

## PAPER DETAILS

TITLE: Prevalence of *Listeria* spp and *L. monocytogenes* in Home made Pottery Cheese

AUTHORS: Binnur KAPTAN

PAGES: 76-87

ORIGINAL PDF URL: <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article-file/178638>



***Namık Kemal Üniversitesi***  
***Tekirdağ Ziraat Fakültesi Dergisi***  
***Journal of Tekirdag Agricultural Faculty***

*An International Journal of all Subjects of Agriculture*

**Sahibi / Owner**

**Namık Kemal Üniversitesi Ziraat Fakültesi Adına**  
On Behalf of Namık Kemal University Agricultural Faculty

**Prof.Dr. Ahmet İSTANBULLUOĞLU**  
Dekan / Dean

**Editörler Kurulu / Editorial Board**

**Başkan / Editor in Chief**

**Prof.Dr. Türkan AKTAŞ**  
Ziraat Fakültesi Biyosistem Mühendisliği Bölümü  
Department Biosystem Engineering, Agricultural Faculty  
taktas@nku.edu.tr

**Üyeler / Members**

<b>Prof.Dr. M. İhsan SOYSAL</b>	Zootekni / Animal Science
<b>Prof.Dr. Servet VARIŞ</b>	Bahçe Bitkileri / Horticulture
<b>Prof.Dr. Temel GENÇTAN</b>	Tarla Bitkileri / Field Crops
<b>Prof.Dr. Sezen ARAT</b>	Tarımsal Biyoteknoloji / Agricultural Biotechnology
<b>Prof.Dr. Aydın ADİLOĞLU</b>	Toprak Bilimi ve Bitki Besleme / Soil Science and Plant Nutrition
<b>Prof.Dr. Fatih KONUKCU</b>	Biyosistem Mühendisliği / Biosystem Engineering
<b>Doç.Dr. İlker H. ÇELEN</b>	Biyosistem Mühendisliği / Biosystem Engineering
<b>Doç.Dr. Ömer AZABAĞAOĞLU</b>	Tarım Ekonomisi / Agricultural Economics
<b>Doç.Dr. Ümit GEÇGEL</b>	Gıda Mühendisliği / Food Engineering
<b>Yrd.Doç.Dr. Harun HURMA</b>	Tarım Ekonomisi / Agricultural Economics
<b>Yrd.Doç.Dr. Özgür SAĞLAM</b>	Bitki Koruma / Plant Protection
<b>Araş.Gör. Eray ÖNLER</b>	Biyosistem Mühendisliği / Biosystem Engineering

**İndeksler / Indexing and abstracting**



CABI tarafından full-text olarak indekslenmektedir/ Included in CABI



DOAJ tarafından full-text olarak indekslenmektedir / Included in DOAJ



EBSCO tarafından full-text olarak indekslenmektedir / Included in EBSCO



FAO AGRIS Veri Tabanında İndekslenmektedir / Indexed by FAO AGRIS Database



INDEX COPERNICUS tarafından full-text olarak indekslenmektedir / Included in INDEX COPERNICUS



TUBİTAK-ULAKBİM Tarım, Veteriner ve Biyoloji Bilimleri Veri Tabanı (TVBBVT) Tarafından taranmaktadır / Indexed by TUBİTAK-ULAKBİM Agriculture, Veterinary and Biological Sciences Database

**Yazışma Adresi / Corresponding Address**

Tekirdağ Ziraat Fakültesi Dergisi NKÜ Ziraat Fakültesi 59030 TEKİRDAĞ

E-mail: ziraatdergi@nku.edu.tr  
Web adresi: http://jotaf.nku.edu.tr  
Tel: +90 282 250 20 00

ISSN: 1302-7050

## **Danışmanlar Kurulu / Advisory Board**

### **Bahçe Bitkileri / Horticulture**

Prof. Dr. Ayşe GÜL	Ege Üniv., Ziraat Fak., İzmir
Prof. Dr. İsmail GÜVENÇ	Kilis 7 Aralık Üniv., Ziraat Fak., Kilis
Prof. Dr. Zeki KARA	Selçuk Üniv., Ziraat Fak., Konya
Prof. Dr. Jim HANCOCK	Michigan State University, USA

### **Bitki Koruma / Plant Protection**

Prof. Dr. Cem ÖZKAN	Ankara Üniv., Ziraat Fak., Ankara
Prof. Dr. Yeşim AYSAN	Çukurova Üniv., Ziraat Fak., Adana
Prof. Dr. Ivanka LECHAVA	Agricultural University, Plovdiv-Bulgaria
Dr. Emil POCSAI	Plant Protection Soil Conser. Service, Velenca-Hungary

### **Biyosistem Mühendisliği / Biosystem Engineering**

Prof. Bryan M. JENKINS	U.C. Davis, USA
Prof. Hristo I. BELOEV	University of Ruse, Bulgaria
Prof. Dr. Simon BLACKMORE	The Royal Vet.&Agr. Univ. Denmark
Prof. Dr. Hamdi BİLGİN	Ege Üniv. Ziraat Fak. İzmir
Prof. Dr. Ali İhsan ACAR	Ankara Üniv. Ziraat Fak. Ankara
Prof. Dr. Ömer ANAPALI	Atatürk Üniv., Ziraat Fak. Erzurum
Prof. Dr. Christos BABAJIMOPOULOS	Aristotle Univ. Greece
Dr. Arie NADLER	Ministry Agr. ARO, Israel

### **Gıda Mühendisliği / Food Engineering**

Prof. Dr. Evgenia BEZIRTOGLOU	Democritus University of Thrace/Greece
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Nermina SPAHO	University of Sarajevo/Bosnia and Herzegovina
Prof. Dr. Kadir HALKMAN	Ankara Üniv., Mühendislik Fak., Ankara
Prof. Dr. Atilla YETİŞEMİYEN	Ankara Üniv., Ziraat Fak., Ankara

