S20: "We ask our teacher what the topic and main idea will be. She tells us which topic our story or fable is about. She can also give another topic to those who write poems."

Codes are obtained under the category of "communication with peers" related to the "classroom environment" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, while more than half of the students have stated that they exchange ideas about the topic they write with their friends during the writing activities, some of the students have stated that they do not have an effective communication process with their friends. Some of the student views are given below.

S13: "We look at each other's stories and tell our ideas. We tell what they can add and what can happen next."

S15: We give ideas to our friends about how we can write, and how we can decorate it. They say that if you write paragraph by paragraph, it will be clearer and you can see what you write more easily, you can read it more easily".

S16: "Everyone has their own book. Everyone writes their own answer. In class discussions, students think a little bit. Then they raise their fingers when they think of something. The one chosen by the teacher gets up and says her opinion. Everyone says their own opinion. There is not much discussion among ourselves, we do not communicate. When we do not understand, we ask our teacher."

S19: "We do not ask our friends many questions. We do not work in groups. If we did activities in groups, we would ask. Only when we move on to a new topic, the teacher makes us write in the notebook. We usually do writing activities at home."

Students' Opinions Related to the Evaluation Element of the Curriculum

The "evaluation" element of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field is examined in two themes: "Assessment type" and "post writing stage". In the "assessment type" theme, two categories are obtained "traditional assessment" and "alternative assessment". In the "post-writing stage" theme, two categories are obtained "correction" and "sharing". The codes and categories related to the themes are given in Table 4.

Table 4 Codes, categories and themes related to evaluation element of the curriculum

Theme	Category	Code	f
Assessment type	Traditional assessment	Multiple choice exam	1
		Verbal exam	1
	Alternative assessment	Peer assessment	12
		Self-assessment	3
Post writing stage	Correction	In terms of topic and content	15
		In terms of spelling and punctuation	7
		In terms of language and expression	6
		In terms of form	5
	Sharing	Presenting the text	12

Codes are obtained under the category of "traditional assessment" related to the "assessment type" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, some of the students have stated that writing activities are evaluated by exams. Student opinions are presented below.

S1: "After the writing activities, we can do what we have learned very well in mock exams. In the mock exams, they may ask questions such as whether this is an anecdote, a fairy tale, a story, a fable, or a poem. We are able to answer these questions thanks to writing activities."
S21: "The teacher makes them take the verbal exam. He asks questions one by one. When there are words we do not know, we look them up in the dictionary and read them one by one. For example, there were words I did not know in the essay we wrote. I found the word in the dictionary and read it. Our teacher asked us to produce questions from there. We solved the problems in that question."

Codes are obtained under the category of "alternative assessment" related to the "assessment type" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, while half of the students have stated that peer assessment is used in the evaluation of writing activities, some of the students have stated that self-assessment is used. Some of the student views are presented below.

> *S3: "After the activities, we read our poems to each other and share them with our teacher. We discuss what we add to the poem and what is unnecessary in the poem. We talk and comment on these issues. We usually look at the titles and the harmonies between paragraphs."*
> *S14: "We write the story and finish it. Before showing it to the teacher, if we have spelling mistakes, if we forget to write a sentence, we correct them. If the visuals are incomplete, we complete them. Our friends say that you should have done the visuals like this, you should have written the story here on other topics. They give opinions about the characters."*
> *S20: "How can it be better, is this good, is this lacking, what else can we do? We discuss these. Our teacher wants us to develop our imagination. I like it when my friends express my mistakes. Because I may be a columnist in the future. Therefore, it is good for me to see my mistakes."*

Codes are obtained under the category of "correction" related to the "post-writing stage" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, students have stated that writing activities are evaluated in terms of topic and content; spelling rules and punctuation; language and expression; and form. Some of the student views are presented below.

> *S4: "When we use some words in the wrong place, the teacher says that it would be more effective if you used that word in another place. For example, there is a very well-known word, if we used it, the expression would be much better. She pays attention to such things. Is it relevant to the topic? She looks at these things."*
> *S10: "When writing a poem, the teacher looks more at the main emotion. When writing a fairy tale, is it more appropriate to the topic or not? She evaluates accordingly. If you write one or two lines on a topic or you go out of the topic, then your writing is bad."*
> *S11: "The teacher points out the good aspects of our text and the semantic errors in the sentence. She says that the writing is better if we explain the narration style and the topic comprehensively. For example, if we write two sentences, she says that you should have made it a little longer. She evaluates the introduction, development, and conclusion sections. For example, do we write a sentence suitable for the introduction, do we write sentences suitable for the development, or do we connect the conclusion with the admonition we learned? She evaluates them."*
> *S14: "If we have deficiencies, the teacher tells us our deficiencies. If we do not have deficiencies, he says that it is good and hangs it on the board. He evaluates by looking at spelling mistakes, punctuation marks, topic, and main idea. He tells us to improve the topic a little more, improve your imagination, write a little longer, and improve the visuals a little more".*
> *S18: "The teacher tells us to write at least two paragraphs or at least four paragraphs. She looks at them. She looks at the beauty of our writing. Do we have spelling mistakes? She looks at it."*

Codes are obtained under the category of "sharing" related to the "post-writing stage" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, half of the students have stated that they present their study after completing the writing activities. Some of the student views are presented below.

S6: "We raise our fingers and the student selected by the teacher reads his/her writing. If there are any mistakes, the teacher tells us to correct them. For example, once we were given a proverb. She told us to write down what it could mean. Everyone wrote it down, and if the teacher found a mistake, she corrected it."

S7: "We read in class. The teacher says that it is good or you should continue. If there is a different topic or a different emotion transition, our teacher likes them. She looks at where the time passes. If it is in the present or past tense, we use it accordingly.

S15: "The teacher collects what we have written and gives them back to us after a few days. We go up to the board and read them, determine our mistakes, and be more careful next time. Our teacher tells us our mistakes. When she sees a mistake while distributing the text, she says that you can correct this. If we read fast, she says that you should read slowly, it is better understood."

Students' Opinions Related to the Positive and Negative Aspects of the Curriculum

The "positive and negative aspects" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field is examined in two categories "strengths" and "weaknesses". Codes and categories related to the theme are presented in Table 5.