### **Tarımsal Biyoteknoloji / Agricultural Biotechnology**

Prof. Dr. İskender TIRYAKI	Çanakkale Üniv., Ziraat Fak., Çanakkale
Prof. Dr. Khalid Mahmood KHAWAR	Ankara Üniv., Ziraat Fak., Ankara
Prof. Dr. Mehmet KURAN	Ondokuz Mayıs Üniv., Ziraat Fak., Samsun
Doç. Dr. Tuğrul GİRAY	University of Puerto Rico, USA
Doç. Dr. Kemal KARABAĞ	Akdeniz Üniv., Ziraat Fak., Antalya
Doç. Dr. İsmail AKYOL	Kahramanmaraş Sütçü İmam Üniv., Ziraat Fak., Kahramanmaraş

### **Tarla Bitkileri / Field Crops**

Prof. Dr. Esvet AÇIKGÖZ	Uludağ Üniv., Ziraat Fak., Bursa
Prof. Dr. Özer KOLSARICI	Ankara Üniv., Ziraat Fak., Adana
Dr. Nurettin TAHSİN	Agriculture University, Plovdiv-Bulgaria
Prof. Dr. Murat ÖZGEN	Ankara Üniv., Ziraat Fak., Ankara
Doç. Dr. Christina YANCHEVA	Agriculture University, Plovdiv-Bulgaria

### **Tarım Ekonomisi / Agricultural Economics**

Prof. Dr. Faruk EMEKSİZ	Çukurova Üniv., Ziraat Fak., Adana
Prof. Dr. Hasan VURAL	Uludağ Üniv., Ziraat Fak., Bursa
Prof. Dr. Gamze SANER	Ege Üniv., Ziraat Fak., İzmir
Prof. Dr. Alberto POMPO	El Colegio de la Frontera Norte, Meksika
Prof. Dr. Şule IŞIN	Ege Üniv., Ziraat Fak., İzmir

### **Toprak Bilimi ve Bitki Besleme Bölümü / Soil Sciences And Plant Nutrition**

Prof. Dr. M. Rüştü KARAMAN	Yüksek İhtisas Üniv., Ankara
Prof. Dr. Metin TURAN	Yeditepe Üniv., Müh. ve Mimarlık Fak. İstanbul
Prof. Dr. Aydın GÜNEŞ	Ankara Üniv., Ziraat Fak., Ankara
Prof. Dr. Hayriye İBRİKÇİ	Çukurova Üniv., Ziraat Fak., Adana
Doç. Dr. Josef GORRES	The University of Vermont, USA
Doç. Dr. Pasquale STEDUTO	FAO Water Division Italy

### **Zootekni / Animal Science**

Prof. Dr. Andreas GEORGOIDUS	Aristotle Univ., Greece
Prof. Dr. Ignacy MISZTAL	Breeding and Genetics University of Georgia, USA
Prof. Dr. Kristaq KUME	Center for Agricultural Technology Transfer, Albania
Dr. Brian KINGHORN	The Ins. of Genetics and Bioinf. Univ. of New England, Australia
Prof. Dr. Ivan STANKOV	Trakia University, Depart. of Animal Science, Bulgaria
Prof. Dr. Muhlis KOCA	Atatürk Üniv., Ziraat Fak., Erzurum
Prof. Dr. Gürsel DELLAL	Ankara Üniv., Ziraat Fak., Ankara
Prof. Dr. Naci TÜZEMEN	Kastamonu Üniv., Mühendislik Mimarlık Fak., Kastamonu
Prof. Dr. Zlatko JANJEČIĆ	University of Zagreb, Agriculture Faculty, Hırvatistan
Prof. Dr. Horia GROSU	Univ. of Agricultural Sciences and Vet. Medicine Bucharest, Romanya