Table 5 Codes and categories related to the "positive and negative aspects" theme of the curriculum

Theme	Category	Code	f
Positive and negative aspects	Strengths	Allowing to write different types of texts	9
		Being interesting of the given topic	9
		Allowing to analyze texts	3
		Providing the opportunity to enrich texts with visuals	3
		Teaching new words	2
		Developing imagination	1
	Weaknesses	Inadequate writing activities	8
		Being not attractive of the activities	5
		Not providing enough information about the activities	4
		Dislike of dictation activities	3
		Unknown or incomprehensible topic matter	3
		Spelling and punctuation errors	3
		Not using different writing methods	2
		Insufficient space allocated for writing	2
		Writing activities are not related to the unit	1
		Repeated statements	1
		Inadequate evaluation	1

Codes are obtained under the category of "strengths" related to the "positive and negative aspects" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, while almost half of the students like the aspects that the curriculum allows them to write different types of texts and that the topics are interesting, some of the students like the aspects that the curriculum allows them to analyze the texts,

provides the opportunity to enrich the texts with visuals, teaches new words and develops imagination. Some of the student opinions are presented below.

> *S3: "I like the parts that develop our imagination more and require us to use our imagination more."*
> *S5: "I like poem sections, stories, and puppet plays like Karagöz and Hacivat. I have an interest in these. There are pictures, I try to draw them, it is very nice."*
> *S7: "In the book, they tell us to write a story. When we write that part in the notebook, the topics they give attract my attention. I write inspired by the texts they give me, I like the texts."*
> *S10: "In writing activities, I like determining the topic and main emotion of the text more. You can write not only one title but also the title you think of yourself. I also like this."*
> *S20: "It is good for me when we write a poem and a story about a topic. I like that it encourages us to search for words we do not know and look them up in the dictionary. We are given space in the book to write stories and poems I like and we write them there. I like this very much, it means that they value our ideas. I also like to find topics and main ideas."*

Codes are obtained under the category of "weaknesses" related to the "positive and negative aspects" theme of 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, while almost half of the students have stated that the writing activities in the curriculum are insufficient, some of the students have stated that the activities are not interesting, there is not enough information about the activities, dictation activities are not liked, different writing methods are not used, there are spelling and punctuation errors, unknown or incomprehensible topics are included, the spaces allocated for writing are insufficient, writing activities are not related to the unit, there are repetitive explanations and the evaluation is insufficient. Some of the student opinions are presented below.

> *S3: "Sometimes a comma can be put instead of a dot or there can be uppercase and lowercase mistakes. There may be words that do not fit each other. There may be too many gaps between sentences and the meaning of that text or poem is spoilt. I think activities should be increased. I would be very happy if there was a short writing activity between one or two activities. There are not usually activities related to the topics in the unit. For example, our theme is national culture, but there are things related to the outside world instead of local things. I would like the main topic in that unit to be added."*
> *S5: "Information that is explained in the text is explained again underneath. This makes me very angry. It is already explained in brackets, why is it explained again underneath?"*
> *S13: "There is usually one writing activity in each unit, I would like to see more writing. We are only given a topic, but I would like to be given a story and told to come up with appropriate titles and what we can add to it. It would be very nice if they gave us the introduction part of the story and we wrote the rest."*
> *S15: "Instead of being given a blank paper, it is given like the writing correction places in first grade. I find it difficult to write there because there is a perception that I have to fit it there. Instead of giving small boxes, I should be given an activity space. I would like it more and write more easily. For example, we wrote a poem and the stanzas of the poem*

did not fit in the space provided. Writing activities are not enough, it is given less space than necessary."
S17: "One poem is given. It says to write that poem on the right. I do not like it. It is already written, why are we writing it again? It would be more meaningful if there were questions about the poem."
S21: "It briefly moves on to the next topic without explaining one topic. There is not much evaluation. There are words we do not know, we cannot find them in the dictionary."

Students' Opinions Related to the Suggestions of the Curriculum

The "suggestions" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field is examined in four categories: "Suggested objectives", "suggested content", "suggested learning experiences" and "suggested evaluation". Codes and categories related to the theme are presented in Table 6.

Table 6 Codes and categories related to the "suggestions" theme of the curriculum

Theme	Category	Code	f
Suggestions	Suggested objectives	Developing writing skills	16
		Developing imagination	7
		Teaching new information about the topics of Turkish lesson	7
		To teach basic information about text types	5
		Developing sentence making skills	4
		Developing the ability to inquiry	4
		Teaching information about punctuation and spelling rules	3
		Teaching new vocabulary	3
		Developing expression skills with visuals	3
		Developing self-expression skills	2
		Developing research skills	2
		Developing presentation skills	2
		Developing comprehension skills	2
		Developing communication skills	1
		Developing creativity	1

Suggested content	Writing topics in different text types (Fable, f=12; poem, f=9; story, f=8; informative text, f=7; anecdote, f=6; fairy tale, f=4; theatre, f=5; nursery rhyme, f=3; essay, f=3; comics, f=3; caricature, f=1)	21
	Topics related to the life of living creatures (Life of animals, f=8; protection of animals, f=4; characteristics of animals, f=3; endangered animals, f=2; living creatures in water, f=2; life of plants, f=1)	20
	Topics related to values education (Love, f=5; friendship, f=4; helpfulness, f=3; patriotism, f=3; respect, f=1; justice, f=1; honesty, f=1; responsibility, f=1)	19
	Topics related to our culture (National struggle, f= 6; national culture, f=5; child games, f=3; Atatürk's life, f=2)	16
	Issues related to nature (Protection of nature, f=6; environmental pollution, f=4; forests, f=3)	13
	Topics related to the world and the universe (Space and astronomy, f=6, planets, f=4; fossils, f=1)	11
	Topics related to technology (Conscious use of technology, f=4; change of technological products from past to present, f=3, benefits and harms of technology, f=2; features of technological devices, f=2)	11
	Topics related to science (Life of scientists, f=5; inventions of scientists, f=3)	8
	Topics related to daily life	3
	Topics related to family relationships	2
	Topics related to art	2
	Topics related to professions	1
	Topics related to sport	1
Suggested learning experiences	Questions about the text	13
	Explaining the text with pictures	10
	Finding the topic and main idea of the text	7
	Activities for teaching the meaning of words	4
	Summarization activities	4
	Dramatizing the text	4
	Creating three-dimensional designs related to the text	3
	Finding a title for the text	2
	Designing a poster with Web 2 tools	1
	Completing unfinished text	1
	Rewriting the text in a different text type	1
	Activities related to spelling and punctuation	1
Suggested evaluation	Assessment of punctuation and spelling rules	14
	Assessment of the expression of the topic and the main idea	9
	Assessment of the beauty of the writing	8
	Assessment of the use of words and sentences	6
	Assessment of the harmonization of the text sections	4
	Open-ended questions	4
	Assessment of the harmonization of the title with the topic	3
	Peer assessment	3
	Self-assessment	2
	Assessment of the spelling of suffixes	2
	Matching questions	1
	True-false questions	1

Codes are obtained under the category of "suggested objectives" related to the "suggestions" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, while most of the students have stated that their writing skills

should be improved, almost half of the students have stated that their imagination should be developed and new information about the topics of the Turkish lesson should be taught. On the other hand, some of the students have stated that information about text types, and punctuation and spelling rules should be taught; new words should be taught; inquiry, making sentence, expression with visuals, self-expression, research, presentation, comprehension, communication skills and creativity should be developed. Some of the student opinions are presented below.

> *S3: "Forming with visuals or colors and writing texts from them should be added. Apart from these features, I would like it to provide me more information that can open to the world of imagination. I would like it to develop my creativity."*
> *S8: "Improving writing skills, learning new words, adding new words to our vocabulary, and using these words correctly in sentences should be gained."*
> *S11: "How can a story and informative text be written? You should help them understand these better. For example, narrative skills should be developed while writing a story. How are the introduction, development and conclusion sections connected to each other? This should be taught."*
> *S17: "Give research homework to students. When you give poem writing homework, tell them how to write the poem and then give it to them. Teach things like writing skills, spelling rules, and correct writing. I would like them to be given homework related to technology. I would like them to improve their slide preparation skills."*
> *S20: "More often spelling and grammar rules are not paid attention to. It would be better to improve in this matter. It would be better to develop our imagination and express ourselves. It would be more effective to act out the activities and stories. I would like to write my feelings more effectively and clearly. I think my friends would also like to improve in this aspect. I would like you to develop the curriculum in this aspect."*

Codes are obtained under the category of "suggested content" related to the "suggestions" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, students have stated that texts should be written in the types of fable, poem, story, informative text, anecdote, fairy tale, theatre, nursery rhyme, essay, comics, and caricature. The students have stated that the text topics should be space and astronomy, planets, fossils, national struggle, national culture, Atatürk's life, child games, love, friendship, helpfulness, patriotism, respect, justice, honesty, responsibility, conscious use of technology, change of technological products from past to present, benefits and harms of technology, features of technological tools, life of scientists, inventions of scientists, life of animals, protection of animals, characteristics of animals, endangered animals, living creatures in water, life of plants, protection of nature, environmental pollution, forests, issues related to daily life, family relations, arts, sports, and professions. Some of the student opinions are presented below.

S11: "It should be about our culture, Karagöz and Hacivat, Nasreddin Hodja, nature, animals, technology, the life of the inventors of an invention, how those inventors made efforts to make that invention, how an invention has changed from the past to the present, what life is like in nature, and forests. It would be better if we learn about our own culture, we will encounter it in our lives."

S12: "There should be texts from which admonition can be learned and meaning can be inferred. There should be topics related to family and friend relations. For example, it should be the right choice of friends. There should be a text about space. There should be planets. There should be instructive and informative texts. There should be texts describing the characteristics of animals."

S18: "I like to write informative texts. You should write texts appropriate to the level of the students. They can write poems, fables or texts. There should be topics about the benefits and harms of technology, products used in the past, important materials we use in our daily lives, professions, animals, environmental cleaning and the protection of nature. For example, they should research and write about the giraffe. They learn the properties of animals."

S19: "There should be anecdotes, interesting and informative texts. There should be general history topics and our national culture. There should be about mechanics. There should be the operation, construction, and properties of a tool. There should be topics about the science, space, nature, the life of living creatures, oceans, seas, fish, and animals."

S21: "I would like to write texts on fables, poems, and nursery rhymes. I would like science and technology topics to be added. I would like nature and universe topics. National struggle and the life of Atatürk should be the topic. There should be topics about forests and animal life. You should write the chronological order of the Battle of Sakarya. You should write the introduction of our foods and clothes as national culture."

Codes are obtained under the category of "suggested learning experiences" related to the "suggestions" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, while most of the students have stated that there should be activity questions related to the text, almost half of the students have stated that there should be activities for explaining the text with pictures, and finding the topic and main idea of the text. Some of the students have stated that there should be activities for teaching the meaning of words, creating a three-dimensional design for the text, finding a title for the text, summarization, dramatizing the text, designing a poster with Web 2 tools, completing the unfinished text, rewriting the text in a different text type, and spelling and punctuation. Some of the student opinions are presented below.

S10: "Not only writing is available but also activities are available. For example, you should have them write a story about a topic and have them paint about the hero of the story. There should be poster design from Canva. You should write a story or an informative text about a plant. You should plan to grow that plant as a class."

S13: "Activities such as writing and answering questions according to the story; summarizing the story briefly or writing the main idea; completing the unfinished story; and turning the story into a fable or poem should be developed."

S19: "There should be one or two questions about the activity. There should be activities related to filling in the gaps and punctuation marks in the same text."

S20: "There should be questions about the topic of a story and the values it brings us. You should ask them to research unfamiliar words, and write sentences or stories about them. They should be asked to draw pictures and make projects. You should have them make models that tell the story. It will be more effective to act out the activities and stories."

Codes are obtained under the category of "suggested evaluation" related to the "suggestions" theme of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field. Within the scope of these codes, while most of the students have stated that attention should be paid to punctuation and spelling rules while evaluating writing activities, almost half of the students have stated that the way the topic and main idea are given and the beauty of the writing should be looked at during the evaluation. Some of the students have stated that the evaluation should be done with open-ended questions, matching, true-false, self-assessment, and peer assessment. Some of the students have stated that while evaluating the writing activities, attention should be paid to the correct use of words and sentences, the harmony of the text sections with each other, the harmony of the title with the topic, and the correct spelling of the suffixes. Some of the student opinions are presented below.

S3: "Time should be given when everyone's activity is finished. The students should read what they have written and should be told what is missing or redundant in their writing. If the meaning is distorted when the plural suffix is added or omitted, those issues should be corrected. In texts or poems, I would like the parts to be connected to each other and mistakes to be corrected. The connections between sentences and paragraphs should be checked."