İÇİNDEKİLER/CONTENTS

<b>F. Kurtulmuş, S. Öztüfekçi, S. Şehirli</b> <b>Armut Meyvesinde Diplocarpon Mespili Lezyonlarının Görüntü İşlemeyle Analizi</b> Analyzing Diplocarpon Mespili Lesions On Pear Using Image Processing .....	1-11
<b>H. M. Velioğlu, G. Çelikyurt</b> <b>Farklı Tarım Artığı Ürünlerden Fungal Ve Bakteriyel A-Amilaz Enzimi Üretiminin Optimizasyonu</b> Optimization Of Fungal And Bacterial A-Amylase Production From Different Agricultural By-Products.....	12-24
<b>G. Çınar, F. Işın, G. Armağan</b> <b>Türkiye'de Tarımsal Ürün İhracatı Yapan Firmaların Risk Tercihi Açısından İncelenmesi</b> Analysis Of The Firms That Exported Agricultural Product In Terms Of Risk Preference In Turkey .....	25-33
<b>B. Firdin</b> <b>Pamuk Yaprak Kurdu Spodoptera Littoralis (Boisduval) (Lepidoptera: Noctuidae) Larvalarının Gelişim Evrelerinde Protein, Glikojen Ve Su Oranındaki Değişim</b> Changes In The Rate Of Protein, Glycogen And Water Of Cotton Leafworm Spodoptera Littoralis (Boisduval) (Lepidoptera: Noctuidae) During The Larval Development Stages .....	34-39
<b>M. İ. Soysal, T. Bilgen, A. Perucatti, L. Iannuzzi</b> <b>GTG Banded Karyotype Of Anatolian River Buffalo (Bubalus Bubalis, 2n=50)</b> Anadolu Mandası (Bubalus bubalis, 2n=50) GTG Bantlı Karyotipi.....	40-43
<b>N. Öner, İ. Başer, F. Öner, Ö. Sarıbaş</b> <b>Buğdayda Yaprak Analiziyle Eksikliği Belirlenen Elementlerin Yapraktan Gübrelemeyle Verim Ve Kalite Üzerine Etkileri</b> Effects On Yield And Quality Of Foliar Application Of Wheat With The Determination Of Deficient Nutrients Leaf Analyses .....	44-51
<b>T. Cengiz</b> <b>Konut Satın Alımında Kentsel Açık-Yeşil Alanlar Ve Sosyal Donatı Elemanlarının İncelenmesi: Çanakkale Kent Merkezi Örneği</b> Influence Of Urban Green Spaces And Social Reinforcement Elements In Home Purchasing: The Case Of Çanakkale City, Turkey.....	52-60
<b>M. Gür, C. Şen</b> <b>Trakya Bölgesinde Doğal Bir Merada Tespit Edilen Baklagiller Ve Buğdaygiller Familyalarına Ait Bitkilerin Bazı Özellikleri</b> Some Properties Of The Vegetation On Grazing, Protected And Abandoned Natural Rangelands .....	61-69
<b>S. Erdoğan Bayram, Ö. L. Elmacı, B. Miran</b> <b>An Evaluation On Strawberry Production In Terms Of Plant Nutrition And Farmer Applications: Evidences From Gediz River Basin, Turkey</b> Bitki Besleme Ve Çiftçi Uygulamaları Açısından Çilek Üretimi Üzerine Bir Değerlendirme: Gediz Havzası Örneği, Türkiye .....	70-79
<b>B. Kaptan</b> <b>Prevalence Of Listeria Spp And L. Monocytogenes İn Home Made Pottery Cheese</b> Ev Yapımı Küp Peynirinde Listeria Spp Ve L. Monocytogenes Yaygınlığı.....	80-87
<b>N. Pouyafard, E. Akkuzu, Ü. Kaya</b> <b>Kıyı Ege Koşullarında Yetiştirilen Ayvalık Zeytin Fidanlarında Su Stresine Bağlı Bazı Fizyolojik Ve Morfolojik Değişimlerin Belirlenmesi</b> Determination Of Some Physiologic And Morphologic Changes Of Young Olive (Cv Ayvalık) Trees Under Different Water Stress İn Coastal Part Of Aegean Region .....	88-98
<b>İ. H. Çelen</b> <b>Hava Emişli Yelpeze Hüzmeli Püskürme Memelerinde Püskürtme Dağılımının İlerleme Hızına Bağlı Olarak Değişimi</b> The Change Of The Spray Distribution On Air Inlet Fan Spray Nozzles Depending On Different Forward Speeds .....	99-106
<b>M. E. Gündoğmuş, T. Uyar</b> <b>Kestane Bahçelerinde Gelir Yöntemine Göre Değerleme: Aydın İli Nazilli İlçesi Örneği</b> Land Valuation Of Chestnut Orchards By Income Capitalization Method: A Case Study İn Nazilli District Of Aydın Province.....	107-117

## Prevalence of *Listeria* spp and *L. monocytogenes* in Home made Pottery Cheese

B. Kaptan

Department of Food Engineering, Agriculture Faculty, Namık Kemal University, 59030, Tekirdağ, Turkey

bkaplan@nku.edu.tr

Presence of *Listeria* spp and *L. monocytogenes* in traditional pottery cheeses produced at eight different provinces in Turkey was investigated. A total of 279 samples were surveyed. Apart from *L. monocytogenes*, *L. ivanovii* and *L. grayi*, *L. innocua* were determined from the cheese samples, while *L. welshimeri* and *L. seeligeri* were not detected in any of the samples. 21.5% of the samples were contaminated with *Listeria* spp.. However %15.77 of samples was positive for *L. monocytogenes*. The incidence of *L. grayi*, *L. innocua* and *L. ivanovii* isolated from samples were 2.15%, 1.43% and 2.15%, respectively. A total of 60 *Listeria* spp. positive samples were analyzed and it was determined that. *L. monocytogenes* was the most prevalent species with 44 (73.3 %) isolates recovered, while 16 (26.6 %) belonged to other *Listeria* spp.

**Key words:** Cheese, *Listeria monocytogenes*, *Listeria* spp, Pottery cheese

### Ev Yapımı Küp Peynirinde *Listeria* spp ve *L. monocytogenes* Yaygınlığı

Türkiye'nin sekiz değişik illerinde toplanan geleneksel Küp peynirinde *Listeria* spp ve *L. monocytogenes* varlığı ve insidansı araştırılmıştır. Toplanan 279 peynir örneğinin *Listeria* spp % 21.5, *L. monocytogenes* %15.77'de, *L. grayi* %2.15, *L. innocua* %1.43 ve *L. ivanovii* % 2.15 oranında kontamine olduğu belirlenmiş, *L. welshimeri* ve *L. seeligeri* ise tespit edilmemiştir. *Listeria* spp. pozitif toplam 60 örnekte en yaygın tür olarak 44 (% 73.3)'ünde *L. monocytogenes* ve 16 (% 26.6)'sında ise diğer *Listeria* spp. belirlenmiştir.

**Anahtar kelimeler:** *Listeria monocytogenes*, *Listeria* spp, Küp peyniri

### Introduction

*Listeria* is a rod shaped, non-spore-forming, Gram positive, facultative anaerobic bacterium (Davis and Mauer, 2011; Wang et al., 2015), environment (raw foods, soil, stream water, silage, sewage and plants) it has wide range of hosts (Swaminathan and Gerner-Smidt, 2007). The genus *Listeria* consists of ten species, namely; *L. monocytogenes*, *L. ivanovii*, *L. seeligeri*, *L. innocua*, *L. welshimeri*, *L. grayi*, *Listeria marthii*, *L. rocourtiae*, *L. fleischmannii* and *L. weihenstephanensis*, (Shantha and Gopal, 2014). Among them, two are pathogenic. *L. monocytogenes* is pathogenic to humans and animals; *L. ivanovii* primarily infects animals and very rarely causes disease in humans. *L. monocytogenes* is considered as one of the most important food-borne bacteria that cause listeriosis in animals and humans (Li et al., 2015). Although the incidences are low, *L. monocytogenes* is one of the most deadly human food-borne pathogens. *L. monocytogenes* is more likely to cause death than any other bacteria that can cause food poisoning. In the case of