S4: "There should be questions. You might make spelling mistakes in some places, students correct them. You should do true-false in the book. You should ask them to decide on a different ending for the text."

S7: "Attention should be paid to the main idea, main thought, and topic. Attention should be paid to emotional transitions, spelling rules, and the connection of the introduction, development and conclusion sections."

S12: "What has this study contributed? This should be evaluated. The use of words such as but and yet, and the comprehensiveness of the text should be examined. It should be checked whether punctuation marks have been paid attention to. You should check the narrative style, and the use of words in the right place."

S16: "You should check whether the title is appropriate, whether the picture is relevant to the topic, whether the writing is beautiful, and whether the text type is appropriate for the level of the student. You should check that a question mark should not be put in a place to put an exclamation."

<div align="center">**Conclusions and Suggestions**</div>

The conclusions and suggestions reached within the scope of the research are presented below.

Conclusions Related to the Objective Element of the Curriculum

When the curriculum is considered in terms of the "objectives" element, the students have stated that they develop their imagination and thinking skills, increase their knowledge of the topics in the Turkish lesson, provide permanent learning, develop research skills, understand and write text types, and determine the topic and main idea of the text within the scope of 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills. In addition, the students have stated that thanks to the curriculum, they learn new words, are able to make sentences, speak fluently, use punctuation marks and conjunctions correctly, improve their writing skills, write beautifully and fluently, hold the pencil correctly while writing, and improve their ability to draw pictures. Other results obtained within the scope of the research are that students are happy, feel good, get excited, and enjoy writing while doing writing activities. On the other hand, it is determined that the students do not want to write on topics that do not interest them and get bored while doing writing activities, they are worried that the writing topic will not be understood, they are afraid that they will not be able to write on the given topic, they are worried that what they write will not be liked, and they have difficulty in expressing their feelings. In this context, it is determined that students experience anxiety and concern during writing activities. There are studies in the literature that students experience writing anxieties. In the study conducted by Ateş and Akaydın (2015), it is seen that the writing anxiety of secondary school students is at a moderate level. In the study conducted by Yıldız and Ceyhan (2016), it is identified that the writing anxiety of primary school fourth grade students is at a moderate level. In the study conducted by Yılmaz (2019), it is determined that secondary school students experience writing anxiety due to the anxiety of being evaluated by others, having difficulty in determining the topic, and experiencing lack of self-confidence. In the study conducted by Bozgün (2022), it is observed that the writing anxiety levels of primary school fourth grade students are at a moderate level.

In the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field, the students have emphasized that "the suggested objectives" should develop writing skills and imagination; teach new information about the topics of the Turkish lesson; teach information about text types, punctuation and spelling rules; teach new words; develop creativity, inquiry, sentence-making, expression with visuals, self-expression, research, presentation,

comprehension, and communication skills. In this context, students have emphasized the necessity of including objectives that develop writing skills and higher-order thinking skills more and teach knowledge within the scope of Turkish lesson in the curriculum. These results of the research are similar to the results of the studies conducted by Karacaoğlu et al. (2021), Barası and Erdamar (2021), Dilekçi (2022), Kaplan and Demir (2023). In the research conducted by Karacaoğlu et al. (2021), it is concluded that the eighth grade Turkish textbook is relatively sufficient in terms of the writing activities in the Turkish textbooks to provide students with writing skills, but the fifth, sixth and seventh grade textbooks are not fully sufficient for the development of writing skills. It is also concluded that writing activities in Turkish textbooks should include all the objectives in the curriculum equally in order to improve students' writing skills. In the study conducted by Barası and Erdamar (2021), teachers have stated that the Turkish curriculum should give more weight to skills such as critical thinking, learning to learn, and creative thinking; the number of objectives should be reduced and applicability should be increased; the objectives should be distributed evenly according to grade levels and should be updated. In the study conducted by Dilekçi (2022), teachers have stated that the words aimed to be taught to students should be determined and these should be planned according to grade levels and included in the texts in Turkish textbooks. In the study conducted by Kaplan and Demir (2023), it is suggested that the 2019 Turkish curriculum should be revised in terms of providing higher-order thinking skills and the objectives related to language skills should be increased.

Conclusions Related to the Content Element of the Curriculum

When the curriculum is considered in terms of the "content" element, it is determined that while the writing topics are interesting to most of the students, the topics are not interesting to some of the students within the scope of 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills. Among the interesting topics, there are topics related to environment, living creatures, values education, biography from people's lives, thinking skills, science, technology, diseases, history, national culture, world, space, and daily life. In addition, writing activities in the types of anecdotes, stories, fairy tales, fables, nursery rhymes, poems, and essays are found to attract the students' interest. Accordingly, it is concluded that students use what they have learned in Turkish lessons in their daily lives while writing letters, poems, diaries and petitions; they use what they have learned while helping their friends, sharing their knowledge with family members, using words and proverbs in accordance with their meanings, playing games, transferring the admonitions they have learned from the texts to

their lives, answering questions, doing homework, exams, other lessons, and competitions. Regarding the difficulty level of these topics, half of the students have stated that they are at the medium level, almost half of the students have said that they are at the easy level and some of the students have mentioned that they are at the difficult level. In this context, it can be said that the writing topics in the curriculum are relatively suitable for the level of students. These results of the study are similar to the results of the research conducted by Direkçi et al. (2019), Özdemir and Akkaya (2020), Karacaoğlu et al. (2021). In the study conducted by Direkçi et al. (2019), when the activities in the 2018 Turkish lesson curriculum fifth, sixth, seventh, and eighth grade textbooks are examined, it is found that the objectives belong to a grade level above or below the grade level in some activities. In the study conducted by Özdemir and Akkaya (2020), when the 2019 Turkish lesson curriculum is evaluated in terms of text type, it is determined that three types of texts, namely narrative, informative and poetry, are generally used in the curriculum and that there are explanations for the narrative text type the most. In the study conducted by Karacaoğlu et al. (2021), it is suggested that writing activities in Turkish textbooks should be prepared by taking into account the basic characteristics of students such as age and development levels as well as values education and students' affective, cognitive and psycho-social development processes. In addition, it is concluded that writing activities belonging to different text types are included in Turkish textbooks.