outbreaks, a mortality rate of more than 30% has been reported, and that rate could increase in high-risk individuals such as pregnant women, newborns, and the elderly (Elinav et al., 2014; Poulsen and Czuprynski, 2013). Several categories of dairy products have been associated with listeriosis outbreaks including unpasteurized dairy products. Recently, outbreaks of listeriosis associated with the consumption of camembert cheese (of 17 cases, 3 were fatal) and Mexican-style cheese (8 cases, 7 were pregnant Hispanic females) contaminated with *L. monocytogenes* have been reported (Jackson et al., 2011; Johnsen et al., 2010). The behaviour of *L. monocytogenes* in different kinds of cheese during ripening has been widely studied by challenge testing. *L. monocytogenes* mostly grows in soft cheeses and washed smear cheeses (Millet et al., 2006; Rodulf and Scherer, 2001; Schwartzman et al., 2014; Swaminathan and Gerner-Smidt, 2007). Some of the dairy products are well known in the world such as cheese and yogurt despite high diversity in their types. On the other hand, there are other dairy products (conventionally) which are not internationally known and recognized but within a

definite society or region. These conventional products are a primary source of dairy consumption for some people, particularly for those living in rural areas.

Turkey has a wide range of traditional dairy products based on raw or pasteurised milk that have been known and highly appreciated by consumers for centuries. Natural cheeses, regardless of their varying characteristics, can support the growth of microorganisms including food-borne pathogens. Given the continuous increase of natural cheese consumption in regions associated with pottery cheese, there is concern for the microbiological safety of domestically produced natural cheeses (from cows' and sheep milk, or a mixture of the two). Pottery cheese, (It's in English is called as K p cheese in Turkish),, which is matured underground in pots (earthenware materials), is widely produced in the provinces of Central Anatolia and its vicinity.

Pottery cheese is a semi-hard cheese with a crumbly texture, white-cream color and a "quite favorable taste" (personal communication with local producer). This cheese is usually produced from in small farms and private village houses by the farmer women, using raw whole sheep and/or cows' milk, with no added lactic starters. The traditional production method of Pottery cheese begins with fresh raw milk that is coagulated by adding rennin and salt (2 to 3% w/w). The indigenous microflora contained in raw milk increases the acidity of the curd. Afterwards, the curd is cut into small pieces by hand ("pea size", approximately 1 cm<sup>3</sup>) and put into small cotton bags. A weight is then put over the bags to drain the whey (at 20-25°C for 24 h ). The drained curd is kneaded with salt and put into larger cotton bags. Any remaining whey is drained by putting a weight over the cotton bags. Afterwards, the curd is compressed into the pot so that no entrapped air remains. Pottery cheese prepared as such, is then ripened in said pots for at least five months (at 4-6°C) in the caves and subsoil. This specific type of cheese has been in high demand at the local markets, and is greatly appreciated by consumers. Because of their unique tastes, artisan cheeses produced through spontaneous fermentation of unpasteurized milk, receive a great deal of attention from consumers, not only in Turkey but also in other countries around the

world. Although Pottery cheese is a popular cheese type, unfortunately there is no standard production technique for it. Pottery cheese may be consumed while ripening, but it is generally consumed after it has ripened (in its earthenware jug or pot). Since the Pottery cheese is produced from unpasteurized raw milk and during its production there is no heating process, pathogenic bacteria may also grow and survive with this decline, in these cheeses. Even though there is a lot of evidence about the contamination of milk and dairy products by *L. monocytogenes* worldwide, there is no data about the contamination of Pottery cheese. There are a few reports on the microbiological quality of Pottery cheese (Pekel and Korukluoğlu, 2006, 2009). Although *L. monocytogenes* have not been analyzed in these researches. Therefore, the aim of this present study was the detection of *Listeria spp* and *L. monocytogenes* in order to evaluate the possible health and hygiene risks to the consumer, within traditional homemade Pottery cheeses produced from raw cow, sheep or inadequately pasteurized milk.

## Materials and Methods

### Cheese samples

A total of 279 homemade Pottery cheese samples, manufactured from raw milk or inadequately pasteurized milk were taken from village bazaars, located in the provinces of Ankara, Kayseri, K r ehir, Nev ehir, Ni de, Sivas and Yozgat (in Central Anatolia, Turkey) during the period of March 2013 through to February 2014. All samples were placed directly in sterile bags and transported (in refrigeration set at 4°C) to the laboratory within 1-2 h of the time of collection. The microbiological analysis (of samples) was carried out immediately.

### Isolation of *Listeria spp*

*Listeria spp* were isolated in accordance to the standard method recommended by United States' Food and Drug Administration (FDA) (Hitchins and Jinneman, 2011).

For the isolation of *Listeria spp.*, 25 g of each sample was taken aseptically and homogenized in 225 mL *Listeria* Enrichment broth (Oxoid, CM862 + SR141) using a stomacher (IUL Instruments,

Barcelona, Spain) for 1 min and incubated at 30 °C for 48 h. Following that, 100 mL of inocula from the enrichment culture was streaked in duplicate, onto three selected agars, Oxford agar (Oxoid CM856), PALCAM agar (Oxoid CM877) and Brilliance *Listeria* agar (Oxoid CM1080). All selected plates were incubated at 35 °C for 48 h. At least five colonies resembling *Listeria* (black colonies with black sunken centres) from each of three plates were transferred onto Tryptic Soy agar (Oxoid CM131) with Yeast extract (Oxoid L21), and incubated at 37 °C for 24 h. All the colonies were examined microscopically by Gram's staining, catalase activity, oxidase reaction, the presence of hemolysis in blood agar, and motility in SIM medium at 25 °C, and were further identified using the API *Listeria* identification kit (API-*Listeria*, bioMérieux), following the manufacturer's instructions (McLauchlin et al., 1997)

#### Identification of *Listeria* using the API test procedure

The API *Listeria* system (Microbact *Listeria* 12 L identification system, MB1128 A; Oxoid,

Hampshire, UK) consists of the following 12 tests: Hydrolysis of esculin, hemolysis of red blood cells, and acid production from D-arabitol, D-xylose, L-rhamnose, α-methyl-D-glucose, α-methyl-D-mannose, Dribose, glucose-1-phosphate, D-tagatose, trehalose, and mannitol. Bacterial inocula were prepared by emulsifying a single isolated colony from a culture (of 18-24h) in the buffered *Listeria* enrichment broth base (BLEB; Oxoid), then mixed thoroughly to prepare a homogenous suspension.

A reaction strip was removed from packaging and placed in a holding tray and the bacterial suspension (100 µL) was distributed into each well of the strip. The hemolysin reagent (MB 1249 A; Oxoid) for hemolysis testing was warmed to room temperature and a drop of the reagent was added to well number 12. After inoculation, the strip box was closed and incubated at 35±2°C for 24 h. Reaction results were determined according to color change indicators, as per the manufacturer's instructions (Table 1). Identification of different species of *Listeria* was further confirmed using the diagnostic key for *Listeria* in Bergey's Manual of Systematic Bacteriology (Seeliger and Jones, 1986)

Table 1. Identification scheme for species of *Listeria* based on the Microbact *Listeria* identification system (API-*Listeria* system)

Species of <i>Listeria</i>						
Test	<i>L. monocytogene</i>	<i>L. innocua</i>	<i>L. seeligeri</i>	<i>L. ivanovii</i>	<i>L. grayi</i>	<i>L. welshimeri</i>
Esculin hydrolysis	+	+	+	+	+	+
Hemolysis	+	-	-	+	-	-
Acidification of:						
D-Arabitol	+	+	+	+	+	+
α-Methyl-D-glucose	+	+	+	+	-	+
α-Methyl-D-mannose	+	+	-	-	+	+
Trehalose	+	+	+	+	+	+
D-Xylose	-	-	+	+	-	+
L-Rhamnose	+	V1	-	-	-	V1
D-Tagatose	-	-	-	-	-	+
D-Ribose	-	-	-	+	+	-
Mannitol	-	-	-	-	+	-
Glucose-1-phosphate	-	-	-	+	-	-



## Results and Discussion

### Identification of different species of *Listeria*

Identification of *Listeria* isolates was achieved by using an API-*Listeria* identification kit (Oxoid) and was confirmed by using the diagnostic key of Bergey's Manual of Systematic Bacteriology (Seeliger and Jones, 1986). Members of the genus *Listeria* are Gram-positive, motile at 25°C, non-spore forming, rod-shaped bacteria Bacteriology (Seeliger and Jones, 1986). Results of the API-*Listeria* kit are shown in Table 1.

The three biochemical characteristics that were positive for all *Listeria* isolates were; 1) hydrolysis of esculin, 2) acid production from D-arabitol, and

3) acid production from trehalose. The presence of hemolysis and acid production from D-xylose, L-rhamnose, D-ribose, glucose 1-phosphate, D-tagatose, and mannitol were used for individual species identification (Table 1). Identical findings were also reported by using the API commercial system for differentiation amongst species of *Listeria* (McLauchlin et al., 1997). Differential characteristics in different species of *Listeria* isolated in this study were identified on the basis of biochemical and carbohydrate fermentation results. Carbohydrate fermentation tests were also used to confirm results for acidification of carbohydrates in the API *Listeria* system (Table 1). All species of *Listeria* identified herein showed positive results for the catalase, Voges Proskauer (VP), and methyl red (MR) tests, and negative results for all other tests (Table 2).

Table 2. Biochemical description of isolated species of *Listeria*

Species of <i>Listeria</i>				
Test <sup>(1)</sup>	<i>L. monocytogenes</i>	<i>L. grayi</i>	<i>L. innocua</i>	<i>L. ivanovii</i>
Catalase test	+	+	+	+
MR test	+	-	-	+
Nitrate reduction	-	-	-	-
Urea hydrolysis	-	-	-	-
Oxidase test	+	+	+	+
VP test	+	+	+	+
<sup>1)</sup> MR, methyl red; VP, Voges Proskauer test				

Table 3. Prevalence of *Listeria spp* in Pottery cheese obtained from 8 different provinces

Pottery Cheeses								
The number of samples and provinces	n	<i>Listeria spp</i>	<i>L. monocytogenes</i>	<i>L. grayi</i>	<i>L. innocua</i>	<i>L. ivonavii</i>	<i>L. seeligeri</i>	<i>L. welshimeri</i>
Ankara	40	+	+	+	-	+	-	-
Kayseri	52	+	+	-	+	+	-	-
Kırşehir	32	+	+	+	-	-	-	-
Konya	15	+	+	-	+	-	-	-
Nevşehir	38	+	+	+	-	+	-	-
Niğde	25	+	+	-	-	-	-	-
Sivas	35	+	+	+	-	+	-	-
Yozgat	42	+	+	+	+	+	-	-
Total	279	8	8	5	3	5	0	0

### Incidence of *Listeria spp.* in Pottery cheese samples

Prevalence of *L. monocytogenes* and other *Listeria spp.* isolated from obtained Pottery cheeses in the 8 provinces of Turkey. A total of 279 Pottery cheese samples collected over a 8 month period from June of 2013 through to January of 2014, were analyzed for *Listeria spp.*

Results are summarized in Table 3. After isolation of *Listeria* species from cheese samples, the *Listeria* species from the cheeses obtained from locations related to the contaminated cheeses were tested. In the present study *Listeria spp.* was isolated from all cheese sources (100 %). As well as *Listeria*, *L. monocytogenes* was obtained from all the cheese sources investigated, *L. ivanovii* and *L. grayi* from 5 (62.5 %), *L. innocua* from 3 (37.5 %), while *L. welshimeri* and *L. seeligeri* were not detected (Table 3).