In the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field, the students have emphasized that "the suggested content" should include texts in the types of fables, poems, stories, informative texts, anecdotes, fairy tales, theatres, nursery rhymes, essays, comics, and caricature. Accordingly it is concluded that the topics of these texts should be related to space and astronomy, planets, fossils, national struggle, national culture, Atatürk's life, child games, love, friendship, helpfulness, patriotism, respect, justice, honesty, responsibility, conscious use of technology, change of technological products from past to present, benefits and harms of technology, features of technological tools, life of scientists, inventions of scientists, life of animals, protection of animals, characteristics of animals, endangered animals, living creatures in water, life of plants, protection of nature, environmental pollution, forests, issues related to daily life, family relations, arts, sports, and professions. In this context, it is useful to prepare the text types and topics in the curriculum according to the interests and needs of the students. Regarding the difficulty level of these topics, half of the students have stated that they should be prepared at the medium level,

almost half of the students have said that they should be prepared at the difficult level, and some of the students have mentioned that they should be prepared at the easy level. Therefore, it is concluded that the writing skills curriculum should be developed in accordance with the developmental level of the students. These results of the study are similar to the results of the studies conducted by Barası and Erdamar (2021), Karacaoğlu et al. (2021), Dilekçi (2022). In the study conducted by Barası and Erdamar (2021), teachers have stated that the Turkish lesson curriculum should be suitable for the interest and age of the students, include distinguished examples of Turkish and world literature, and have content equipped with national and moral values. They have stated that the content of the Turkish curriculum should include interesting, diverse and colorful texts for the development of 21st century skills. In the study conducted by Karacaoğlu et al. (2021), it is shown that writing activities in Turkish textbooks should be designed in a more qualified and gradual developmental way. It is also concluded that Turkish textbooks should include more narrative texts and poem writing activities. In the study conducted by Dilekçi (2022), teachers have stated that the texts in Turkish textbooks should have high literary quality; be compatible with the unit, important days and weeks; be entertaining, instructive, guiding, appropriate to our culture, and develop high-level thinking. Teachers also have emphasized that Turkish textbooks should include different types of texts.

Conclusions Related to the Learning Experiences Element of the Curriculum

When the curriculum is considered in terms of the "learning experiences" element, while the majority of the students have emphasized that the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills activities are mostly done individually in the classroom, some of the students have stated that writing activities are given as homework. While half of the students have said that less than 30 minutes are given to the writing activities at school, some of the students have mentioned that more than 30 minutes are given. In this context, it can be said that the time given to the writing activities is insufficient. It is concluded that drama, narration, question and answer, dictation, discussion, brainstorming, station, group writing, creative writing, free writing, and text completion methods and techniques are used during writing activities. Accordingly, it is determined that the variety of methods and techniques used in writing activities is insufficient. During the writing activities, it is also identified that students exchange ideas with their friends about the topic they write about, ask questions to their teachers and teachers give reinforcement and feedback. On the other hand, some of the students have stated that they do not have an effective communication process with their

friends during the writing activities. In this context, it is useful to increase communication and sharing in the classroom environment to increase the effectiveness of the lesson. Visual and audio materials, stationery materials, and written materials are found to be used during writing activities. It is determined that visual and three-dimensional materials, which increase students' motivation during the lesson, are not used effectively during the activity. These results of the research are similar to the results of the studies conducted by Susar-Kırmızı and Akkaya (2009), Özdemir and Akkaya (2020), Barası and Erdamar (2021), Arcagök (2021), Karacaoğlu et al. (2021), İmrol et al. (2021). In the study conducted by Susar-Kırmızı and Akkaya (2009), teachers have stated that they do not have enough knowledge about methods and approaches and that they have lack of knowledge about the use of materials regarding the problems experienced in the Turkish curriculum. In the study conducted by Özdemir and Akkaya (2020), when the 2019 Turkish curriculum is examined in the context of planning and writing strategies, it is identified that there is no mention of planning in writing education and there is no objective for planning strategies. In the study conducted by Barası and Erdamar (2021), it is determined that teachers experience problems such as lack of physical infrastructure and time, lack of materials, and repetitive, boring and simple activities in the learning-teaching processes of the 2018 Turkish lesson curriculum. In the study conducted by Arcagök (2021), it is concluded that the sixth grade Turkish lesson curriculum is not prepared by taking into account the practices in different learning theories and models. In the study conducted by Karacaoğlu et al. (2021), it is suggested that writing activities in Turkish textbooks should be planned process-oriented and this process should be carried out effectively under the guidance of the teacher. In the study conducted by İmrol et al. (2021), it is shown that the use of various methods and techniques in the teaching and learning process of the 2018 Turkish curriculum is not at a sufficient level. It is determined that teachers generally use question and answer and narration methods and the development of four basic language skills is not supported in every lesson.

In the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field, the students have emphasized that "the suggested learning experiences" should include activities such as questions about the text, explaining the text with pictures, finding the topic and main idea of the text, teaching the meaning of words, creating a three-dimensional design for the text, finding a title for the text, summarizing, dramatizing the text, designing a poster with Web 2 tools, completing the unfinished text, rewriting the text in a different text type, spelling and punctuation. Within the scope of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills

"suggested time", while the majority of the students have stated that more than 30 minutes should be given to writing skills activities, some of the students have stated that less than 30 minutes should be given. Therefore, giving less than 30 minutes for writing activities is insufficient. It is suggested that the time to be given to students for writing activities should be more than 30 minutes. Within the scope of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills "suggested material", it is concluded that visual materials, written materials, visual and audio materials, three-dimensional materials, and stationery materials should be used in writing activities. These results of the study are similar to the results of the studies conducted by Barası and Erdamar (2021), Karacaoğlu et al. (2021), Kaplan and Demir (2023). In the study conducted by Barası and Erdamar (2021), teachers have suggested that the activities in the learning and teaching processes of the Turkish curriculum should be associated with daily life, planned and implemented in an interesting way. They have proposed that the physical conditions of the schools should be improved and activities such as drama, discussion, interpretation, and creative writing should be included more in the lessons. In the study conducted by Karacaoğlu et al. (2021), it is shown that written expression materials should be prepared for the "selective writing skills lesson". In the study conducted by Kaplan and Demir (2023), it is identified that the curriculum should be revised in terms of the methods and techniques used in the 2019 Turkish lesson curriculum.

Conclusions Related to the Evaluation Element of the Curriculum

When the curriculum is considered in terms of the "evaluation" element, it is determined that peer assessment is mostly used in the evaluation of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills activities, as well as self-assessment, multiple-choice, and verbal exams. It is determined that both traditional and alternative assessment methods are used in the measurement and assessment processes related to writing skills. It is concluded that students generally present their products after writing activities and writing activities are evaluated in terms of topic and content; spelling rules and punctuation; language and expression; and form. These results of the research are similar to the results of the studies conducted by Engin and Arslan (2019), Özdemir and Akkaya (2020), Barası and Erdamar (2021). In the study conducted by Engin and Arslan (2019), it is identified that teachers use techniques such as multiple-choice tests, matching tests, open-ended questions, homework, performance assessment, essay writing, end of the theme assessment, verbal exams, peer assessment and self-assessment. It is found that the most preferred measurement and assessment techniques are written exams, multiple-choice tests, matching tests, open-ended

questions and giving homework. In the study conducted by Özdemir and Akkaya (2020), it is stated that within the scope of the 2019 Turkish lesson curriculum, it is aimed to enable students to share their written products in different environments. In the study conducted by Barası and Erdamar (2021), while some of the teachers have stated that measurement and assessment processes should be centralized and objective, some of the teachers have stated that process oriented evaluations should be made more.

In the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field, the students have emphasized that "the suggested evaluation" should be made with open-ended questions, matching, true-false, self-assessment and peer assessment. This result of the research has emphasized that various methods should be used during assessment. While evaluating writing activities, it is concluded that attention should be paid to punctuation and spelling rules, the way the topic and main idea are given, the beauty of writing, the correct use of words and sentences, the harmony of the text sections with each other, the harmony of the title with the topic, and the spelling of the suffixes. These results of the study are similar to the results of the studies conducted by İmrol et al. (2021), Karacaoğlu et al. (2021), Şimşek (2022), Dilekçi (2022). In the study conducted by İmrol et al. (2021), it is determined that teachers mostly use practices and assessments to measure cognitive skills during assessment. It is emphasized that measurement and assessment methods should be diversified and assessments specific to the four language skills should be made. In the study conducted by Karacaoğlu et al. (2021), it is concluded that evaluation forms, peer assessment and self- assessment forms related to the evaluation of writing skills should be included in every theme in Turkish textbooks. In the study conducted by Şimşek (2022), it is identified that although process oriented evaluation is mentioned in the Turkish curriculum writing skills, written exams are also conducted in line with the objectives. While in the 2018 Writership and Writing Skills curriculum, it is stated that process oriented evaluation is important, in the 2019 Turkish curriculum, measurement and assessment diversity is mentioned. In the study conducted by Dilekçi (2022), teachers have stated that Turkish textbooks should include more and various assessment tools to measure the objectives. In addition, teachers have emphasized that there should be tools that measure skill-based and higher-order skills in the textbooks.

Conclusions Related to the Positive and Negative Aspects of the Curriculum

"The strengths" of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field are determined to be that the curriculum allows writing different types of texts, the topics are interesting, it allows text analysis, provides the opportunity to enrich the texts with visuals,

teaches new words, and develops imagination. "The weaknesses" of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field are determined to be that the writing activities are insufficient, some of the activities are not interesting, there is not enough information about the activities, dictation activities are not liked, different writing methods are not used, there are spelling and punctuation errors, unknown or incomprehensible topics are included, the spaces allocated for writing are insufficient, the writing activities are not related to the unit, there are repetitive explanations, and the evaluation is insufficient. These results of the research are similar to the results of the studies conducted by Mutlu et al. (2019), Oryaşın (2020), Arcagök (2021), Barası and Erdamar (2021), Karacaoğlu et al. (2021), Sulak and Çapanoğlu (2021), Dilekçi (2022). In the study conducted by Mutlu et al. (2019), teachers have stated that secondary school Turkish textbooks are generally not sufficient in terms of measurement and assessment, the questions are insufficient and the evaluation is incompatible with the exam system. In the study conducted by Oryaşın (2020), it is determined that the writing skills activities in the textbooks between the first and eighth grades of the 2019 Turkish curriculum are insufficient to develop students' writing skills. In addition, activities related to the grammar topic field do not attract the attention of the majority of students. The majority of the students have stated that they do not want to answer the questions about the texts and the activities do not reflect daily life. It is concluded that the activities are not suitable for the student level in general. In the study conducted by Arcagök (2021), it is determined that the sixth grade Turkish lesson curriculum cannot meet the interests, wishes, and needs of the students. In the study conducted by Barası and Erdamar (2021), it is determined that teachers experience problems such as the content and length of the texts not being suitable for the age groups of the students, they are not interesting and the text types are not selected from good and quality examples. In addition, teachers have stated that students experience a lack of interest and motivation. In the study conducted by Karacaoğlu et al. (2021), it is suggested that the pages/sections allocated for writing activities should be appropriate for the grade levels of the students and should be long enough to be positively received by the students. In the study conducted by Sulak and Çapanoğlu (2021), teachers have stated that the activities in primary school Turkish textbooks are not sufficient and there should be additional activities. In the study conducted by Dilekçi (2022), it is determined that teachers find the texts in Turkish textbooks long, boring in terms of content, insufficient, and simple. In addition, teachers have stated that the activities in Turkish textbooks are not interesting, and repetitive.

The results of the research can be summarized as follows:

Within the scope of the 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field, although students show improvement in terms of cognitive and psychomotor skills, they experience writing anxiety in terms of affective skills. It is determined that the writing topics in the curriculum are relatively appropriate for the student level. It is also found that the writing activities and the time allocated for writing in the lessons are insufficient. In this respect, it is concluded that practices that are suitable for the developmental level of students and that develop their thinking and writing skills more should be included. It is identified that the tools, methods and techniques used in writing activities are insufficient in terms of diversity. Accordingly, it is concluded that the communication process in the classroom should be more effective during writing activities. Although traditional and alternative assessment methods are used in the measurement and evaluation processes related to writing skills, it is determined that an effective evaluation is not fully carried out.