A total of 279 samples of homemade Pottery cheese collected from various public bazaars were examined for the presence of *Listeria spp.* in the present work. *Listeria spp.* were isolated from 60 (21.50 %) samples. A total of 60 *Listeria spp.* were isolated and speciated. *L. monocytogenes* was the most prevalent species with 44 (73.3 %) isolates recovered, while 16 (26.6 %) belonged to other *Listeria spp.* The prevalence of *L. monocytogenes* and other *Listeria spp.* from different sampling sites is reported in Table 4. A total of 279 cheese samples were analyzed for the presence of *L. monocytogenes*. *L. monocytogenes* was detected in 44 (15.77%) out of 279 samples. Overall, 16

(5.73%) of the Pottery cheese samples examined were positive for the other *Listeria spp.*; 6 (2.15%) were positive for *L. grayi*; 4 (1.43%) for *L. innocua*; 6 (2.15%) for *L. ivanovii*. In our study conditions, *L. welshimeri* and *L. seeligeri* were not detected in any of the samples (Table 4).

The presence of *L. monocytogenes* in different types of traditional cheeses produced in Turkey, was reported in many previous studies. In a study performed by Arslan and Ozdemir (2008), 142 homemade white cheese samples were analysed and 33.1% and 9.2% were found to be positive for *Listeria spp.* and *L. monocytogenes* respectively.

In other studies, *L. monocytogenes* was isolated 2.5 % of 40 çeçil cheese (Gülmez and Güven, 2001), 3.93 % of 254 herbed cheese (Sağun et al., 2001), 4.8 % of 250 tulum cheese (Colak et al., 2007) and 8% of 50 herbed cheese samples (Erkan et al., 2007), The result of this study and these results show similarity. In a recent study performed by Kum et al.(2011), it was reported that *L. monocytogenes* was detected in 22.7% of homemade pre-cut wedge cheese, 20% of uncured cheese and 14.2% of fibre type cheese. Also, in a study conducted by Güner and Telli (2011) *L. monocytogenes* was determined in

30% of herbed cheese, 46.6% of carra cheese, 23.3% of küflü cheese and 13.3% of tulum cheese. In general, the results of this study agree with those from other surveys, with the exception of herb cheese, its survey found higher incidence of *Listeria spp.*

Table 4. The occurrence percent of *L. monocytogenes* and other *Listeria spp* in Pottery cheese

The number of samples and provinces	Pottery Cheeses							
	<i>Listeria spp</i>		<i>L. monocytogenes</i>		<i>L. grayi</i>		<i>L. innocua</i>	
	n	n (%)	n	(%)	n	(%)	n	(%)
Ankara	40	10 25.0	8	20.0	1	2.5	-	-
Kayseri	52	14 26.9	11	21.2	-	-	1	1.9
Kırşehir	32	6 18.8	5	15.6	1	3.1	-	-
Konya	15	4 26.7	3	20.0	-	-	1	6.7
Nevşehir	38	9 23.7	7	18.4	1	1.6	-	-
Niğde	25	3 12.0	3	12.0	-	-	-	-
Sivas	35	5 14.3	3	8.6	1	2.9	-	-
Yozgat	42	9 21.4	4	9.5	2	4.8	2	4.8
Total	279	60 21.5	44	15.77	6	15	4	1.43

These results disagree with ours. On the other hand, some studies reported that *L. monocytogenes* was not detected in traditional cheeses, tulum cheese (Cetinkaya et al., 1999), skim milk cheese and village type brined cheese (Kum et al., 2011). The findings of the study and the results of studies mentioned above, show that traditional cheeses have a risk for *L. monocytogenes* contamination in Turkey.

In countries other than Turkey, results also indicated that the presence of *L. monocytogenes* in cheeses. The mean prevalence of *L. monocytogenes* in cheese was reported as 2.4% in Italy (Prencipe et al., 2010) and 8% in Greece (Filiouis et al., 2009). *L. monocytogenes* was detected in 12.1 % of 123 traditional cheese samples in Japan (Makino et al., 2005), 5.9% of 351 farmhouse cheese in Ireland (O'Brien et al., 2009) and 15% of 60 traditional cheese in Iran (Rahimi et al., 2010). In a study in Noorabad, Iran, *L. monocytogenes* was detected in 3.3 % and 6.7% of white cheese samples that were collected from two traditional dairy manufacturers (Mahmoodi, 2010). According to research conducted by many authors, cheeses produced from raw milk are more often contaminated with *L. monocytogenes*, compared to cheeses produced from pasteurized milk. In Sweden, *L. monocytogenes* was isolated in 6% of samples, of which 42% were produced from raw milk, and 2% from heat treated milk in samples (333) of soft and semi-soft cheeses collected from retail stores (Loncarevic et al., 1995). Rudolf and Scherer (2001), results concluded that repeated contamination of milk with *L. monocytogenes*, in 8,0% of cheeses, was produced from pasteurized milk. Jacquet et al. (1993), in that period of 1988-1990, 340 analysis samples were collected from dairy plant equipment, dairy production facilities and different types of cheeses, the presence of *L. monocytogenes* was isolated in 44 tested samples of cheese, and from dairy plant equipment/facilities; cheese was contaminated during the ripening process. The incidence of *L. monocytogenes* in soft and semi-soft cheese varied from 0.0 % to 46.00 % in Chile (Cordano and Rocourt, 2001), Iran (Mahmoodi, 2010; Rahimi et al., 2010), Turkey (Arslan and Özdemir, 2008; Colak et al., 2007), Canada (Farber et al., 1987), Norway (Rørvik and Yndestad, 1991), and Portugal (Pintado et al., 2005). A survey of herb cheese showed an incidence rate of 5.1% for *Listeria spp.* out of 254 samples, 1 (0.4%) was found to be positive for both of *L. ivanovii* and *L.*

*innocua* (Sağun et al., 2001). In another study conducted in Isfahan province of Iran, *Listeria spp.* was identified in 18.9% of 90 cheese samples in which *L. innocua* was detected in 8.2% of samples (Rahimi et al., 2010). The incidence of *Listeria spp.* in different types of cheeses has been reported. Silva et al. (1998) examined 103 cheese samples in three different types, including the homemade Minas Frescal cheeses. Of the analyzed samples, 11 (10.7 %) were contaminated with *L. innocua*, 6 (5.8%) with *L. grayi*.