Within the scope of the results obtained in the research, suggestions can be summarized as follows:

Within the scope of writing skills, objectives to improve students' writing, thinking, research, and communication skills can be added to the curriculum. Curriculum development studies can be carried out to reduce students' writing anxiety and to develop positive attitudes towards writing. Text types, topics and activities included in the curriculum regarding writing skills can be prepared in accordance with students' interests, needs, and developmental levels. An effective communication process can be created in the classroom environment during the activities related to writing skills. Various methods and techniques can be used in activities related to writing skills. Visual and three-dimensional materials suitable for students' interests and needs can be included in the application process for writing skills activities. The time allocated for writing activities can be increased to improve students' writing skills. To improve the quality of writing skills activities, evaluation studies can be done more effectively. By using the evaluation method in this research, the 2019 Turkish curriculum at the fourth grade level can be evaluated as a whole in terms of listening, reading, speaking, and writing learning fields. The 2019 Turkish curriculum fourth grade writing skills learning field can be evaluated by taking opinions from teachers.

Compliance with Ethical Standards

Disclosure of potential conflicts of interest

No conflict of interest.

Research involving Human Participants

Acknowledgements

Üstün Zekâlı ve Yetenekli Öğrenciler Açısından Yazma Becerileri Öğrenme Alanının Stake'in İhtiyaca Cevap Verici Değerlendirme Modeline Göre Değerlendirilmesi

Özet:

Bu araştırmanın amacı, üstün zekâlı ve yetenekli öğrenciler açısından 2019 Türkçe dersi öğretim programı yazma becerileri öğrenme alanının değerlendirilmesidir. Araştırmada durum çalışması desenlerinden biri olan bütüncül tek durum deseni kullanılmıştır. Araştırmada amaçlı örnekleme yöntemleri arasında bulunan "ölçüt örnekleme" ve "kolay ulaşılabilir durum örneklemesinden" yararlanılarak çalışma gurubu belirlenmiştir. Araştırmanın örneklemini Ankara ilinin Sincan ilçesindeki dördüncü sınıf düzeyindeki üstün zekâlı ve yetenekli öğrenciler oluşturmaktadır. Araştırma kapsamında gönüllü 21 öğrenci ile görüşme yapılmıştır. Veri toplama aracı olarak araştırmacı tarafından geliştirilen yarı yapılandırılmış görüşme formu kullanılmıştır. Veriler, 2022 yılının Nisan ve Mayıs aylarında toplanmıştır. Verilerin analizinde içerik analizi kullanılmıştır. Araştırmanın güvenirliğinin 0.83 olduğu belirlenmiştir. Araştırma kapsamında öğrencilerin yazma kaygısı yaşadığı, konuların nispeten öğrenci düzeyine uygun olduğu, yöntem ve tekniklerin çeşitliliğinin ve sürenin yetersiz olduğu, değerlendirme sürecinde hem geleneksel hem de alternatif değerlendirme yöntemlerinin kullanıldığı belirlenmiştir.

Anahtar kelimeler: Türkçe dersi öğretim programı, yazma becerisi, Stake'in ihtiyaca cevap verici değerlendirme modeli, üstün zekâlı ve yetenekli öğrenci.

References

Arcagök, S. (2021). An evaluation of the 2019 Turkish course curricula 6th grade learning outcomes. *Journal of Mother Tongue Education, 9*(2), 589-602. https://doi.org/10.16916/aded.878033

Ateş, A., & Akaydın, Ş. (2015). An investigation of secondary school students′ writing anxiety: (Malatya province sample). *Journal of Language and Literature Education*, *16,* 24-38.

Aygören, F., & Er, K. O. (2018). *Eğitimde program değerlendirme: Sınıflamalar- modeller [Program evaluation in education: Classifications-models].* Pegem Akademi.

Barası, M., & Erdamar, G. (2021). Analysis of 2018 secondary school Turkish course program in terms of 21st century skills: Teachers opinions. *Bolu Abant Izzet Baysal University Journal of Faculty of Education, 21*(1), 222-242. https://dx.doi.org/10.17240/aibuefd.2021.21.60703-851474

Bozgün, K. (2022). A study on writing anxiety of primary school fourth grade students. *Journal of Primary Education, 16*, 6-15. https://doi.org/10.52105/temelegitim.16.1

Çevik, A. (2021). Yazma eğitimi [Writing education]. F. Temizyürek & T. Türkben (Eds.), *Türkçe öğretimine genel bir bakış, el kitabı [An overview of Turkish teaching, handbook]* (pp. 253-300). Pegem Akademi.

Demirel, Ö. (2015). *Eğitimde program geliştirme: Kuramdan uygulamaya [Program development in education: From theory to practice]* (22nd ed.). Pegem Akademi.

Dilekçi, A. (2022). Evaluation of Turkish textbooks in terms of quality. *Trakya Journal of Education, 12*(3), 1310-1328. https://doi.org/10.24315/tred.978264

Direkçi, B., Akbulut, S., & Şimşek, B. (2019). The analysis of Turkish course curriculum (2018) and secondary school Turkish textbooks in terms of digital literacy skills. *International Journal of Euroasian Researches, 7*(16), 797-813. https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/678093

Engin, A. O., & Arslan, A. (2019). The evaluation of 5th class Turkish course program according to teachers' point of views (Gaziantep province sampling). *Journal of Interdisciplinary Educational Research, 3*(5), 19-39. https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/778253

Eripek, S. (2005). Özel gereksinimi olan çocuklar ve özel eğitim [Children with special needs and special education]. S. Eripek (Ed.), *Açık öğretim fakültesi okulöncesi öğretmenliği*

lisans programı: Özel eğitim [Open education faculty preschool teaching undergraduate program: Special education] (4th ed., pp.1-14). Anadolu University.

Fitzpatrick, J. L., Sanders, J. R., & Worthen, B. R. (2019). *Program değerlendirme: Alternatif yaklaşımlar ve uygulama rehberi [Program evaluation: Alternative approaches and practical guidelines]* (M. K. Aydın & B. Bavlı, Trans. Eds.). Pegem Akademi.

Güneş, F. (2021). *Türkçe öğretimi. Yaklaşımlar ve modeller [Teaching Turkish. Approaches and models]* (10th ed.). Pegem Akademi.

İmrol, M. H., Dinçer, A., Güldenoğlu, B. N. D., & Babadoğan, M. C. (2021). Evaluation of the 2018 Turkish curriculum. *Education and Science, 46*(207), 403-437. https://dx.doi.org/10.15390/EB.2021.9625

Kaldırım, A., & Tavşanlı, Ö. F. (2021). Süreç temelli yazma yaklaşımı [Process-based writing approach]. E. Kolaç & S. Dal (Eds.), *Etkinliklerle Türkçe öğretimi [Turkish teaching with activities]* (2nd ed., pp. 355-428). Nobel.

Kaplan, K., & Demir, M. (2023). Evaluation of the Turkish curriculum (2019) according to context-input-process-product (CIPP) model. *Trakya Journal of Education, 13*(1), 770-785. https://doi.org/10.24315/tred.1125160

Kaplan, S. N. (1986). The grid: A model to construct differentiated curriculum for the gifted. J. S. Renzulli (Ed.), *Systems and models for developing programs for the gifted and talented* (pp. 180-193). Creative Learning Press.

Karacaoğlu, M. Ö., Dağ, M., & Uzun, O. (2021). Examination of writing activities in Turkish textbooks. *IBAD Journal of Social Sciences, (10),* 96-126. https://doi.org/10.21733/ibad.852233

Karadağ-Yılmaz, R., & Erdoğan, Ö. (2020). Yazma, yaratıcı yazma eğitimi [Writing, creative writing education]. H. Akyol & A. Şahin (Eds.), *Türkçe öğretimi. Öğretmen adayları ve öğretmenler için [Teaching Turkish. For candidate teachers and teachers]* (2nd ed., pp. 55-79). Pegem Akademi.

Karatay, H. (2013). Süreç temelli yazma modelleri: 4+1 planlı yazma ve değerlendirme modeli [Process-based writing models: 4+1 planned writing and assessment model]. M. Özbay (Ed.), *Yazma Eğitimi [Writing Education]* (3rd ed., pp. 21-42). Pegem Akademi.

Kırmızı, F. S., & Akkaya, N. (2009). Opinions of teachers about the problems in the implementation of new Turkish teaching program. *Pamukkale University Journal of Education, 25*(25), 42-54. https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/114677

Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis: An expanded sourcebook* (2nd ed.). Sage.

Mutlu, H. H., Süğümlü, Ü., & Çinpolat, E. (2019). Assessment of secondary school textbooks prepared on the basis of Turkish curriculum (2018) with teacher's opinions. *Journal of National Education*, *48*(224), 101-121. https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/858260

Oryaşın, U. (2020). *Examination of activities in Turkish textbooks with a holistic understanding* [Unpublished doctoral dissertation]. Ankara University.

Özdemir, E. E., & Akkaya, N. (2020). Evaluation of elementary school Turkish lesson curriculum in the context of the field of learning writing and determination of the place of planning and writing strategies in the curriculum. *Turkish Studies-Educational Sciences, 15*(3), 2285-2301. https://dx.doi.org/10.29228/TurkishStudies.42864

Özdemir, S. M. (2009). Curriculum evaluation in education and examination of the curriculum evaluation studies in Turkey. *Van Yüzüncü Yıl University Journal of Education, 6*(2), 126-149. https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/146317

Öznacar, M. D., & Bildiren, A. (2016). *Üstün zekâlı öğrencilerin eğitimi ve eğitsel bilim etkinlikleri [Education of gifted students and educational science activities]* (2nd ed.). Anı.

Renzulli, J. S. (1988). The multiple menu model for developing differentiated curriculum for the gifted and talented. *Gifted Child Quarterly*, *32*(3), 298-309. https://doi.org/10.1177/001698628803200302

Sak, U. (2012). *Üstün zekâlılar. Özellikleri, tanılanmaları, eğitimleri [Gifted children. Characteristics, identification, education]* (2nd ed.). Maya Akademi.

Sönmez, V., & Alacapınar, F. G. (2015). *Örnekleriyle eğitimde program değerlendirme [Program evaluation in education with examples]*. Anı.

Stake, R. E. (2011). Program evaluation particularly responsive evaluation. *Journal of MultiDisciplinary Evaluation, 7*(15), 180-201. https://journals.sfu.ca/jmde/index.php/jmde_1/article/view/303/298

Subakan, Y., & Koç, M. (2019). Mobile technologies used for the development and education of individuals with special educational needs. *Science, Education, Art and Technology Journal (SEAT Journal), 3*(2), 51-61. https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/586372

Sulak, S. E., & Çapanoğlu, A. Ş. (2021). Evaluation of primary school Turkish textbooks with a holistic approach based on the views of primary school teachers. *Ahi Evran University*

Journal of Social Sciences Institute, 7(3), 830-849.
https://doi.org/10.31592/aeusbed.979263

Şahin, F. (2018). Müfredat modelleri [Curriculum models]. F. Şahin (Ed.), *Özel yetenekli öğrenciler ve eğitimleri [Gifted students and their education]* (pp. 65-104). Anı.

Şimşek, T. (2022). Comparative evaluation of Turkish lesson writing skills within the framework of curriculum. *RumeliDE Journal of Language and Literature Studies, 29*, 19-36. https://doi.org/10.29000/rumelide.1163998

Tabak, G., & Göçer, A (2013). Evaluating the writing skill of sixth and eighth grade Turkish language teaching curriculum in terms of product and process approaches. *Ahi Evran University Journal of Kırşehir Education Faculty, 14*(2), 147-169. https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/1490580

Tomlinson, C. A. (2007). *Öğrenci gereksinimlerine göre farklılaştırılmış eğitim [The differentiated classroom: Responding to the needs of all learners]* (Diye kültürlerarası iletişim hizmetleri, Trans.). Sev.

Tortop, H. S. (2015). *Üstün zekâlılar eğitiminde farklılaştırılmış öğretim: Müfredat farklılaştırma modelleri [Differentiated instruction in gifted education: Curriculum differentiation models].* Genç Bilge.

Uşun, S. (2016). *Eğitimde program değerlendirme: Süreçler-yaklaşımlar ve modeller [Program evaluation in education: Processes-approaches and models]* (2nd ed.). Anı.

Yıldırım, A., & Şimşek, H. (2013). *Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri [Qualitative research methods in social sciences]* (9th ed.). Seçkin.

Yıldız, M., & Ceyhan, S. (2016). The investigation of 4th grade primary school students' reading and writing anxieties in terms of various variables. *Turkish Studies, 11*(2), 1301-1316. https://dx.doi.org/10.7827/TurkishStudies.9370

Yılmaz, N. (2019). *The writing anxiety levels of the secondary school students and the determination of the reasons (Elazığ)* [Unpublished master's thesis]. Inonu University.

Yin, R. K. (2009). *Case study research: Design and methods* (4th ed.). Sage.