Although these traditional cheeses are currently produced from pasteurized milk in modern dairy plants, it is noted that smaller operators and home chefs are uncontrolled and therefore producing non-hygienic cheeses. According to the microbiological criteria of cheese in Turkish Food Codex, *L. monocytogenes* must not be found (zero tolerance) in cheese samples analyzed (Turkish Food Codex, 2011). Thus in the present study, the high numbers of contaminated samples with *L. monocytogenes* 15.75 % (44/279) and other *Listeria spp.* 5.73% (16/279) could be assessed as noteworthy. *L. monocytogenes* contamination of cheeses may come from two main sources; the milk (or other ingredients used to make cheeses) and the environment during production and post-production. Differences between the results above may be related with the use of raw or pasteurized milk in cheese production, cheese production techniques, and hygienic conditions during the production, storage and sales processes, and some characteristics of cheese such as pH and moisture content. *L. monocytogenes* can be found more frequently in high-moisture cheeses, soft and semi-soft cheeses which have water activity higher than hard cheeses (Arslan and Özdemir, 2008; Rudolf and Scherer, 2001).

## Conclusion

In conclusion, this study demonstrates the presence of some pathogens including *L. monocytogenes*, in retail Pottery cheese. Even though pasteurization of raw milk is effective in the destruction of *Listeria*, there are reports of listeriosis caused by the consumption of pasteurized dairy products. However, this contamination is usually related to post-pasteurization contamination. Traditional dairy products in Turkey are generally non-pasteurized and produced in small scale dairy plants or by home chefs. There is also no reliable data

available on the level of hygienic practices in these small scale dairy plants, they are known to have poor food safety standards. Therefore, these traditional foods are a serious risk to the public's health. Also, the presence of these organisms indicated that there were poor hygienic conditions during the manufacturing, storage and sales process of these traditional cheeses. Manufacturing procedures adhering to the HACCP, use appropriate hygienic measures to avoid (processing and post processing) cross-contamination and of the raw milk quality. All of which are critical for controlling pathogens in this cheese. The levels of contamination found in Pottery cheeses showed that there were inadequate conditions and sanitization measures during production. Control of pathogenic microorganisms during artisanal production of Pottery cheese is a problem. With this type of artisanal cheese ; a safety management system, adequate temperatures during processing, storage, and transportation to the retail markets, production equipment being properly disinfected after contact with cheese, are measures that should be implemented to avoid contamination of cheese.

## References

- Arslan, S., F. Özdemir, 2008. Prevalence and antimicrobial resistance of *Listeria spp.* in homemade white cheese. *Food Control* 19: 360-363
- Cetinkaya, B., H. Ertaş, A. Muz, 1999. Süt ürünlerinde *Listeria* türlerinin izolasyonu. *Fırat Üniversitesi Sağlık Bilimleri Dergisi* 13: 21-25
- Colak, H., H. Hampikyan, E.B. Bingol, B. Ulusoy, 2007. Prevalence of *L. monocytogenes* and *Salmonella spp.* in Tulum cheese. *Food Control* 18: 576-579.
- Cordano, A.M., J.Rocourt, 2001. Occurrence of *Listeria monocytogenes* in food in Chile. *Int J Food Microbiol* 70: 175-178
- Davis, R., L.J. Mauer, 2011. Subtyping of *Listeria monocytogenes* at the haplotype level by Fourier transform infrared (FT-IR) spectroscopy and multivariate statistical analysis. *International Journal of Food Microbiology* 150: 140-149
- Elinav, H., A. Hershko-Klement, L.Valinsky, J. Jaffe, A. Wiseman, H. Shimon, E Braun, Y. Paitan, C. Block, R. Sorek, R. Nir-Paz, 2014. Pregnancy-Associated Listeriosis: Clinical Characteristics and Geospatial Analysis of a 10-Year Period in Israel. *Clinical Infectious Diseases* 59: 953-961
- Erkan, E.M., G. Ciftcioglu, A. Vural, H. Aksu, 2007. Some microbiological characteristics of herbed cheeses. *Journal of Food Quality* 30: 228-236
- Farber, J.M., M.A. Johnston, U. Purvis, A. Loit, 1987. Surveillance of soft and semi-soft cheeses for the presence of *Listeria spp.* *International Journal of Food Microbiology* 5: 157-163
- Filiouis, G., A. Johansson, J. Frey, V. Perreten, 2009. Prevalence, genetic diversity and antimicrobial susceptibility of *Listeria monocytogenes* isolated from open-air food markets in Greece. *Food Control* 20: 314-317.
- Gülmez, M., A. Güven, 2001. Kars ilinde satışa sunulan Çeçil (civil) peynirlerin bazı mikrobiyolojik ve kimyasal özellikleri. *Kafkas Üniversitesi Veteriner Fakültesi Dergisi*, 63-70.
- Güner, A., N. Telli, 2011. A Survey on the Presence of *Listeria monocytogenes* in Various Semi-Hard Cheeses from Different Regions of Turkey. *Journal of Animal and Veterinary Advances* 10: 1890-1894.
- Hitchins, A.D., K. Jinneman, 2011. Detection and enumeration of *Listeria monocytogenes*, chap. 10, *Bacteriological analytical manual (BAM)*. U.S. Food and Drug Administration. AOAC International, Gaithersburg, MD.
- Jackson, K.A., M. Biggerstaff, M. Tobin-D'Angelo, D. Sweat, R. Klos, J. Nosari, O. Garrison, E. Boothe, L. Saathoff-Huber, L. Hainstock, R.P.Fagan, 2011. Multistate Outbreak of *Listeria monocytogenes* Associated with Mexican-Style Cheese Made from Pasteurized Milk among Pregnant, Hispanic Women. *Journal of Food Protection* 74: 949-953
- Jacquet, C., J. Rocourt, A. Reynaud, 1993. Study of *Listeria monocytogenes* contamination in a dairy plant and characterization of the strains isolated. *International Journal of Food Microbiology* 20: 13-22
- Johnsen, B.O., E. Lingaas, D. Torfoss, E.H. Strøm, I. Nordøy, 2010. A large outbreak of *Listeria monocytogenes* infection with short incubation period in a tertiary care hospital. *Journal of Infection* 61: 465-470
- Kum, E., Y. Yıldırım, N. Ertaş, 2011. Detection of *Listeria monocytogenes* in cheese samples retailed in Kayseri by classical cultural technique. *J Fac Vet Med Univ Erciyes* 8: 105-109
- Li, J., P. Du, Z. Li, Y. Zhou, W. Cheng, S. Wu, F. Chen, X. Wang, 2015. Genotypic analyses and virulence characterization of *Listeria monocytogenes* isolates from Crayfish

- (*Procambarus clarkii*). Current Microbiology 70: 704-709
- Loncarevic, S., M.L.Danielsson-Tham, W. Tham, 1995. Occurrence of *Listeria monocytogenes* in soft and semi-soft cheeses in retail outlets in Sweden. International Journal of Food Microbiology 26: 245-250
- Mahmoodi, M. 2010. Occurrence of *Listeria monocytogenes* in raw milk and dairy products in Noorabad, Iran. Journal of Animal and Veterinary Advances 9: 16-19
- Makino, S.I., K. Kawamoto, K. Takeshi, Y. Okada, M. Yamasaki, S. Yamamoto, S. Igimi, 2005. An outbreak of food-borne listeriosis due to cheese in Japan, during 2001. International Journal of Food Microbiology 104: 189-196.
- McLauchlin, J., M.D. Hampton, S. Shah, E.J. Threlfall, A.A. Wieneke, G.D.W. Curtis, 1997. Subtyping of *Listeria monocytogenes* on the basis of plasmid profiles and arsenic and cadmium susceptibility. Journal of Applied Microbiology 83: 381-388
- Millet, L., M. Saubusse, R. Didiene, L. Tessier, M.C. Montel, 2006. Control of *Listeria monocytogenes* in raw-milk cheeses. International Journal of Food Microbiology 108: 105-114
- O'Brien, M., K. Hunt, S. McSweeney, K. Jordan, 2009. Occurrence of foodborne pathogens in Irish farmhouse cheese. Food Microbiology 26: 910-914.
- Pekel, M., M. Korukluoğlu, 2006. Sivas yöresinde üretilen Küp peynirinin üretim yöntemi, mikrobiyolojik ve kimyasal kalitesi. Türkiye 9. Gıda Kongresi; 24-26 Mayıs 2006, Bolu. 24-26 Mayıs, Bolu
- Pekel, M., M. Korukluoğlu, 2009. A study on microbiological, chemical qualities and moulds flora of Küp (Crock) cheese produced in Sivas province. Anadolu J. Agric. Sci. 24: 1-7
- Pintado, C.M.B.S., A. Oliveira, M.E. Pampulha, M.A.S.S. Ferreira, 2005. Prevalence and characterization of *Listeria monocytogenes* isolated from soft cheese. Food Microbiology 22: 79-85
- Poulsen, K.P., C.J. Czuprynski, 2013. Pathogenesis of listeriosis during pregnancy. Animal Health Research Reviews 14: 30-39
- Prencipe, V., G. Migliorati, O. Matteucci, P. Calistri, E. Di Giannatale, 2010. Assessment of hygienic quality of some types of cheese sampled from retail outlets. Vet Ital. 46: 221-231
- Rahimi, E., M. Ameri, H. Momtaz, 2010. Prevalence and antimicrobial resistance of *Listeria* species isolated from milk and dairy products in Iran. Food Control 21: 1448-1452
- Rodulf, M., S. Scherer, 2001. High incidence of *Listeria monocytogenes* in European red smear cheese. Int J Food Microbiol. 63: 91-98
- Rørvik, L.M., M. Yndestad, 1991. *Listeria monocytogenes* in foods in Norway. International Journal of Food Microbiology 13: 97-104
- Sağun, E., Y. Sancak, Ö. İşleyici, K. Ekici, 2001. The presence and prevalence of *Listeria* species in milk and herby cheese in and around Van. Turkish Journal of Veterinary and Animal Science 25: 15-19
- Schvartzman, M.S., U. Gonzalez-Barron, F. Butler, K. Jordan, 2014. Modeling the growth of *Listeria monocytogenes* on the surface of smear- or mold-ripened cheese. Frontiers in Cellular and Infection Microbiology 4: 90
- Seeliger H. P. R., D. Jones, 1986. Genus *Listeria* Pirie 1940, 383AL. in Bergey's manual of systematic bacteriology, eds P. H. A. Sneath, N. S. Mair, M.E. Sharp, J. G. Holt (Williams and Wilkins, Baltimore, Md), 2: 1235-1245
- Shantha, S., S. Gopal, 2014. Prevalence of *Listeria* species in environment and milk samples. Adv. Anim. Vet. Sci 2: 1-4
- Silva, M.C.D., E. Hofer, A. Tibana, 1998. Incidence of *Listeria monocytogenes* in cheese produced in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil. J. Food Prot. 61: 354-356
- Swaminathan, B., P. Gerner-Smidt, 2007. The epidemiology of human listeriosis. Microbes and Infection 9: 1236-1243
- Turkish Food Codex, 2011. Mikrobiyolojik Kriterler Tebliği, Türk Gıda Kodeksi Yönetmeliği, 29.12. 2011 tarihli 28157 sayılı Resmi Gazete, Ankara.
- Wang, J., X. Xie, J. Feng, J.C. Chen, J.C., X.-j. Du, J. Luo, X. Lu, S. Wang, 2015. Rapid detection of *Listeria monocytogenes* in milk using confocal micro-Raman spectroscopy and chemometric analysis. International Journal of Food Microbiology 204: 66-74.